**Editorial Statement**

Dear readers,

*LOGOS: A Journal of Undergraduate Research* is dedicated to the publication of scholarship and artistry by Missouri State University (MSU) undergraduate students, including undergraduate students coauthoring with faculty. It is open to submissions from all undergraduate students at the university and conforms to the highest standards of scholastic integrity in a blind, peer-review process conducted by distinguished faculty and students.

The Missouri State Honors College sponsors *LOGOS* and oversight and governance is provided by a faculty advisory board. The journal is produced by a managing editor, a chief editor, a copy editor, associate editors, and a student review board, all of whom are part of the Honors College.

*LOGOS* encourages submissions from all current or former undergraduate students of MSU who are seeking a professional venue for publication of their undergraduate work. We welcome submissions all year long. Prospective contributors can contact the managing editor with questions about publication standards and the review process at Logos@missouristate.edu.

Sincerely,

The *LOGOS* Editorial Staff
Autumn is normally a time of celebration at our university. We celebrate the start of a new year. We celebrate the beginning of an exciting journey of discovery for our newest students. We celebrate the return of old friends. In the autumn, we look to the future and we are excited about what lies ahead. Yet, this autumn, I find myself looking back. The excitement of the new school year is tempered by a farewell I was not prepared to make.

This past June, Summer K. Holmes, a recent graduate of the Honors College, passed away. Anyone who had the privilege of meeting Summer will never forget the way she filled a room with her warmth, her laughter, and her endless enthusiasm. Her time at Missouri State University made a profound impact upon her. I suspect her impact upon us was equally pronounced. When Summer crossed the stage at Commencement, it never occurred to me that I was saying farewell. I believed that Summer would remain a part of my life, that I would follow her continuing adventures with pride and satisfaction, and that I would get to see her use her many gifts to change the world. When I heard the news that she was gone, it felt as if a part of me had died with her.

For a time, it seemed as if the world had come to a standstill, yet here we are. It is autumn again. This year, the celebration does not come easily. Still, I remember an autumn not so long ago when a truly remarkable young woman marched into my life. I remember the accomplishments that we celebrated together. I remember the excitement that we both felt about the days to come. My memories of Summer are not those of grief or of loss. They are full of pride and of love. So this autumn, I will remember Summer Holmes, and I will celebrate her life.

Scott E. Handley
Assistant Director of the Honors College
The publication of Volume 11 was made possible in part by the generous financial support of the following individuals:

Ms. Elizabeth Armbrecht  
Dr. James S. Baumlin  
Dr. John F. Chuchiak, IV  
Ms. Jordan Gaddie  
Dr. Larry L. George  
Mr. Scott E. Handley  
Ms. Cynthia Johnson  
Ms. Jade Johnson  
Ms. Emily Joshu  
Dr. Erin Kappeler  
Ms. Amy R. Legg  
Ms. Marcia Morriset  
Mr. Derek Seevers  
Mr. Jacob Swett  
Ms. Shannon Wick  
Ms. Emily Wright  
Ms. Christine Young

If you are interested in supporting the publication of LOGOS: A Journal of Undergraduate Research, please visit the Honors College website.
MANAGING EDITOR
Shannon Wick, Technical and Professional Writing

CHIEF EDITOR
Tianna Snyder, English/Literature

COPY EDITOR
Jordan Gaddie, English/Creative Writing and Professional Writing

SOCIAL MARKETING EDITOR
Emily Joshu, English/Creative Writing and Professional Writing

PUBLICATION CONSULTANT
Shaylynn Rackers, Graphic Designer

ASSOCIATE EDITORS
Rowan Bond, Professional Writing
Matthew Freese, Cellular & Molecular Biology
Joshua Henderson, English/Creative Writing
Kaitlin Kilby, Elementary Education
Koby Ljunggren, Chemistry/Biochemistry
Caleb Marshall, Psychology and Mathematics/Applied Math
Maria Meluso, Professional Writing
Kyle Osredker, English/Creative Writing
Hannah Woolsey, Global Studies

PEER REVIEWERS
Aimee Aubuchon  Danna Jenkins  Autumn Pilarski
Sarah Bachler  Belle Johnson  Robbyn Rose
Abigail Blaes  Emily Joshu  Cara Sibert
Rachel Blunk  Kestrel Jurkiewicz-Miles  Robyn Slusher
Hannah Childs  Jupiter Kieschnick  Johnathan Sparks
Sarah Crain  Sabrina Klement  Hannah Stash
Lynsie Daniels  Emily Lewandowski  Madison Steilen
Amanda Drewel  Blake Lucey  Hayden Stricklin
Courtney Fallon  Rachel McGrath  Sara Struemph
Jordan Gaddie  Kat McTernan  Olivia Van Berkum
Katherine Griffiths  Olivia Moerschel  Jessica Weaver
Alexia Harman  Mackenzie Morris  Sydney Weber
Jordan Heiman  Adam Niesen  Karrigan Wulff
Hallee Hinds  Colleen Noland
Sarah Hollstrom  Kate Okland
Faculty Advisory Board

John Chuchiak IV, PhD: Director, Honors College; Professor, Department of History, College of Humanities and Public Affairs
Tracy Dalton, MA: Senior Instructor, Department of English, College of Arts and Letters
Joshua J. Smith, PhD: Associate Professor, Department of Biomedical Sciences, College of Health and Human Services
Rajiv Thakur, PhD: Associate Professor, Department of Geosciences, West Plains Campus

Faculty Reviewers

Mr. Jimmie Allen
Dr. Isabelle Bauman
Dr. James Baumlin
Dr. Fatih Benzer
Dr. W.D. Blackmon
Dr. S. Berlin Brahnam
Dr. LeAnn Brazeal
Mr. Marcus Cafagna
Dr. Matthew Calihman
Dr. Christie Cathey
Dr. John Chuchiak
Dr. Anthony Clark
Mr. Joel Coltharp
Mr. Michael Czyzniejewski
Ms. Carol Daniel
Dr. Tom Dickie
Dr. Elizabeth Dudash-Buskirk
Dr. Melissa Fallone
Dr. Brett Garland
Dr. Janice Greene
Ms. Sharon Harper
Dr. Aida Hass
Dr. Carrisa Hoelscher
Dr. Amy Hulme
Dr. Anne Marie Hunter
Dr. William Meadows

Dr. Erin Kappeler
Dr. Erin Kenny
Dr. Mitzi Kirkland-Ives
Dr. Bogdan Kostic
Dr. Lanya Lamouria
Dr. Ashley Leinweber
Dr. Sarah Mellors
Dr. Tyler Morris
Dr. Yuhua Qiao
Dr. David Romano
Dr. John Schmalzbauer
Dr. Carol Shoptaugh
Dr. Lloyd Smith
Dr. Stephen Stapleton
Ms. Gwen Walstrand
Dr. William Wedenoja
Dr. Erin Wehrman
Mr. Bruce West
Ms. Sarah Williams
Dr. Colette Witkowski
Dr. Kelly Wood
Dr. Shannon Wooden
CONTENTS

COLLEGE OF ARTS AND LETTERS

Nothing Comes to Mind 1
Lindsey Johnson

Three 3
Emily Joshu

Untitled 12
Raven Kohlenberger

Iron Snowflake 17
Maria Rosaria Meluso

Small Black Eyes 31
Kyle Osredker

Pain, Pride, & Renewal: How Langston Hughes Embodied the Harlem Renaissance 40
Noah Standish

The Healing House 51
Macy Stevens

Sweet Dreams 76
Johanna Typaldos

Our Isolation 80
Shelby Walters

Feminist Standpoint Theory and Meghan Trainor’s “Dear Future Husband”: A Rhetorical Criticism 84
Kimberly Woodman
College of Health and Human Services

Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease: Efficacy of Long-Acting Bronchodilators Combined with A Nursing-Based Clinical Approach
Kylee Farnum

Getting “Clued” in: The Usage and Significance of Context Clues
Flora-Jean Forbes and Dr. Erin Buchanan

Can a Sustainable Context Predict Recycling? Sustainable Design Impacts on Pro-Environmental Behaviors and Perceptions
Eva Klein

College of Humanities and Public Affairs

Environment, Governance, and Conflict in Northern Nigeria and Darfur
Patricia Busch

Walking the Path of Cold Mountain
Brendan Diedrich

The Problem of Presence: A Study of Glossolalia and its Implications for Religious Ethnography
John Willis

About the Authors
College of Arts and Letters
Nothing Comes to Mind

Lindsey Johnson

Abstract

The inspiration behind “Nothing Comes to Mind” was based on the concept of “writer’s block,” or in this case, “artist’s block.” As an undergraduate art student, I find myself in the position of having to be creative at times when I do not feel inspired to do so. There are times when I am given an assignment, and I simply cannot think of an idea or concept that would enable me to produce a beautiful or meaningful piece of art. Simply meeting the criteria for an assignment has never been an option for me as an art student; I must create something that I am personally invested in as an artist. This piece was born out of one of those moments of frustration. Recently, I became interested in casting aluminum, a process that involves collecting scrap aluminum, heating it to above 1200°F and pouring the molten metal to produce a new form. Though the class assignment was to create an object based on the projection of light, I saw this as an open-ended opportunity to explore. The half-skull form was first carved from a block of foam to represent the way artists reveal their innermost self within their artwork. A vast hole was then carved into the form as a representation of artist’s block, having nothing left to give, yet still having to produce. The form was placed inside a bucket of sand, and molten aluminum was poured directly onto the foam sculpture; there was no second chance. When the metal cooled and the sculpture emerged, I was left with a beautiful and inspirational representation of my innermost feelings as an artist. As a future art educator, I hope to be able to use the concept behind “Nothing Comes to Mind” as an example for my students to produce art even when they do not feel inspired to do so.
Photograph by Lindsey Johnson.


**THREE**

Emily Joshu


*Abstract*

The rule of thirds is one of my most concrete realities: three surgeries, three months, over three years ago, a three-inch scar. From July to September of 2014, I underwent surgical treatment for a benign epidermoid brain tumor that I later learned I was born with; before I was even born, I was dying. However, after living with this for eighteen years, I had more to worry about than surgery: I was preparing for the 200-mile move to Springfield for my freshman year of college. This creative nonfiction piece is a reflection on my healing process as I prepared to move away from my home, my hospital, and my sense of security. In addition, it explores the coping mechanisms of my mother, whose guilt that she may have done something to cause my illness consumed her for years. The disjointed timeline and present-tense narrative are meant to represent how unstructured and fuzzy my memories are and how quickly everything seemed to occur. Nature heals and it harms, and I have the scar to prove it.

The breeze seeps through the bloody gauze that hangs off my left ear. It sends a chill throughout my nerves as fire ignites underneath the balloons in the distance. Miles ahead, beyond the metal gate in which my fingers intertwine themselves, flashes of orange light splatter the night sky. In Forest Park, just across the Washington University medical district, dozens of hot air balloons tower over hordes of spectators, ready to illuminate the September night. Attempting to crane my neck forward from my wheelchair, the scar twitches as a nurse helps a young girl connected to more wires than can fit on her tiny body get a view of the action. She cannot speak, but when she sees the colors flicker on one by one, she gurgles with delight. Another girl, no more than eleven years old with a patch on her right eye, shuffles forward in her rubber socks and boxy gown, placing her hand on the gate. A smile comes across my face.

Behind me, my father squeezes my shoulder. From the eighth floor of St. Louis Children’s Hospital, we prepare for a show.

“We’ll do an MRI for precautionary reasons. I doubt we’ll find anything.” Famous last words from the pediatric neurologist. Still, I nod, kicking my legs
against the wooden stand of the examination table. A month before my high school graduation, I drown him out, positive that I have some vague headache disorder and nothing more. Because once it starts with a headache, doesn’t it all end with a headache?

I slip my jacket off as Dad and I later walk out of the office, weaving through the parking garage to find his SUV. If open pill bottles had a smell, that would be the aroma of the parking garage. That, plus the suffocating heaviness of the overall phrase, “I have bad news,” was enough to make me let out a breath the second we got back into sunlight. Just outside the city limits, the fresh crisp air of May is enough to make me forget where I just spent the last hour, trying to convince myself that nothing is wrong with me.

The hospital’s indoor garden shares a floor with oncology and hematology, hidden at the end of the hall by a designated “sibling hangout area.” The wheels of the wheelchair creak as they run across the cobblestone pathway, illuminated by paper lanterns hidden behind wooden benches that line the entrance. A cool, September breeze pervades my pajamas and bathrobe as Dad wheels me past groups of children with feeding tubes sticking out of their noses, masks over their mouths, and speech devices connected to their medication monitors.

In an instant, dozens of balloons are illuminated in the autumn darkness with pops of magenta, orange, crimson, and yellow. Through the metal gate that closes off the garden, I stare out at an array of vibrancy that can only be seen from the eighth floor of the hospital. On both sides of me, children shriek, jumping up and down as the balloons flicker from afar. His hands on my shoulders, I hear the smile in Dad’s voice as he utters, “Wow.”

Touching two fingers to the gauze that covers my head and the bloody fluid that drains from the wound, I don’t think about college three and a half hours away. I don’t think about the essay that was due yesterday, or the test that’s next week. I certainly don’t think about where I am. Looking at the panorama of children that have spent more days in the hospital than I have in college, I turn back to the balloons and thank a deity I don’t believe in for going easy on me.

July, 4:15 a.m. I’m almost positive that I’ve been trapped in some sort of lucid fog. Wrapping myself in a blanket cocoon and muttering obscenities at the alarm clock, the early morning July chill that has crept up the stairs overnight
reminds me that I am in fact awake—barely. My face buried in a lumpy pillow that feels like a dream, I reach for a cup of water on the nightstand. But there is no glass of water, just eyeglasses that I knock to the ground.

_Oh yeah, no food or water after midnight._

Faintly, I can hear my parents packing up the essentials and I suck in a deep breath. I roll out of bed, clumsily slipping on glasses that are pervaded by the moonlight seeping through my bedroom window. Avengers blanket over my shoulders and raggedy stuffed dog clutched in hand, I stumble to meet my mom, who insists that I get up. Now.

The breezy, mid-summer morning smells like coffee, sunrise, and dew-covered grass. In the back seat of Dad’s SUV, head against the cracked window, the ride on the isolated highway keeps me in tune with the suburbs before they awaken. My eyes flicker from open to shut to open again as the morning air etches goosebumps into my arms. Mom and Dad’s idle chitchat does nothing to break the morning’s tension. I silently beg for them to stay quiet so I can do anything but remember where I’m going. For forty-five miles, I hold my breath.

The garden, its history etched in crayon by thousands of children from each of the twelve floors, is enough to make me not completely hate the trip from my parents’ house to downtown St. Louis. Its vivid, overgrown flora contrasts with the harsh chill of radiology and the dull smell of a freshly opened IV line. It provides openness and room to roam, unlike the tightly coiled, claustrophobic interior of an MRI machine. I am not a patient there, but simply a person. We drive through my hometown of Wentzville, a suburb where the only significant brilliance of nature was the woods behind my house and the outdoor classroom behind my high school where students went to hook up—only if the weather was nice, obviously. The monotony of cookie-cutter houses and overly developed suburbia makes it look like any other small town that encompasses the surrounding area of the metropolitan atmosphere; in other words, a trip to the city is a big deal, and a walk in the woods is only suitable during the most boring days of summer vacation. During the days when I would be stuck inside, my recovery logged by a strict hourly basis, all I could do was look out the window to see the cul-de-sac and dead trees blocked off by the woods’ barbed wire fence. Even as I shut my eyes during my daily afternoon nap—mandated by my mother—I saw the flares of bright color reflecting off the brick pathways of the garden. Going to sleep with the recurring doubt if my health would ever recover, I saw every color.

St. Louis Children’s Hospital is guarded by a stretch of vibrant, bush-lined streets and the kings and queens of the animal kingdom. Massive, multi-col-
ored statues of lions, giraffes, and hippos stand beside the parking garage entrance to distract from the words on the sign. The surgical suite is on the horse floor, or more plainly known as the sixth floor. The journey to the horse floor means being squished in an elevator with parents who wear faded identification tags, children either in their mothers’ arms or in wheelchairs, and a small voice over the speaker.

“Going up!” chirps a little girl’s prerecorded voice.

On the way to the horse floor, Mom grabs me a couple Spiderman stickers from the front desk as we pass under a miniature train that makes its rounds along the ceiling. “Look,” she says, nudging my shoulder to show me designs on the superhero stickers that probably weren’t intended for a mother and her eighteen-year-old daughter. The carpet underneath my feet is colored like the bottom surface of the ocean, and the passing doctors and nurses all have smiles plastered on their faces.

Other than the other young adults whose neurologists sent them to pediatric doctors, I’m one of the few patients who can sign their own consent forms. Taking a breath and reminding myself that I’m a month away from college move-in day, I just smile and sign my brain away.

“Oh honey, you don’t look old enough to be eighteen!” chirps the receptionist. I bite back a snide comment.

The nurses waste no time in telling me to take everything off. I slip on a pair of pale blue, rubber-soled socks, covering coral toenails that Mom had taken me to get painted the day before, each of us avoiding the impending events during the pedicure. Shedding my clothes and allowing Mom to tie the back of my boxy, loose gown, goosebumps run down my arms and legs. As I take a seat on the itchy blankets, I swallow the word vomit that has built up inside of me. Every instinct says not to speak.

“She’s going to college next month,” Mom tells everyone she can, carefully folding my clothes and putting them in a plastic bag.

The anesthesia team raises the rails on my bed, one doctor or nurse at each side. Holding my breath, I watch pre-op disappear around me through blurred, tear-filled eyes. Before I fall victim to the drugs, I catch a glimpse of the operating room. It seems way smaller than in the movies. My eyes fixate on the empty table. I don’t remember them closing. Surgery number one: check.

“You excited for the Balloon Glow tonight, kiddo?” my surgeon asks as he checks his phone, which had earlier been ringing with the theme song from
The Office, for a missed call from his teenage son.

Dad, whose turn it is to watch me, leans forward in his chair, his yellowed teeth illuminated in the vibrancy of a peach September sunset that creeps through the expansive windows. “The nurse said we can unhook her from everything for a while and wheel her to the garden to watch.”

The doctor returns Dad’s smile and hides his hands in his coat pockets. “If it’s okay with the nurse, it’s okay with me.” After three surgeries, the doctor has thrown most of his ground rules out the window.

As the sun trades places with the moon in time with shift changes, the nurses come to unhook the antibiotics from my left hand and tie my greasy hair into a bun atop my head. Slipping into the polka dot bathrobe brought from my dorm room, I ease myself into a wheelchair and lean back as Dad pushes me to the eighth floor.

“Other than that, good looking brain.”

In our first meeting that May, the doctor sits to my right, his long legs stretched under the desk as he fiddles with his SpongeBob necktie and zooms in on the MRI. With a click of his mouse, he zooms in on that. Two centimeters by one inch, nestled against my brain stem within my occipital lobe, a white blob illuminates the screen. That has a bittersweet resonance from one word: benign.

The phrase, “It’s probably nothing serious,” goes against the result, what everyone says it can never be. Over and over, I repeat the same words in my mind: epidermoid brain tumor.

Mom leans forward, eyes popping out. “That looks big. Is that big?”

The surgeon shrugs. “It’s about average. I’ve taken out bigger, I’ve taken out smaller.”

Taken out. I can feel the blood draining from my cheeks.

Of all the people who are diagnosed with brain tumors, between 0.2 and 1.8 percent of them share my diagnosis. That’s anywhere from 100 to 1,000 Americans per year. The doctor makes a fist with his hand as we are led back to the examination room.

“It’s a mass that forms during pregnancy out of keratin,” he pauses, motioning to his fingernails, “the stuff in your fingernails and hair, and a bunch of fluid. It grows very slowly over time. You were born with it.”

Mom’s face, copper from years of tanning and our deep Italian ancestry, tightens and then loosens as her mouth drops open. “I had a perfectly normal
pregnancy,” she says. The firm voice of a woman who teaches in an inner-city high school now wavers as her chocolate eyes, just like mine, blink back tears.

_I’ve had this thing in my head for eighteen years_. My thoughts chase themselves, irritating the already pressing headache that has gripped me every moment of every day for over a year. _There’s a tumor in my brain. There’s a tumor in my brain._ Oh my God.

The laundry list of what could happen without treatment is enough to bring me back to reality. Hearing loss, facial paralysis, speech difficulties, neurological impairments, swelling of the brain.

“There’s nothing that would have told you about this during pregnancy,” the doctor says, his hands folded in his lap as his chair swivels toward me. “You wouldn’t have known unless she’d had an MRI for some reason.” The referral from the neurologist to the neurosurgeon makes too much sense in that moment.

“So what do we do?” Dad’s voice cracks.

“We have to remove it.”

When I picture the tumor, I picture a tan, wax ball about the size of a runt slug, compressing itself tighter and tighter into the cocoon of my brain stem. Keratin, the foundation of my milk chocolate hair and my fingernails that are gnawed to the ends, is its core. One of the most naturally occurring proteins in biology formed for eighteen years before breaking its silence. Before I was even born, my own body was trying to kill me.

Even so, the literal nature that heals a surgical scar is far from a flawless remedy. I spend the months in between surgeries craning my head down, beanie bobbing up and down as I grit my teeth through the pain of haphazard Southwest Missouri weather. In the months between and after surgeries, the distance between St. Louis and Springfield is most palpable in terms of the south’s extreme weather tendencies. In August and September, the roar of early morning thunder sends shockwaves from my neck to the inner ears, jolting me from a sleep only induced by melatonin pills. In October, the rustling of leaves overhead sends my mind into spirals as my brain can never distinguish where the sound comes from. In December, the wind chill seeps into the raw muscles that outline the path to my occipital lobe, the bones shivering as if naked, even under a hat.

The melatonin numbs me to sleep, but only under the condition that it traps me within the same nightmare pattern: I end up in an MRI machine or
in the neurosurgery waiting room, backed into a corner by the news that I need yet another surgery. For months after the third operation, I wake up several times per week in a cold sweat, gripping my chest to calm my heartbeat. The melatonin naturally puts me to sleep, but at the cost of my own security.

I swallow the thought and bite my lip as I walk to class.

Leaning back against the wall, my feet swing back and forth above the ground. Gripping the edges of the examination table, a notepad of post-op questions sits in my lap. But as I swallow the salty taste of thin fluid that has accumulated in the back of my throat, I know that none of the questions about swimming after surgery and what side of my head to sleep on hardly matter. Two weeks post-op from the first surgery, the question at the top of my list is the only one that matters. But he cuts me off before I can ask.

Followed by his surgical fellow, the doctor shuts the door behind him. “How do you feel, kiddo?”

“Well—” I can hardly speak before a leaky faucet of the same thin, salty fluid races from my nose and down my chin. For the past two weeks since surgery, I have tasted the fluid from my spine and brain in my mouth, and wiped it from my nose like the residue of a bad cold. All part of stale routine, I assume, since I have spent the past two weeks also with a congested left ear. Then I see the look on everyone’s faces around me.

The doctor’s light eyes widen as he takes a step back. Exchanging a glance with the fellow, whose lips are slightly parted at a loss for words, he tilts my head back and asks what the fluid tastes like in my mouth.

“Salt and saliva.”

With a single, silent glance, the surgeons exchange at least one hundred words. Nodding to himself and murmuring, “Mhmm,” the doctor fetches a specimen cup from the other room and has me tilt my head. With few words of reassurance, he orders a CT scan, but the way his lips purse together and his eyebrows furrow tells me that he has already made up his mind.

“I don’t usually operate on Mondays,” he later says, swiveling in his chair with his hands folded together in his lap, “but in your case, we’re going to make sure you leave for college on time.”

He schedules a morning procedure to reopen the incision and insert a lumbar drain in my back for three days later. His last words before we leave with the date are “I’m sorry.” What he doesn’t tell me is that for this second surgery, I will be awake enough to lay myself down on the operating table. My breathing
will become so faltered that I will require sedatives and deep breathing, an entire anesthesiology team standing over me as tears blur my fading vision. “I’m sorry,” is the best he can do.

As we exit the neurosurgery suite, I wrap my arms around myself and trail behind my parents, whose gazes fixate on anything but each other. Staring at the colors that coordinate with each floor listed by the elevator, my eyes fill with a stream of tears that have waited what feels like hours to break the silence. Hot tears racing down my cheeks, cerebrospinal fluid leaks from my nose as Dad wraps his arms around me. Her hand running through my hair, Mom says nothing until we reach our floor.

“I’ll be back,” she says. “I just need a cigarette.” Wiping the moisture from my face, I look out the window of the lobby to see Mom standing among the kingdom of bright, metal animals, head down and a Salem Light between her fingers.

Even from the window, I can see the sweat glistening on her forehead as she steps into the August shade. One breath in, one breath out, she lets the nicotine encircle her lungs like an embrace from a sleazy ex-boyfriend. Healing her doubts and her regrets as a mother—“I blamed myself,” she later told me, “for a long time”—she fuels her body with poison.

“Don’t start smoking,” she has always told me. “Don’t get that from me.” Among the animal statues and the rusting leaves overhead, she shuts her eyes. As the “thing” in my head slowly kills me, she takes long puffs of the cigarette, as if she is trying to beat me to the finish line. She slowly turns her own lungs black as cerebrospinal fluid drips from my nose, and my throat closes as I watch her head lean back. The side effects of her guilt evaporate away.

My own side effects remain present. Over the years, it is never listed in the post-op directions that I can expect to feel the sensation of eyes following me around campus, fixating on the gauze taped around my head. It’s never listed how many copies of excuse notes and restriction lists I have to print out and distribute to my professors, if they will even accept them. It’s never listed how many intramural volleyball games I have to skip out of fear that someone hits me in the stitches. It’s never listed how much Valium, Oxycodone, Zofran, Miralax, Gabapentin, Lyrica, and even IV magnesium, within the straitjacket of the emergency room, I will accumulate. The knotted, worn neck muscles that never used to keep me up at night, even with looming 8:00 AM classes. The three-inch indent on the side of my head that makes its presence known every moment of every day.

They never told me that the “after” effects don’t have an expiration date, especially after having a neurosurgeon hug me months later and whisper “I’m
so sorry for everything” in my ear.

The day after the balloon glow, I stand in the middle of the garden, staring out toward the park and touching the gauze on my head. The air is damp and sticky with humidity, shaking off a rainy afternoon. Stepping over the wet stone, I clumsily pace back and forth. As my parents speak in hushed tones by the garden bench, I rip off the Band-Aid that covers an IV scar on my right hand. The skyline is no longer ablaze with a rainbow of colors, balloons racing each other higher and higher beyond the distant height of the Gateway Arch. Instead, the afternoon sky is covered in cloud puffs and a baby blue hue. The city resumes its normal day, while on the floors above and below me, time is anything but normal for the children who are not being discharged today. As I remember that I am one of those who actually do get to leave, I catch sight of the girl with the eyepatch from the previous night. In her gown, bathrobe, and oversized socks, she and her younger brother run back and forth along the pathway. She coughs as the two of us make eye contact, a smile coming across my face.

I flinch as a hand rests on my shoulder. My mother motions toward the exit, holding my paperwork in her other hand. I follow a few steps behind my parents, taking one last look toward the skyline. I hold my breath as the garden disappears behind me one last time.
Abstract

There is a lack of multiracial recognition within our society. Comparing history to present day, not much has changed when considering the divisions we put between our races and our cultures. I am a biracial woman exploring the meaning behind my identity in our present day through my photographic work.

My roots are as true as the melanin in my skin, but the lack of submersion within both cultures of my heritage left me with a growing curiosity. I was raised by my single white mother in a small town where black culture was non-existent. During my childhood, my mother encouraged my curiosity, but until we moved to a more diverse area, I had not truly explored my identity. Throughout the process of my work, I began an exploration into what it means to be a biracial woman. I found this process to be a personal exploration, but I also came to find a community of multiracial families that helped build my body of work.

With the ability to learn film processes through Missouri State University’s photography program, I fell in love and chose to shoot with my medium-format camera. I purposely chose color film for its history with minorities and mixed races. Color film was not functional for all purposes when it came to capturing darker skin tones. There were reports of processed film having unrecognizable subject matter. The whites of the eyes and teeth of darker skinned people were the only evidence of their picture being taken. Not until furniture and chocolate companies complained about their products looking unappealing did the processing start to apply to all subject matter.

Considering my subject matter, I chose to print my images 35” x 35”. I wanted to have them almost life size to really give the viewer a chance to look at these people as more than a label on a wall. To use such a large size while working with film, I scanned and edited the images digitally to allow for an easier printing process and for gallery presence.

My work, “Untitled,” serves as a message that we do not stand to fit within a defined box. Some companies that use racial identification on their forms have adjusted their wording, but not until recently have mixed races been given the box labeled “other” to identify with. I wanted to shed that impersonal label from the people I photographed. A box marked “other” is a vague explanation into who multiracial people are and, more importantly, into what part they play in society. I consider this body of work as just the beginning exploration into what it means to be multiracial today.
Deep rooted melanin dilutes my American Dream, plaguing my whiteness: an unattainable purity. Endless fog of a country’s insecurities leaves me lost in this land of hollow promise.

As a citizen unsure of my mixed alienation, I stand an oblivious descendant of an oppressed people. Society rejected the idea of integration. I am only given sterile socialization.

My inner vitiligo leaves me disoriented with mulatto tendencies. Racial Warfare threatens to segregate the blood that flows through my veins.

I stand here permanently passing in this society given unjust ultimatums. Stained with a biracial identity, I continue to live my American Dream.
Photograph by Raven Kohlenberger.
Photograph by Raven Kohlenberger.
Photograph by Raven Kohlenberger.
Iron Snowflake

Maria Rosaria Meluso

Abstract

In 2017, social media was flooded with #MeToo in response to allegations from numerous women of sexual assault by prominent Hollywood producer Harvey Weinstein and other powerful people. Many people posted this hashtag to their social media pages, showing the world just how many had been victims of sexual assault, harassment, or misconduct. Society was finally paying attention to the stories of victims and holding the men and women responsible accountable. The full extent of this movement has yet to be seen, but many people are still unable to tell their stories out of fear of retaliation. This forced silence and isolation can be devastating, especially to young people. This memoir recalls in explicit detail my experience with sexual abuse at the hands of a powerful family member I once deeply trusted and explores the effects childhood sexual trauma has many years later. It also suggests that victims and their families may never truly reach a point of healing in such circumstances, but that speaking up is an important part of the healing process. They call my generation “snowflakes” now, but many people around my age that I’ve spoken to have a sexual assault survival story. We’re not nearly as fragile as they make us out to be. I wrote this piece with the hope that it may inspire others to come forward with their stories, raise awareness, and begin to heal. But more than that, I wrote this piece for myself, so I could tell my story as a beginning to my healing process and a way for me to come to terms with the evil things humans are capable of.
Fashion designer Domenico Dolce once famously said, “For all Italian people, family is very important. We don’t fight with our families.” Anyone who knows an Italian family, or who has at the very least seen the Italian-American staple *The Godfather*, will know this from witnessing it. Me, well, I know it from experiencing it. All my life, I’ve grown up surrounded almost to suffocation by my immigrant family, a close-knit group who elects to gather once a week on Sunday to share a meal and catch up on the happenings of each other’s lives, headed by our matriarch and, at one point, our patriarch.

Everyone idolizes my Nonno, who came from nothing in a small, rural Italian town near the ankle of the country’s boot, who immigrated to a country where he didn’t speak the language and faced daily discrimination for the stereotypes of laziness and mafia ties, who worked a manual labor job starting at four in the morning to provide for his wife and four children. He was the stuff of legend, the perfect immigrant story, the epitome of Italian-American perseverance and the American dream. He was iron, unyielding. His word in our family was law. When he jangled his keys, you’d best have your butt in the worn, plush seat of his old Crown Victoria, watching the wooden doll in the knitted green dress dancing where she hung from the rearview mirror, and rolling down the window to avoid suffocating on stale cigarette smoke. And when he retired to his big armchair after lunch for a nap, with the big wool blanket over his knees and *Rai Italia* droning in the background, you’d best not make a sound to disturb him.

The man commanded respect and could light up the room with his smile and laughter. But to me, that shining, artificial-toothed smile staring back at me from the framed poster collages of grainy, enlarged photographs decorating most of the walls in Nonna’s house reminds me of something less nostalgic and much more sinister.

In my earliest memories, he sneaks up behind me and I immediately feel my palms break into a cold sweat. It’s Sunday and I’m around seven years old. We’re in the finished basement, having just finished lunch. My father sits at the dining room table reading the Italian magazines Nonno still gets delivered, mere feet from us, but oblivious. My aunts and uncles wash and put away dishes with my mother, and my sister and cousins and I make runs to clear the table. I had almost made it to grab another round of dishes and stave off the inevitable before he intercepted.

No one notices him as he presses himself against my back. His presence is
commanding, his shadow towering over my four-foot frame like Mount Vesuvius over Pompeii. My nostrils fill with heavy overtones of tobacco and just a little too much red wine, and I choke back a gag as it makes my eyes water. The scent is familiar, from every embrace I’ve ever given him, but unpleasant in the way it overtakes me, entombing me in its thickness.

His gnarled, calloused fingers, knotted from years of shoveling, wrap tightly around my slight wrist, holding fast and tugging my arm behind my back. My eyes widen and my body stiffens, but I make certain not to move. I know it better than I know my own name. If I don’t move, I’m not as guilty. I just have to let him do it. I just have to keep him happy. It’ll be over soon.

The quiet buzz of a zipper increases my panic tenfold. He guides my small hand toward his crotch, and I feel something primal inside me telling me to get away. I have to run, hide, do something to keep myself from going through this again. I tug against his grasp, struggling, resisting as best I can in this position. I know it won’t work; it never does. But I try it anyway, because maybe, just maybe, this time will be different.

I know the moment my hand is wrapped around his penis that it absolutely isn’t.

My entire family is there. But somehow, as usual, no one catches him as they go about the business of cleaning up. I feel him pull on my wrist, guiding my hand upward along his length, and I cringe. I hate this part.

He doesn’t speak; he never does. I’m forced to hold him, a stick of dynamite in young hands. I don’t understand. I’m far too young to understand what it is, let alone what he’s doing. I only understand that I desperately want him to let go of me so I can run. I want to scream, vomit, and hide away in the bathroom until he goes to take his nap and leaves me alone for a little while.

When my mother comes out of the kitchen with an armload of clean dishes to be put away, I see my last slim opportunity to escape his clutches.

“Mom?” I ask, a hysterical edge in my tone. “Can I help you with anything?” She glances over. She’s finally going to see, I think to myself. Or at the very least, she is going to answer that yes, she does need some help, and he’ll be forced to free me.

“No, I think we’re all good for now. Thank you,” she responds, shutting the cabinet doors and, at the same time, my last door to freedom.

I feel him push my fingers down one at a time, forcing me to massage him, and a lump grows in my throat. The soft flesh squelching under each finger burns itself into my young memory.

I’m not helping my family clean up after Sunday dinner. I let him do it. I am rigid, forever preserved in hardened lava, a mask of terror frozen in time
on my face. I’m not in control of my body anymore. I’m somewhere else, far away. And I am guilty.

My family moved in next door to my maternal grandparents around the time I turned two. We moved away from New Jersey for a few reasons (that change depending on who you ask to tell the story). My mother hated her boss. She was left alone in an unfamiliar place, with a toddler—me. My father was almost never around because he worked two jobs. His company was laying employees off, and he could have been next. Our house was not big enough with my sister on the way and my parents’ unrealized plans for a third child. And the price of the Peters’ old fixer-upper was right for a young family like ours. The cost of living was lower, and they would have a built-in babysitter for my little sister and me.

Of course, the one thing they never accounted for was one of those built-in babysitters being a pedophile.

Because that was what my Nonno Antonio was. For all the good things he was, for all the sacrifices he made for his family, for all the hard work he had done, the only thing I will ever remember him as, the only thing my mother, his favorite daughter, will ever see him as, is a pedophile and an abuser. And I was his victim.

I don’t remember exactly how it began, or even when. I know some of my earliest memories involve the feeling of his genitalia in my hand as he forced me to touch him. I was six or seven, perhaps younger.

At the beginning, it never mattered where we were or what we were doing. Standing outside admiring the three peach trees in his backyard, each bearing the name of one of his granddaughters but never bearing actual fruit? He would stand behind me and wrap my small hand around his penis. Playing Barbies? He asked for a doll, stripped it naked, and fondled its groin area until the cheap plastic smelled like his tobacco-crusted fingers, a smell I desperately tried to wash off but never quite went away. Playing doctor? He would insist the only treatment he needed was for me to massage his penis.

As it went on, he became even sneakier about it, making sure to isolate me as often as possible before unzipping his fly.

When I was a little older, when my sister and I would spend afternoons after school next door until our parents got home, I recall my dad talking about safe touches with me.

“You never let anyone touch your swimsuit area, Maria,” he admonished
me. “No one except mommy and daddy and the doctor. And Nonno and Nonna,” he added, remembering, I assume, that they were going to be watching us and may have still needed to help my sister in the bathroom.

But it was the wrong thing for him to say.

“Yes, daddy,” I remember telling him. I now think I obeyed all too well.

I’m seated at the kitchen table in my Nonni’s basement working on Reading homework. I don’t know exactly where my sister is—likely off playing with her dolls, using the clunky Windows 98 behemoth that never managed to receive Internet connection, or running around outside. Nonna flits around her sewing room upstairs. I hear the ceiling creak as she moves around the old house.

Nonno enters, and I hear him before I see him, his worn leather slippers slapping the bottoms of his feet and the artificial tiling in the kitchen as he moves toward me. He comes up behind me, close like always, and peers over my shoulder at the worksheet I’m bent over. I know he can’t really understand it. He hardly speaks English. Nonna had to learn because the impatient lady at the post office once told her to go back to her own country when she couldn’t remember the word “stamp” and a long line had formed behind her. But Nonno never had to learn. I don’t think he often understood a word I said.

I look up at him from over my shoulder.

“It’s English homework,” I try to explain, and he only nods. His eyes never meet mine, and I wonder idly if he’s trying to read it. Turning back to my task, I hardly notice his hand come to rest on my thigh.

“Why are your legs closed?” He asks me in his broken, heavily-accented English. I blink once.

I’m seated like a lady, I think to myself. Like Mom taught me to sit when I wear a dress to church.

“Oh,” I answer casually. “It’s comfortable to sit like this.”

“No, no,” he insists. “You have to relax your legs.” He turns his hand so just two fingers are “standing” on my upper thigh, looking like a malformed person if I squint. “The little man is knocking on your door,” he says, tapping closer to my inner thigh, and I instantly feel uncomfortable. I squeeze my legs tighter together.

“No, Nonno,” I reply, feeling tension creep up my spine and grab my shoulders. “Not right now. I need to finish this.” But he has it in his head now. He continues to pester me.
“Let the little man in,” he insists, more forcefully now. “Don’t be rude. He’s getting cold out here.”

I was being rude for not letting him in?

There’s a stabbing sensation in my heart and a burning in my chest as panic sets in, this time having nothing to do with fear. I couldn’t be rude. My parents raised me better than that. Nonno was asking me to do something, and it was my job as granddaughter to respect and obey him. Dad had said Nonno was one of the people allowed to touch there, after all. I didn’t want to get into trouble again for not listening to them, or for him to tell my parents I was disobedient and hurt his feelings.

Slowly, I relax my legs. Just a little. Despite doing what I’m told, something still doesn’t sit right in the pit of my stomach. But I can’t find the words for the feeling.

“That’s not enough,” he cajoles. “Look.” He tries to jam the finger-man between my still-touching thighs. “He can’t fit.”

This goes on for nearly a half hour, with me reluctantly opening my legs slightly wider each time until it satisfies him. He sighs.

“Now he can come in,” he repeats, sounding oddly relieved.

And come in the little man does.

I didn’t always see my grandfather as an abuser. In fact, even as the unthinkable was happening, I never saw him as anything other than a loving man who would have done anything for his kids and grandkids. He was the reason I was able to sing in the choir, for example. That activity led to finding one of my true passions and joys in life, and eventually made me quite a bit of spending money as a teenager. Without his willingness to drive me, my mother wasn’t going to allow me to join. Little things like that made me believe he really cared.

I think part of it was that I didn’t understand. The only feeling I recall from those moments, all these years later, was a deep-seated disgust and sense of guilt I dragged with me like a prison mattress through the rest of my life. I was too young to really grasp what he was doing to me. I only knew that it made me uncomfortable, but that it was something he wanted me to do. And his desire was often law in our family. Like it or not, no matter how it made me feel, I knew to respect his authority. So, for many years, blindly, I did.

But of course, the older I got, the more I began to understand. And the more resistant I became to it.
It’s late one summer night, after a family barbecue held at our home. The food has been eaten and put away, the booze has run dry, and the extended family has gone home for the night.

Nonna made *pasta fagioli* for the event, one of Dad’s favorites. Mom transfers the leftovers into a plastic container for Dad to eat at his leisure and hand-washes Nonna’s old pasta pot. She calls on me to dry it, take it through our connected backyards, and return it to my grandparents’ house. In the darkness, amid blaring crickets and cicadas, I walk through the open fence to Nonna’s back porch. The trees cast deep shadows, and the back lights aren’t on anymore, plunging the night into further murkiness.

I knock three times and call for Nonna. After a few moments, Nonno answers.

There’s something…off about him. Something in his eyes is almost predatory. I step back, holding the pot between us in a vain attempt at protection.

“Hey, Nonno. This is Nonna’s. Mom washed it.”

Silence.

The cricket chirps are nearly drowned out by the sound of my own blood rushing in my ears.

Nonno accepts the pot, but immediately turns to set it on the stone bench in front of the huge windows. Turning his attention back to me, he steps forward, leering. I step back again.

“Ah…Mom still isn’t finished cleaning up,” I lie, as I am used to doing by now. “I should probably get back…”

More silence. This time, he reaches for me, and although I am almost an adolescent at this point and likely stronger than he is, I freeze. The familiar sense of disgust and dread washes over me, and my instinct to fight or flee shuts down completely.

Like a slow motion shot in a movie, he grabs me, pulling me in for an embrace. Numb, I let him hug me. My body is crushed against his, and for a few seconds, I’m drowning in the smokiness of his plaid jacket; my whole world is darkness and his body. I pull back a little, trying to surface for some air. I can barely catch my breath, however, before I feel an odd sensation at the hem of my T-shirt, the fluttering of an evening breeze. But the trees stand still, unmoving in the Midwestern mid-summer mugginess, and I realize too late that it’s no breeze at all.

His hand gropes under my shirt, swiping my lower abdomen before find-
ing purchase on my waistband. He slips silently inside, nearly making it to the seam of my panties.

Fight or flight finally reboots, a little too late, and I double over, crushing his hand between two halves of a violated body and trying to yank away. His hand remains tucked insistently inside my waistband, trying to force itself lower. I choke, unable to push a word out. My stomach knots, and I thrash harder, contorting unnaturally to avoid his probing fingers as he squeezes me even more tightly. My terror overrides my need to never disrespect family. Every nerve ending is on fire, and I swear my vision grows sharper. Respect be damned, I have to get away from him.

I hear a strangled sound I only later realize is my voice, begging, pleading, “No, Nonno. No. No, I have to go home.”

I twist hard to get out of his stranglehold, the deafening sound of my pulse pounding in my ears. I can think of nothing else but escape, as I’ve wanted for so many years.

As soon as I break free of his iron grip, I sprint into the darkness through the fence and do not look back. I do not usually run. Despite being a soccer player and a dancer, I detest running and reserve it for true life-or-death situations. Like this one. Tonight, I run as hard and fast as I possibly can, not realizing I can’t breathe until I am safely in the house with the back door locked behind me.

I run straight into the solitary basement bathroom with the hideous, ‘60s floral wallpaper. I slam the door behind me in case he somehow gets through and press my back against the wall, trying to catch my breath as I shake, wracked with sobs. For a few seconds, it feels like I’m having an asthma attack. (And I’ll only realize later it was, in fact, a panic attack.)

This is what it’s come to, I realize. This is what all the years of torment and abuse has done. How many times before now have I kept silent, done what I was told? How close had I come to molestation and worse this evening, and how many times had I suffered it all before?

I look at myself in the mirror, face puffy and red and stained with tears, and for the first time I realize I hate what I see. For the first time, I consciously acknowledge my guilt. For all these years, I’ve done nothing to stop him. I’ve let this happen. This is on me.

I can’t let it go on like this. Next time, I may not get away before he...

I have to tell.

But how? How do I put into words the terror I have suffered from my earliest memory? I rehearse in my head what I could possibly say to Mom, how I will breach the topic. There’s no easy way to say it. There’s no guarantee she’ll
believe me. But my world is already in ruins. How much worse could it get? So I wipe my eyes, blow my nose, and march to the downstairs kitchen.

Her back is still to me as she finishes cleaning dishes. I hesitate, glancing back through the doorway. I could just go upstairs right now. I falter, opening and closing my mouth a few times without words coming out, muzzled by my own cold isolation. It’s only as she turns around that I realize it’s now or never.

“So… that was the weirdest visit to Nonna’s ever,” I begin, trying to be casual and lean against the makeshift countertop. Mom glances over at me. A loaded moment passes between us.

“Oh? How so?” She asks me. I squeeze my eyes shut.

“Nonno answered the door…and he tried to touch me…down there.”

“He did what?”

“He pulled me in for a hug and then…he put his hand down my pants…”

Like an enraged bull, my mother makes for the phone. I can’t even manage to tell her this isn’t the first time it’s happened. The rest of my words vanish like a puff of his cigarette smoke in the wind.

I hear her yelling at him in Italian a few moments later while I hide in my bedroom. I don’t ask her what she said, or what he said. I trust she’s taken care of it, and I fall asleep breathing easier.

Miraculously, he doesn’t try anything the day after, or the day after that. He barely acknowledges my presence at all when I come over after school for the entire week to follow. Now that we both know Mom knows, I’m feeling brave, and I finally believe I am free.

Until one week later, that damned little man returns for me. And when he wraps his hand around my wrist while I stand before him. I, being the coward I am, do not say another word to anyone.

He had his stroke in 2008. His arteries were nearly all blocked with plaque buildup from years upon years of heavy tobacco use. When he came back home that summer, he was a new man: He didn’t remember any of us. Most, if not all, of his motor skills were severely impaired. He couldn’t really talk to us, even after all the rehab work and the regular appointments with various therapists. When anyone would speak to him, he could only offer a creepy half-smile because he knew somehow that we were important in his life.

He didn’t really remember my name, or his affectionate Italian nickname for my sister. He hardly remembered to whistle in response to the birds like he once would. And most importantly, he didn’t remember the little man or
the thing he made me do that would make him “feel good.” And just like that, without fanfare, without apology, it was finally over.

He died on July 6, likely without a single memory of the horrors he put me through, without a single drop of guilt on his conscience. The funeral was a blur, but I remember that I didn’t shed any tears. Nonna continued to insist we go “visit him” at the cemetery on the anniversary of his death and once each at Christmas and his birthday. When I’d go, I would hang back from the rest of the family, listening to her wail or “talk” to him and watching her kiss her hand and press it against the marble face of his crypt. I would pretend to pray as she and my father demanded, with my head bowed. In reality, I was usually scuffing my toe against the concrete, squinting in the sunlight, and waiting for them to tell us it was acceptable to pile back into the car to go home.

She still thinks he can hear her from his place in heaven, but I know better. He’s not there.

“He loved you so much, Maria,” Nonna sometimes tells me when she is consumed by grief. I never respond. This only increases my sense of isolation. It perpetuated the fuzziness and self-doubt that came when my repressed memories started to return, as I cannot reconcile this perfect fallen hero of my family’s folly and the man I knew. It still feels as though I’m protecting him by keeping what he did to me mostly secret. All these things have encouraged my broken psyche to insist that this was my fault and that I deserve to be punished for every little mistake since.

In the years following Nonno’s funeral, my memories only came back a little at a time. They were dreamlike blips, moments frozen in time, sensations, smells that I could barely make sense of and thought may have been the product of an overactive imagination. Though doubt is a normal part of any childhood trauma, and though I still find myself second-guessing many of the half-memories, their persistence and consistency led me to believe they could not have come from my own, naïve mind. After all, what sheltered child, who grew up mostly without the Internet and who mainly spent her time writing, reading, or playing pretend, knows what a penis is, let alone what it feels like?

The effects of childhood sexual trauma can manifest in many ways. For me, those ways were an enduring and overwhelming sense of guilt and worthlessness, and anxiety over just about everything, from people getting just a little too close to me to the idea of any intimate contact.

My uncle often thought it was funny to come up behind me at Sunday lunch and grab my neck and squeeze. He didn’t understand why I tensed up, grew rigid and angry, and bellowed at him, “Don’t touch me!” He thought it was a game.
My father also thought it was funny to hug me from behind, to pinch and prod and make escape impossible. He didn’t understand why I resisted, why I would fight him so hard.

“I’m just playing!” He would tell me, hands raised in defense. Once, he squeezed me so tightly from behind that I screamed and, struggling harder than I ever had through a flashback, cut my hand on his watch as I fought to release myself from his grasp. He was put out when I was angry the rest of the night and most of the following day. I still have the scar.

And still, nobody understands why I have a panic attack in Disneyland.

I’ve been sick for weeks with a cough that sounds as though I am dying and feels as though a fat man is seated directly on my chest. But we’ve had this trip planned for my mother’s birthday for nearly a year, so I suck it up and try to power through. The day has been fairly good, with only a few coughing fits. But when we get herded around for the fireworks spectacular, suddenly, it is hard to breathe.

There are so many people, bodies pressed against mine. Behind, beside, in front of. People shoving past me, or worse, hovering in my personal space for extended amounts of time. The same way he used to. I already am struggling to catch a breath from the cough, but now I feel myself beginning to wheeze, and my heart rate increases dramatically. There are too many people around me. They’re closing in, like he did. They’re too close, and I cannot find a route of escape. As far as I can see, I’m trapped.

Even when we do find a personal bubble, even when my mom’s hand descends on my shoulder and tries to gently soothe away the attack, as the music swells and Cinderella’s castle lights up in the glow of brilliant firecrackers and laser lights, I am in tears. At Disneyland, the Happiest Place on Earth. Because once upon a time, he got too close. And there was no happily ever after.

I thought perhaps telling my parents would ease some of my guilt and anxiety. I didn’t really want to tell my mother when, by my sophomore year of high school, many of the traumatic memories (though, of course, not all of them) had come back in earnest. Up to that point, Mom still had no idea that things had continued past that night in Nonna’s backyard. It wasn’t that I still didn’t think she would believe me. Even though I sometimes didn’t believe myself, I
knew more than anything that she would believe me. That wasn’t it.

She had been Nonno’s favorite child, and he was the first person in her family to make her feel wanted. She had a strained relationship with Nonna, but absolutely adored her father. The feeling was obviously mutual, from the joy he would get spending time with us to the secret financial support he often offered. He kept a photo of only the four of us in his wallet, for crying out loud. How could I take that away from her? What kind of monster was I?

But it came out without warning, as the truth is so often inclined to do.

I was selected, along with five of my close friends, to lead a retreat. We were a dynamic group comprised of strong leaders. The more we met and bonded, the more we realized how special a group we had. Each of us had a story to share, some hardship no one else knew anything about. And we thought perhaps we could use our stories to do some good.

We agreed to tell our stories during our speeches at the retreat, every gritty, vulnerable detail. If we went all in, our somewhat difficult class would buy into it too, we reasoned.

I stood at the podium on the second day and for the first time told the whole story of what happened to me. I didn’t cry, though I heard loud sniffles and sobs from the crowd the longer I spoke. In fact, I felt almost nothing, reading like a drone from the paper I prepared. Desensitized. Numb.

Like I’m made of iron.

I realized later that evening that it was unfair and even dangerous for half of my high school class and many of my instructors to know such a massive secret, but not my own parents. And I realized it was now or never to finally tell Mom. My paternal grandmother had died the week before the retreat. My father had lost his job. I had been in a dangerous car accident with my sister and her friends riding in the backseat and had totaled my first car. We were already grieving, I thought. It wouldn’t soften the blow, but what was one more thing to grieve over?

When she came to pick me up that Friday night, before I even set foot inside my mom’s car so we could go home, I broke down.

“I have something I have to tell you. And you aren’t going to like it.” Her demeanor shifted from happy to have me home to worried and uncomfortable.

“I don’t like the sound of that,” she told me, guarded. “What happened?”

“There’s nothing you can do about it now. But at the retreat, I told a story. And I was thinking about it, and I realized I can’t keep it a secret from you
anymore.” I took a deep breath, already crying. “Do you remember a night a long time ago when I came in from Nonna’s house and told you something weird happened?”

“Yes. I remember. You said Nonno touched you inappropriately.”

“Yeah. Mom? That…wasn’t the first time it happened. And it wasn’t the last either.”

“Maria, what are you saying?”

“Nonno molested me as a child.” I was met with silence. Shock.

As we drove the 15 minutes home, I finally told her the truth. And we both cried.

She asked questions I expected: “When did this happen? How did this happen? Did Nonna know?” I tried to answer as best I could for still feeling halfway caught in some insane nightmare.

She asked other questions I did not expect: “What am I supposed to do for you? What do you need me to do?” She laughed ruefully when the next thought came to her. “Do you want to go throw rocks at his grave?”

I didn’t have an answer for her then. I don’t have an answer for her now.

Someone once told me that humans shed so many skin cells each day that, within seven years, we essentially have a brand new body. That means, because over seven years have passed, I now have a body he never defiled. A new layer of skin cells cover my hands, all traces of the old gone, dust on the baseboards of that nearly empty house. These hands were never forced to touch him. That doesn’t take away the pain. But it does make me feel marginally less filthy, less violated.

Knowing my parents know helps too, and though it’s somewhat taboo at home, and though I have been expressly forbidden from telling the rest of the family for various reasons (they don’t even know I wrote this), having the memories out in the open helps ease my sense of isolation. Seeking counseling, writing letters to him, being allowed to avoid the cemetery, and learning to love myself in spite of what he did has also helped.

But, of course, it hasn’t solved everything.

Only a month after I told Mom, we were decorating the family Christmas tree, a tradition of the holiday season. One of the Ranken Bass holiday classics
was playing softly on the television, and in the dim living room, we trimmed
the tree together. Mom stood by the red, snowflake-printed box of ornaments,
checking conditions and weight, reapplying hooks, making suggestions as to
where each bauble should go, and listening to my father reminisce as always.

I was helping her fish out particularly flat ornaments from the bottom
of the box, as I didn’t have long nails anymore; I’d ripped them to nubs from
anxiety by then.

I lifted Nonno’s memorial ornament from the box. It was a heavy iron
piece, a snowflake with his picture in the center. It was missing a hook. I of-
fered it to my mom for hooking while my father prattled on. To me, it was an
olive branch between us, a chance for us to begin healing together.

But some wounds are better left untouched.

Mom barely glanced at it before shaking her head firmly. She took it from
my hands and hastily buried it back in the bottom of the box underneath the
broken and unwanted ornaments.

I haven’t seen it since.
**Small Black Eyes**

Kyle Osredker

**Abstract**

Magical realism as a genre seeks to mirror the real world through supernatural or magical means, thereby using metaphor and allusion to subtly express different themes. This story, “Small Black Eyes,” is an example of this type of narrative fiction. The inner conflict of the main character, Cecilia, manifests as the crows appear throughout the prose. Though they overwhelm her at first, Cecilia slowly starts to win against them through her perseverance and resolve. I attempt to illustrate this through cyclical storytelling. Each section is an echo of the previous section, with Cecilia’s situation improving little by little. The story also begins and ends the same way to show how far the character has come over the course of the prose. Moreover, alliteration and rhythm have been used to create a sense of urgency and uproar that is carried throughout the writing. As the story progresses, this sense of urgency fades to reflect Cecilia’s calmer state of mind. Overall, it was my intent to tell a story that many people could empathize with, and I hope I have succeeded in that regard.

Cecilia came home from the garden center and found a murder of crows in her apartment. She had left no lights on. No windows open. Cecilia always kept the windows of her apartment closed. It had been raining. But the crows were not wet. She simply opened her front door and found them there. Maybe they had always been there. Waiting for her to notice them. Cecilia counted them on her fat fingers, holding her hands close to her chest. There were at least two dozen of them. She let her coat fall from her shoulders and stood there, shifting her eyes from crow to crow and counting. Her apartment floor was covered with clothes she shed like feathers at the end of each work day. With the lights left off, the crows seemed to come from everywhere at once. Silhouettes stretched from the shadows, forming a shapeless black mass of beaks and bodies. Cecilia could see only the eyes of the crows clearly. She counted fifty. Fifty.

Cecilia stepped along the tiled lines of the apartment floor like a tightrope walker. One foot in front of the next. Fifty small black eyes watched her while she waddled. The crows started to caw. She flinched when a few flew past her, throwing her hands over her head. Cecilia screamed. But no sound came out. The caws were raucous now. With every utterance, the sound seemed to
sharpen. Cecilia pressed her hands hard against her ears. The sound swallowed her up, surrounding her in a harsh, grating gale. As each cry crashed against her, Cecilia shut her eyes and crouched for cover. She counted down from fifty. Cecilia counted down from fifty and prayed the crows would be gone when she was out of numbers. Fifty. Forty-four, twenty-two. She could still hear them. Twenty, eighteen, sixteen, fourteen, twelve, ten, five. Cawing and cawing. When she ran out of numbers and opened her eyes, there were still fifty other eyes staring back at her. Blinking back at her. Fifty small black eyes. A cacophony of caws.

From the floor, Cecilia flapped her arms and legs frantically forward. The crows chased after her, emerging amorphously from the corners and taking flight. She could not outrun them. Talons tore into her back as she stumbled into her bedroom, slamming the door behind her. Cecilia thought she would be safe. But beaks and bodies burrowed beneath the gap. A sea of silky feathers flooded the room and engulfed her. Fifty small black eyes swarmed Cecilia, a storm of sound smothering her skin with scratches. The crows clung to Cecilia, her body burdened by their mass. Cecilia beat her arms up and down, but could not shake them from her. She writhed and wiggled, wrestling with the birds as their small black bodies battered her, bruised her, carved scars into her arms and legs. Cecilia collapsed across her bed, weakened by the workday. She struggled until the crows covered her completely, so only her lips could be seen. Cecilia could barely breathe. But she continued to count down from fifty. Fifty small black eyes bore down on her with every labored breath. Blanketing her beneath their weight. The crows shifted about her body, screeching and scratching, never staying still. Cecilia counted down from fifty, but the crows were still there in the morning. Fifty small black eyes followed her from her apartment all the way to work.

Cecilia had moved to Vermont some five, four years ago, maybe. Soon it would be six. She wasn’t sure. For college. She dropped out after sophomore year, but had kept the same cramped apartment since then. Cecilia said she would be back, but never re-enrolled. She always told herself those little lies. Lies like cleaning her apartment more regularly, or losing weight, or returning to school the next semester, or the next, or learning calligraphy. Someday, she thought, she would spread her wings and move out, move on to something new, but she knew it would never happen.

Fifty small black eyes followed Cecilia to the bus stop, pecking at her heels.
and hands when her pace slowed. Her long sleeves hid the scars on her arms from the night before. She stepped aboard the bus as she did almost every morning, merging with the crowd. No one noticed the crows come aboard and no one could see them clinging to her. Could not feel them convulsing across her. Cecilia could not shake free from them. She was weighed down by wings and feathers, pinned between the bodies on the bus. Cecilia counted down the stops between her apartment and the garden center. Twenty, eighteen, sixteen, fourteen, twelve, ten, five. Cecilia stepped off the bus, sprinted for the front door, and fifty small black eyes followed her.

Diane, her co-worker, arrived at the same time as Cecilia. Only where Cecilia ran, Diane walked slowly. A bush of brown hair bounced behind her, her waves wrapped up in a high bun. When she saw Cecilia sprinting toward her, she smiled, holding the door for her. Fifty small black eyes suddenly scattered, wings unfolding from Cecilia’s frame. The crows took to the telephone wires, hiding high in the air and roosting where their eyes could still see Cecilia. Some spied on her between nearby branches, others waiting on the roof. Cecilia stood starstruck, relieved by their retreat. She followed Diane inside the garden center, gazing back briefly at the crows. Fifty small black eyes gazed back at her, poised to pounce when the day was done. She watched them while she worked, counting down the hours until her shift was over.

The garden center, called Greene’s Gardens, was composed of three greenhouses and a small garden growing out back. Groves of trees grew close to one another, surrounding the center enough to shelter it slightly from the city. Customers drifted idly in and out of the greenhouses, approaching the register at the front with arms full of pots and cut flowers. The customers carried so much, Cecilia could never see their faces fully. Only the tops. So she only saw noses and tired eyes staring back at her as she spoke. Cecilia was bad at small talk. Her lips never seemed to move the way she wanted them to. And her hands. What was she supposed to do with them? Sometimes she would push her thumbs into her apron pockets to appear casual. Other times she might gesticulate as she spoke, flapping her arms wildly while ringing up each customer. Cecilia always talked too much or too little. She counted each customer in line, talked to them, but never said quite the right thing. All those tired eyes looking back at her never blinked, nor did heads ever nod. Cecilia counted crumpled bills and coins, looking between her scarred hands at hidden faces. One customer after the other. All moving like clockwork. They all seemed to her as one person whose features shifted only slightly with each new iteration. Some had longer hair, or mean glares, but they all stared blankly back at her as she handed them their change. She would smile, raise her voice, or force
laughter. But never any change.

Her co-workers were always changing. Greene’s Gardens had a high turn-over rate. Cecilia didn’t know why. Every week she learned new names and faces, only to unlearn them the next. She and Diane were the only ones who seemed to stay. But Diane did not seem bothered by this. She never bothered to learn any new names. Diane knew it wouldn’t matter. Cecilia would watch when someone new introduced themselves to her. Diane would just shrug, smirk, and return to work. It was routine to her. But after almost six years of working there, Cecilia was still struggling. So she would watch Diane often. Diane did not bother with anyone. Instead she stayed toward the back of the greenhouses. Cecilia would stare as she sorted through boxes or swept up dead leaves. Sometimes their eyes would meet. Cecilia would blush and look away and Diane would laugh a little before returning to her work. Rarely did they speak to one another.

When Cecilia’s shift was over, she hung up her apron and her heart was heavy. She did not want to leave. Fifty small black eyes had watched her all day. They were waiting for her. Cecilia could hear them cawing. She wished she could stay in the greenhouses, hiding among the flowers, sprouting roots of her own so she would never need to leave. She could cover her body completely with leaves and flowers and hide there so no one could ever find her. When Cecilia hung up her apron, she saw Diane walking out the door. Her steps were slow, a steady saunter. Cecilia traced her eyes up Diane’s tall legs, the thick curves of her calves. For a moment, Diane looked back over her shoulder and smiled slyly. Cecilia shrunk back, turned away, and waited until Diane was gone before leaving out the back door.

Cecilia started to run, and the crows converged upon her, emerging from between branches and the tops of telephone wires. Fifty small black eyes had watched her all day. They were waiting for her. Cecilia could hear them cawing. She wished she could stay in the greenhouses, hiding among the flowers, sprouting roots of her own so she would never need to leave. She could cover her body completely with leaves and flowers and hide there so no one could ever find her. When Cecilia hung up her apron, she saw Diane walking out the door. Her steps were slow, a steady saunter. Cecilia traced her eyes up Diane’s tall legs, the thick curves of her calves. For a moment, Diane looked back over her shoulder and smiled slyly. Cecilia shrunk back, turned away, and waited until Diane was gone before leaving out the back door.

Cecilia started to run, and the crows converged upon her, emerging from between branches and the tops of telephone wires. Fifty small black eyes had watched her all day. They were waiting for her. Cecilia could hear them cawing. She wished she could stay in the greenhouses, hiding among the flowers, sprouting roots of her own so she would never need to leave. She could cover her body completely with leaves and flowers and hide there so no one could ever find her. When Cecilia hung up her apron, she saw Diane walking out the door. Her steps were slow, a steady saunter. Cecilia traced her eyes up Diane’s tall legs, the thick curves of her calves. For a moment, Diane looked back over her shoulder and smiled slyly. Cecilia shrunk back, turned away, and waited until Diane was gone before leaving out the back door.

Cecilia started to run, and the crows converged upon her, emerging from between branches and the tops of telephone wires. Fifty small black eyes swooped down to encircle her. Wheeling round and round. She shut her eyes and kept running, crying out to anyone who could hear her. The crows came closer, cloaking her, clutching onto her arms and legs. Cecilia was wrapped up in a whirlwind of wings, a chorus of caws, clamoring and clinging. Talons tore through flesh. Fifty small black eyes had swallowed her whole. But Cecilia kept running. Cecilia tried to shake them free, swinging her shoulders and spreading her arms, wailing and wailing in a frantic frenzy. Her voice soared above the uproar of dissonant cries. She shouted for them to stop. She would not give in. Fifty small black eyes still swarmed her. The crows could not obey. Cecilia ripped them free from her flesh, pulling them from her frame with clenched teeth to bite back the pain. She tossed them to the ground. Plead for them to go away. Six small black eyes fled. Cecilia fought with the rest of the flock all
the way back to her apartment. She would not let them win.

Forty-four small black eyes. Cecilia counted. The crows watched her the next day outside the garden center as she tied her apron around her waist and spoke with the customers. Diane had held the door for her, had asked her how her day was. Cecilia had said nothing, only nodding. Conversation came a little easier to her when she could make out the faces hiding behind all the pots and plants the customers carried. Cecilia tried to stand on her tip-toes to see their faces more clearly. She wished she wasn’t so short. But she succeeded. She smiled at them. She saw only a few of the customers smile back.

From the corner of her eye, Cecilia would watch Diane work at the back of the greenhouse, watering some of the flowers there. Cecilia imagined the two of them taking care of the flowers together. She envisioned her arms poised the same way Diane’s were whenever she raised the watering can. Cecilia watched Diane as she watered each aster, each mum, counting them, pretending to move her hands with the same grace she did. Lifting, turning the can carefully as not to drown any of the flowers. The water was carried through the cap at the end of the spout with every precise motion of Diane’s forearm, guiding the droplets into the soil. Then, with small steps, she would glide from one row of flowers to the next. It was only when she heard Diane’s polite, quiet laughter that Cecilia realized she had been staring directly at her, looking directly into her eyes for a very long time. Diane’s eyes were deep and dark as dirt. Cecilia started to say something, but turned away and returned to work. Diane’s eyes lingered on her for a while longer before she did the same, still laughing lightly. It was not a cruel sound, like the cawing of the crows.

Cecilia came home to her apartment in the evening, blanketed in the black, silky feathers of forty-four small black eyes. It was raining. She tossed her coat aside and stepped toward her living room window, wincing with pain as the crows clung to her. The window was wide, with big eyelet curtains cascading over the panes. Cecilia pulled the curtains apart and pushed open the casement windows, wringing her hands around the handles. The windows were heavy but she persisted, pushing them open a little wider with each precise motion of her forearms. Cecilia pushed until she could feel the rain glide over her scarred hands and wrists all the way down her elbows. For the first time, Cecilia saw the city from her top floor apartment. Dark clouds danced above the skyline, swirling and shifting. She saw how so many thin trees branched between the buildings, weaved together with telephone wires. Soon the clouds came low
and covered the city like a duvet, misting between the streets and avenues. The rain was warm. Cecilia started to shake off the crows, moving her elbows up and down and flapping her whole arms outward. She spread out her hands, her fingers, and felt forty-four small black eyes roll off her like water. Cecilia shut her eyes and did not think about the crows, concentrating only on the rain. The coalesced crows started to peel from her. She kept her eyes closed and counted down from fifty. Cecilia prayed the crows would be gone when she ran out of numbers. But when she opened her eyes and examined her body there were still twenty-two other eyes blinking back at her. Cecilia watched the other half fly away, swallowed up by the city. She counted them on her fingers.

Twenty-two small black eyes. Twenty-two small black eyes watched Cecilia from outside the glass windows of the garden center. But Cecilia did not return their gaze. She tried not to think about them. She was too busy with her customers the next morning. She managed to move her lips the way she wanted to each time they approached the counter, her hands poised calmly near the cash register. Cecilia no longer needed to stand on her tip-toes to see the faces of the customers which drifted in and out of the greenhouse. She learned to see between the gaps in the pots and plants. Cecilia studied each of customers’ faces carefully, tracing her eyes along the curves of their lips. The curve of their brows. Their eyes. Cecilia stared directly into their eyes. No longer did they seem to her the same person over and over. She counted each customer who drifted through the line, talking with them, and saying just the right thing. She would smile, raise her voice, and laugh. The customers smiled and laughed with her. She counted their money and gave them their change and made small talk. When all the customers were gone, Cecilia practiced her penmanship on receipt paper. She practiced writing Diane’s name in the prettiest cursive she could manage. She counted each receipt as she rolled them up into crumbled little balls and discarded them. When Diane asked her how she was doing, she hid the paper in her apron and said she was fine. She did not look away.

Twenty-two small black eyes. Twenty. Eighteen. Sixteen. Cecilia counted down. Each night after work, Cecilia hung her coat on the little hook next to her front door. She had begun to clean her apartment, picking up all the errant, unwashed clothes. Each night she pulled back the eyelet curtains and pushed open her wide, living room window. The window was heavy, but she kept pushing, kept persisting. Cecilia kept pushing until she could feel the rain glide down her eyes and fall from her face. Cecilia spread out her arms. She
spread out her hands, spread out her fingers, and felt feathers roll off her like water. She counted down each crow flying away from her. She counted them on her fingers. Fourteen. Twelve. Ten small black eyes. Only five crows were watching her from outside the garden center the next morning when she tied on her apron, ready to work.

When work was slow, Cecilia continued to practice her penmanship. She studied each letter carefully, imagining the image of it in her mind. D-I-A-N-E. Cecilia counted each time she brought the pen down, finishing each stroke with a flourish. She would weave the letters together with the ink, over and over. Only when she was ready did she switch to stationary. Cecilia wrote to Diane. Cecilia wrote to Diane to ask if she would like to come over to her apartment one evening after work. For a visit. She could bring flowers, Cecilia suggested. She could bring asters and mums and they could water them together. Lifting, turning their cans carefully as not to drown any of the flowers. Then, with small steps, the two of them could glide from one row of flowers to the next. Together, they could decorate Cecilia’s apartment with asters and mums and hide among them. They could sprout roots of their own and never need to leave the apartment, entangling one another and weaving their bodies as one. Cecilia and Diane could cover their bodies completely with flowers and hide there, together, so no one could ever find them. Cecilia left the note for Diane to find at the back of the greenhouse, perched between the tray stands. From the corner of her eye, she watched while Diane took the note and read it. Cecilia hid behind some shrubs, peeking between the branches.

Diane titled her head and narrowed her eyes. She was taken aback by the beauty of the letters as each leaned lovingly into the other. Black ink formed crescent curves, the lines waning with every stroke until only thin wisps remained. She looked up from the note and saw Cecilia waving at her. When Diane came closer, she could see the deep scars and scratches wisping out from Cecilia’s sleeves across her skin. Ten small black eyes saw Diane take Cecilia by the hand and show her how to water the flowers.

Ten small black eyes. Ten small black eyes watched while Diane took Cecilia to the back of Greene’s Gardens and showed her how to water the flowers. Diane lifted her watering can carefully and placed it in Cecilia’s arms. She showed Cecilia how to lift the spout of the watering can and send the droplets of water down into the soil. Diane hugged her from behind, guiding Cecilia’s hands while they went from row to row. The can felt light in Cecilia’s hands. It was filled with water, but it felt light. Weightless. The water was warm. Cecilia glided from flower to flower, pouring gently. With her eyes, Cecilia traced the curve of the spout and followed the water down into the soil. Diane watched
her. Together, for a moment, Cecilia forgot all about the crows and the customers. Then closing time came. Cecilia and Diane hid amid the flowers of the greenhouse, tangling arms and legs together. Cecilia liked the contrast between her big body and Diane’s tall, toned figure. The two of them kissed for hours, keeping the crows away. Soon this would be routine, touching when no one was watching them.

Ten small black eyes. Eight. Six. Cecilia came home from the garden center and hung her coat in her closet. The apartment was cleaner now. As she approached the living room window, the remaining crows clung tightly to her. But she endured the pain without wincing. Her scars and scratches were starting to heal. Her hands wrung the handles and pushed hard. The window did not feel heavy. It was weightless to her. Cecilia leaned out as far as she could from the window without falling. She saw the city stretch out for miles, bordered by the Vermont mountains. Clouds came down from the peaks, perched atop buildings, and poured into the streets. Cecilia started to fly. She raised her hands and brought them back down to her sides, beating her arms up and down. Slowly at first, then faster, a firm rhythm to rid the rest of the crows from her frame. She twisted her body tumultuously, so wild and free. Cecilia counted down as small black eyes fell from her body and flew out the window into the night. It was raining, and Cecilia smiled as the water washed over her. Diane had promised to visit her tomorrow evening. The two of them would ride the bus home from work, nestled together with chins on shoulders. Cecilia shut her eyes tightly. Four small black eyes. Two. When Cecilia went to bed, there was but a single black crow resting on her chest. She draped her arms around it and held it close.

Two small black eyes. Two small black eyes followed Cecilia while she walked through soft falling rain to the bus stop the next morning. The sky was clearing. The last crow came aboard the bus with her, still huddled close to her chest. But her whole body felt light. Weightless. Two small black eyes waited for her outside the garden center while she tugged her apron around her waist and started to work. Cecilia did not look back at the crow. She concentrated on her customers, smiling and studying their faces. Everyone smiled back at her as she made small talk, learning their names. Cecilia would ask them about their gardens. What were they growing? And how could she help? Cecilia wished them well while they walked out the door. She was starting to learn the names of her co-workers now, even though she knew most would be gone when the week was over. But some of them stayed. Cecilia would wave to Diane when
she wasn’t busy at the back of the greenhouse, beckoning her over. The two would talk and laugh, touching and kissing when they could. In the evening, Diane would come by her apartment. She always brought flowers with her, and the two would water them together. Soon Cecilia’s apartment was filled with foliage and flowers, every corner crowded with asters and mums. Diane helped her decorate. But two small black eyes were still watching.

Cecilia came home from the garden center and found the last crow looking up at her from her living room floor. The crow was waiting for her, watching her with its small black eyes. The rain had stopped but its feathers were wet. With one finger she crouched and counted. One crow. Cecilia brought her finger down the bird’s back, stroking it softly. Her hands closed around the crow and she held it to her chest. With a towel, Cecilia dried the crow’s small, black body. She kissed its wings. When the crow was ready to fly, she walked it to the window. Cecilia cupped the crow in her hands. “Good bye.” She whispered and shut her eyes.

She shut her eyes and counted down from fifty on her fingers. When she ran out of numbers, Cecilia opened her eyes and saw the last crow was gone.
PAIN, PRIDE, & RENEWAL: HOW LANGSTON HUGHES EMBODYED THE HARLEM RENAISSANCE

Noah Standish

Abstract

The memory of the twentieth century African American poet, playwright, and novelist Langston Hughes is accompanied by a fervent legacy that embodies the massive cultural and artistic movement known today as the Harlem Renaissance. A historical view of Hughes’s body of work portrays a renewed sense of passion and cultural expression within black America—a reflection of an unwavering sense of pride that contrasted a historically abrasive society rooted in racial prejudice. This paper cites close reading and literary analysis of Hughes’s poetry, discussing symbolism, voice, and ongoing racial tension within a broader context of the then-forthcoming Civil Rights Movement of the 1950s and 1960s. Following the efforts of other prominent figures, including W.E.B. Du Bois and Booker T. Washington, Hughes’s works reflect the pain of a minority group inherently unwelcome, the pride of African American history, and a cultural explosion amid Harlem, New York, that acted as both a passionate display of black America and a catalyst for future social movements. In reflection of the Harlem Renaissance, the poetry of Langston Hughes acts as a precursor for the likes of later civil rights activism while also connecting black America to the beginnings of humanity—deftly articulating a cultural movement that sparked a lasting, deafening plea for equal citizenship and an unapologetic confrontation of racial injustice.

The American 1920s was an era defined by exuberance and a lively deferment of looming racial tension. At the turn of the century, brick walls and concrete walkways evoked an unprecedented sense of inspiration across the country that followed the aftermath of the U.S. Civil War, but nowhere did it resonate as strongly as it did in Harlem, New York. In the wake of the Great Migration, the northern-Manhattan borough hosted a historic artistic movement that would later become known as the Harlem Renaissance. An abundance of activity fostered a renewal of interpersonal respect, racial pride, and artistic expression within the African American community that set a foundation for future activism while establishing a tone of dignity and racial equality in a nation that had never entertained such a thought. Amid the streets of Harlem, poet, playwright, and activist Langston Hughes was unparalleled in his ability to articulate prejudice and dismay within a systemically fractured so-
ciety—granting this chapter of American history a sense of immortality. Standing beside revered figures such as W.E.B. Du Bois, Nella Larsen, and Claude McKay, Hughes’s depiction of African American pride was instrumental to the Harlem Renaissance’s theme of artistic renewal and racial pride. From the Renaissance’s rise to long after its decline in the 1930s, Hughes was not merely correlated with the movement, but a figure inherently representative of what it stood for: a portrayal of a newly inspired, unapologetic voice of black America. With the poems “The Negro Speaks of Rivers,” “I, Too,” and “Harlem,” Hughes represents the movement’s gaze into the future and an unflinching grip of the past. The poetry of Langston Hughes deftly embodies the Harlem Renaissance’s goal of turning historical pain into racial pride and artistic renewal, while his lasting reverence mirrors black America’s fervent wave of expression and confrontation of historical racism—the effects of which would be felt for decades.

The infancy of Langston Hughes’s life came amidst a historical period riddled with racial prejudice. More than four thousand reported lynchings occurred between 1877 and 1950—one of many factors that led to thousands of African Americans fleeing north in search of sanctuary (EJI). When W.E.B Du Bois first coined the term “double consciousness” in his 1903 collection of essays, “The Souls of Black Folk,” his references to cultural scrutiny and layered identities of African Americans were not ponderings, but assertions of a cultural default. Within the publication, Du Bois emphasized a perspective of impatience, writing that, “[the American Negro] simply wishes to make it possible to be both a Negro and an American without…having the doors of opportunity closed roughly in his face” (3). Such an acknowledgement of collective frustration furthered a foundation onto which Hughes would build his own legacy.

As the art of the Harlem Renaissance began to flourish in 1919, the display of culture represented a euphoria that juxtaposed the inescapable effects of the movement’s morbid precedent. Zora Neale Hurston later referenced this dichotomy in 1933, writing, “every phase of Negro life is highly dramatised [sic]. No matter how joyful or how sad the case…no little moment passes unadorned” (Gates 1041). Over the decades proceeding the Harlem Renaissance, this scrutiny and dramatization had cemented the status of racial prejudice and created the necessity of a passionate response; at its core, the Renaissance was a movement that wanted to see this injustice remedied. Among other things, it demanded an answer to one central question: How could African Americans prove they are worthy of respect and full citizenship if they had never before been given a breath to speak? The art the movement evoked was undeniably
a fervent—if not angry—answer, as an empty stage was quickly filled with fiction, jazz, blues, paintings, and of course, poetry, representing a progression of black culture previously unfathomable. During the later years of Hughes’s adolescence, the earliest years of the Harlem Renaissance was led with a determined gaze by one of his most celebrated pieces of poetry, “The Negro Speaks of Rivers.”

Langston Hughes was eighteen years old when “The Negro Speaks of Rivers” was first published in The Crisis, the official magazine of the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People (NAACP), in 1921. With the poem, Hughes crafted a metaphor using some of the world’s most historic rivers. He painted a picture of his heritage while traveling to Mexico by train on a route parallel to the Mississippi River. He wrote in the first person: “I’ve known rivers ancient as the world. / I bathed in the Euphrates when dawns were young. / I built my hut near the Congo and it lulled me to sleep. / I looked upon the Nile and raised the pyramids above it. / I heard the singing of the Mississippi when Abe Lincoln went down to New Orleans…” (See Appendix A for the full poem). Hughes first mentioned the Euphrates, which is often acknowledged by historians as a birthplace of civilization in western Asia, before referencing the Congo and the Nile in Africa. He then referenced the Mississippi River as a representation of the American Midwest and its association with slavery. Hughes also alluded to Abraham Lincoln’s historic witnessing of a slave auction in New Orleans in 1828, an experience that later influenced his tenure as U.S. president; the Emancipation Proclamation was signed into law by Lincoln in 1863. Starting at the Euphrates, the four rivers in the poem are referenced specifically in this order because they are meant to be interpreted chronologically, Lincoln’s revelation being the most recent to Hughes at the time of the poem’s fruition. Hughes indirectly described the history of African Americans as a link to the birth of mankind by implying he had known each of these rivers himself. The “I” in the poem is not Hughes, but a collective speaker that linked both himself to his ancestors and black America as a whole to prior generations of human history. The speaker does not know rivers—he has known rivers; African Americans are not just a part of humanity—they always have been. With the publication of “The Negro Speaks of Rivers,” Hughes quickly established himself as a prominent voice of the Harlem Renaissance, a position that would be continuously affirmed during the movement and far beyond its conclusion.

In a twentieth century sermon titled “For the Healing of the Nations,” Reverend Robina Marie Winbush further explored this interpretation. She described “The Negro Speaks of Rivers” as an exploration of inter-generational
connections: “Hughes writes to remind a people who had been enslaved that their history began long before 1619…[reminding] them that their [history] is not a legacy of enslavement, but that their history began along the rivers of Africa…” (Winbush 15). Winbush’s reading of the poem reinforced that Hughes had meticulously detailed a chronological history of African Americans from the beginnings of humanity to early 20th century America. This assumption, however, naturally transitions into an expectation of value in regard to one’s place within society. There is an inevitable longing for acceptance within society so much as there is frustration in its absence. For some, such frustration eventually gives way to potential disappointment, anger, and hope for future change. Thus, extending toward another challenge and another essential question the Renaissance hoped to answer: How far could the influence of nationalism reach toward a minority group that was inherently unwelcome?

Patriotism was conflicting for African Americans in the early twentieth century. With the United States’ physical reconstruction and societal integration of the Civil War’s aftermath, many were quick to express disdain in response to proposals of African Americans being granted equal citizenship. In addition, the opposing views of Booker T. Washington and W.E.B. Du Bois furthered an internal divide that was inherently counterproductive. Washington insisted in his 1895 Atlanta Exposition speech that “no race can prosper until it learns that there is as much dignity in tilling a field as in writing a poem.” He expressed a desire for black America to defer equal rights in favor of “[being] prepared for the exercise of the privileges” (Atlanta). This contrasted with the views of Du Bois, who argued that African Americans should be more urgent in their pursuit of equal rights. It was a public disagreement that portrayed black America itself as being in disagreement about how to best go about the notion of cultural desegregation. While racial integration into society had previously been evident in the Great Migration, ongoing Jim Crow laws from the late nineteenth century had further validated legal segregation, effectively counteracting social progress at the same time as Washington and Du Bois’s disagreement. This acted not only as an obstacle for the United States’ progression toward racial equality, but also as a point of reference for advocates of segregation to continue perpetuating racial prejudice—an established cultural default that was systemically oppressive. This ongoing conflict was a major cultural issue throughout Langston Hughes’s life, and his 1926 poem “I, Too” acts in-part as a contrasting hopeful rhetoric as a response that still maintains its significance today.

Akin to future pleas for unity from Dr. Martin Luther King Jr. decades later, Hughes’s “I, Too” calls attention to systemic prejudice in America while also
expressing hope for future generations. Hughes’s poem is an indirect precursor to the 1950s Civil Rights Movement, but at the height of the Harlem Renaissance, he pondered whether unity in America was inevitable, however gradual it may seem. He wrote again in the first person: “I am the darker brother. / They send me to eat in the kitchen / When company comes, / But I laugh, / And eat well, / And grow strong. / Tomorrow, / I’ll be at the table / When company comes…They’ll see how beautiful I am / And be ashamed – / I, too, am America” (See Appendix B). Eventually, he meant to say, there would be a day when everyone could eat at this metaphorical table together, and such an image would reflect the true potential of a better, more inclusive America. “They’ll see how beautiful I am and be ashamed,” but until that day, little has changed since the days of slavery, as no American should be afraid of claiming one’s own citizenship (Hughes 46). A sense of hope is further reinforced by the poem starting with “I, too, sing America,” and ending with, “I, too, am America.” Like with “The Negro Speaks of Rivers,” there is a sense of chronology in the assertion that black America is an integral part of America that should—and inevitably will—be embraced. For Hughes, the concept of patriotism cannot coexist with cultural racial prejudice; but until then, the quintessential American dream in which everyone has equal opportunity to integrate themselves into society, for many, is simply unobtainable.

This limitation, derived from consistent racial tension, not only acted as a primary factor of the Harlem Renaissance’s beginnings, but also fostered a passionate response that would continue to define black America for decades to come. The movement’s themes of pain were reflected by using the past suffering of a community as an artistic refrain; its themes of pride by articulating the unique experience of black America; its themes of artistic renewal by expressing hope for a brighter future. These themes persisted decades later as its legacy gradually shifted from articulating prejudice to speculation of a response rooted in action. The Civil Rights Act and Dr. Martin Luther King Jr.’s iconic “I Have a Dream” speech would both occur in the next forty years—within Hughes’s life. These landmark moments in civil rights activism would effectively refresh the works of the Harlem Renaissance. With the works of Hughes, the movement’s poetry was then affirmed as both an embodiment of a cultural explosion and a precursor for future activism that would go on to span multiple generations.

In 1951, Langston Hughes penned another of his most recognized poems, imagining a future America in “Harlem.” Here, Hughes described a hypothetical absence of action, questioning a somber lack of progress roughly thirty years after the Harlem Renaissance had begun. He wrote with a sense of pon-
deration and concern: “What happens to a dream deferred? / Does it dry up / like a raisin in the sun / Or fester like a sore – / And then run?” (See appendix C). With the Great Depression came the decline of Harlem as the epicenter of African American culture, but while its glamor had since faded, Hughes wondered aloud what that decline represents—if its message is simply in deferment: “Maybe it just sags / like a heavy load. / Or does it explode?” The movement’s underlying message of racial pride through artistic expression had been ingrained into the fabric of the city and into the soul of black America, but here, its status is ultimately unclear. For Hughes, the city of Harlem represented the dream of racial equality; once it is set aside in tandem with the decline of the Renaissance, what will become of this dream? Will it decay or evolve? Will it fade or be reborn? The activism that followed offered a clear answer. The poem looks to an uncertain future while holding onto the past; it pleads for the movement’s legacy to leave a long-term impact on society while acknowledging that the opposite is possible. Like the waves of activism that would continue beyond his death, Hughes expressed that progress will occur—if not fervently, then at least gradually. Regardless of whether or not he sees racial equality in his lifetime, Hughes knows it must happen someday, as a sense of stagnation would be unacceptable.

“Harlem” is comprised of just eleven lines, yet the implications reach much further. In addition to his commentary on the state of black America’s rejuvenation from inside the northern-Manhattan borough, Hughes had also unknowingly foreshadowed the famed 1954 U.S. Supreme Court case Brown vs. Board of Education, in which U.S. Congress deemed racial segregation in schools a violation of the Fourteenth Amendment of the U.S. Constitution. At the height of the case’s national spotlight, African American literature professor and scholar Arthur P. Davis described Hughes’s association with Harlem, New York, instrumental both during its time of exuberance and through its decline. Davis said Hughes’s portrayal of Harlem “is both place and symbol…Even the children know that there is still a Jim Crow coach on the Freedom Train” (Davis 282, 283). While the imagery presented in “Harlem” is melancholy—a raisin festering like a sore and smelling of rotten meat—it represents a rise and fall of a cultural revolution, creating a parallel with the struggles African Americans had endured over generations. “But what comes now?” Hughes implores. Through the use of voice, such a future of hope is within reach. The piece serves as a plea for progress after a hint of stagnation; while the actions of prominent figures such as Rosa Parks, Malcolm X, and Dr. Martin Luther King Jr. led civil rights back to the forefront of American culture in the 1950s and 1960s, perhaps Hughes had heard an answer to his question of deferment.
prior to his death in 1967. Perhaps he knew the Jim Crow coach on the Freedom Train was about to detach.

When Zora Neale Hurston wrote, “every phase of Negro life is highly dramatized, without a moment passing unadorned,” she was indirectly referring to loosely justified discrimination in the wake of Jim Crow (Gates and McKay 1041). Following the Great Migration at the turn of the twentieth century, the Harlem Renaissance saw black America fill an empty stage with a fervent wave of artistic expression and an unapologetic confrontation of historical racism. Harlem, New York, became an epicenter of African American culture that demanded an answer to black America’s most pressing concern: the cultural default of systemic oppression. The revitalization of culture also acted as a continuous source of pride that cemented the Harlem Renaissance’s place in history with each passing day, as various forms of art portrayed both pride and pleas for equality while strengthening a foundation that would later be built upon with future activism. Synonymous with the movement’s legacy is that of Langston Hughes, as his body of work grew to represent one of the largest cultural explosions in American history—and the legacies of generations that came before him. Even after almost 100 years, Langston Hughes’s poetry emphatically articulates the Harlem Renaissance’s themes of historical pain, racial pride, and artistic renewal.
WORKS CITED


APPENDIX A

“The Negro Speaks of Rivers” by Langston Hughes (1921)

I’ve known rivers:
I’ve known rivers ancient as the world and older than the flow of human blood in human veins.

My soul has grown deep like the rivers.

I bathed in the Euphrates when dawns were young,
I built my hut near the Congo and it lulled me to sleep.
I looked upon the Nile and raised the pyramids above it.
I heard the singing of the Mississippi when Abe Lincoln went down to New Orleans, and I’ve seen its muddy bosom turn all golden in the sunset.

I’ve known rivers:
Ancient, dusky rivers.

My soul has grown deep like the rivers.
APPENDIX B

“I, Too” by Langston Hughes (1926)

I, too, sing America.

I am the darker brother.
They send me to eat in the kitchen
When company comes,
But I laugh,
And eat well,
And grow strong.

Tomorrow,
I’ll be at the table
When company comes.
Nobody’ll dare
Say to me,
“Eat in the kitchen,”
Then.

Besides,
They’ll see how beautiful I am
And be ashamed—

I, too, am America.
APPENDIX C

“Harlem” Langston Hughes (1951)

What happens to a dream deferred?

Does it dry up
like a raisin in the sun?
Or fester like a sore—
And then run?
Does it stink like rotten meat?
Or crust and sugar over—
like a syrupy sweet?

Maybe it just sags
like a heavy load.

Or does it explode?
Abstract

The years 2016 and 2017 were particularly difficult and turbulent for me. My introduction into adulthood was not an easy one. I was met with extreme poverty and lost many of my friends to suicide, heroin, and murder. I turned to men to make me feel safe and supported, but my relationships often ended in abuse and dismay. I began to forget what love was like without pain or conditions. My mind had become increasingly anxious and my heart struggled to find solace. In an attempt to find myself, I decided to travel to India to study Yoga. I was determined that the lessons this journey would bring would magically transform me into the woman I so desperately desired to be. Rishikesh, India, was a truly magical place. As much as I desired to stay and leave my trauma behind me in the states, I knew there was more work to be done. I knew I had to stop running away.

After returning to the states from India, I wandered from place to place struggling to find a home. I discovered that this was what my soul was truly aching for: a home, a sanctuary. After several failed attempts, I turned to meditation to guide me in the right direction. I felt a strong urge to reach out to my dear friend Paul Spencer Nix, whom I had formed a strong bond with while I was overseas. When I asked if he knew of anyone looking for a roommate, he replied that he and his roommates were. He invited me over that day to take a look at their home.

The place was quite old with strange yet comfortably colored walls. Each of these walls were adorned with beautiful works of art and every nook and cranny was filled with sacred objects: incense, Tibetan tapestries, images of great yogis, and many objects with meanings I still do not know simply because I enjoy the mystery. More noticeable than anything was a large floor-to-ceiling poster on the wall that read “The Healing House.” Paul told me that this was the name they had given the house.

In the living room, an elderly man sat quietly reading a book on a rugged, green couch. He introduced himself to me as Jimmy, “the old man of the house.” Paul led me upstairs where some of the other roommates were residing. I quickly realized that this house was filled with men: Jimmy Smith, Jimmy Blake, Paul Nix, Trae Coker, Joseph Blake, Harry “Hart” LeGrand, and Jordan Gardner.

I hadn’t had the richest history with men. I have had men molest me in the backs of their cars. Men have stolen my money. Men have raped me. Men have lied to me. Men have convinced me that my body is not beautiful. It wasn’t long before I developed an enormous amount of anxiety around men. Surprisingly, and rather strangely, I didn’t feel this way in “The Healing House.” For the first time in many years, I felt like I belonged. I felt like I was finally
home. To this day I cannot necessarily describe why I felt this way. Perhaps it was merely intuition, the same intuition that led me to come back to the states and to reach out to Paul. I knew that this was exactly where I needed to be. I moved in that very week.

This body of work is about overcoming fear, unconditional love, communing with a higher power, and redefining home. From these divine men, I learned that I didn’t need to travel high and low for a place to call “home.” I simply needed a safe space to heal, be still, and find home within myself. I am beyond grateful that this work has allowed me to connect with the men who quickly became my teachers and brothers. It was my intention with this project to merely see and remember them always as are. I have since moved out; however, I continue to return time and time again to grow and learn with them and photograph their way of life.

I became infatuated with documenting the people in my life after being introduced to the work of Nan Goldin. The way in which I compose my portraits is inspired by painter Edward Hopper and photographers Joel Sternfeld and William Eggleston. I must also express my immeasurable gratitude and appreciation for my photo professors Gwen Walstrand, Bruce West, and Jimmie Allen for everything they have taught me and for providing such useful feedback and guidance.

Photograph by Macy Stevens.
Photograph by Macy Stevens.

Photograph by Macy Stevens.
Photograph by Macy Stevens.
Photograph by Macy Stevens.
Photograph by Macy Stevens.
Photograph by Macy Stevens.

Photograph by Macy Stevens.
Photograph by Macy Stevens.
Photograph by Macy Stevens.

Photograph by Macy Stevens.
Photograph by Macy Stevens.
Photograph by Macy Stevens.

Photograph by Macy Stevens.
Photograph by Macy Stevens.
Photograph by Macy Stevens.
Photograph by Macy Stevens.

Photograph by Macy Stevens.
Photograph by Macy Stevens.
Photograph by Macy Stevens.

Photograph by Macy Stevens.
Photograph by Macy Stevens.

Photograph by Macy Stevens.
Photograph by Macy Stevens.

Photograph by Macy Stevens.
Photograph by Macy Stevens.

Photograph by Macy Stevens.
Photograph by Macy Stevens.
Sweet Dreams

Johanna Typaldos

Abstract

I forge out my own tradition by translating my ideas about heirlooms and the act of handing items down through a family line into personal objects for preservation. I want to understand why some feel the need to hand down their personal histories and collections to the next generation. I think the idea of heirlooms lends itself to the idea of preserving part of yourself, and to me, it helps a person become immortalized. Ordinary objects can hold great power in this way; they gain a specific importance simply by being owned and used by a person close to you. Although I cannot wear my grandfather’s glasses, I can use them to recall memories and be near him again. Now that I have grown, I own several of my deceased family’s personal items. These heirlooms that have been passed on to me are kept out on a table, accessible, so I can remember and feel a connection to that person every time I handle them. I create my own version of different personal items which could be found on a table or night stand. I do not wear glasses, so my glasses become lenses in an abstract jeweler’s loop. I trap organic materials inside the lenses, immortalizing memories that are specific to my life. I created an artifact that invites further inspection; the closer you get, the more you discover. A secret lock hidden on a jewelry box highly personalizes it, making it difficult for someone who is not the owner to open. The secret inside is therefore kept safe, or preserved, until the box is opened. I use keepsake or heirloom objects to talk about this world-wide cultural phenomenon of collection, preservation, and permanence. In my work and research, I want to explore the motives and ideas behind these human rituals because I recognize my own desire to preserve delicate things such as memories, photographs, and organic materials like hair or seeds. I admit my fear of impermanence and death and my want to preserve parts of myself. I look romantically at the past and hesitantly to the future, through my own lenses, made up of my own experiences.
A container which opens only by releasing the secret lock refers to the memory of the multitudes of mysterious lidded jars and boxes crowding the vanities and dressers of matrilineal relatives—containers we children were forbidden to explore.
These containers reflect my identity—an identity formed by my family, life experiences, and memory. I look at myself through these filters and chose to pay homage to those who helped shape who I am. My grandmother wore glasses but I do not, so I made a jeweler’s loop to show my connection with her, and filled each lens with nature pieces that trigger specific memories from my childhood.
Our Isolation

Shelby Walters

Abstract

The pain and fear I felt growing up with a disability has made me feel like I must isolate myself from society. As soon as someone found out that I had a learning disability and a language impairment, I no longer belonged. My disability came before who I was as a person. It was easier to isolate myself because then I wouldn’t get a look of confusion when I tried to communicate with others. I didn’t participate in certain activities like swimming because I learned from an early experience I would need more specialized instruction with my teachers. I don’t like asking for help because when I do, I am visibly uncomfortable. It hurts because sometimes people just don’t understand me. I ask myself, “Why can’t I be like others and have a normal conversation?” I avoid situations so I don’t have to talk or make eye contact. Sometimes, I isolate myself because it’s just easier.

In my photos, I seek to capture both the comfort of inclusion and the loneliness that comes from not being normal. I have been working on a photography project at Champion Athletes of the Ozarks, an organization for children and adults with disabilities. Throughout my time working on this project, I photographed many of the activities in which they participate. Some of these included basketball, soccer, softball, running, and swimming. During my first day photographing this organization, I photographed everyone swimming. The photos I captured from those two sessions are the images that stirred the most emotions within me. Looking at those photos and capturing these moments brought me back to my childhood when I took swimming lessons. I loved the relationships these individuals had developed with the volunteers. The athletes overcame their fears by putting their trust in the volunteers. This organization allows them to participate in sport activities that they might not be able to do in other settings.

This series of photographs has been very therapeutic for me. At first, I wasn’t sure if I wanted to do this type of project. At the time, I was refusing to photograph people as my subjects. I had developed social anxiety and couldn’t bring myself to take this step. As my final senior project, I wanted to do something that would help me grow. During my first day with this group, they were swimming. I had only met the organization leader, but I went out there and I photographed candid shots. In doing so, I finally felt like I belonged.

A year later, I had a selection of photographs that included swimming, basketball, soccer, and golfing. When it came time to select photos for my senior project, all of the pictures I chose came from the swimming sessions. One of my photography friends said to me, “Shelby, these are beautiful, but what makes them even more beautiful is that this was your very first day. You knew no one, but you went out there and just did it.”

Feminist Standpoint Theory and Meghan Trainor’s “Dear Future Husband”: A Rhetorical Criticism

Kimberly Woodman

Abstract

Critical theory is often used to analyze power structures and how those structures influence society. In this rhetorical criticism, feminist standpoint theory is used to examine the messages contained in Meghan Trainor’s song “Dear Future Husband.” Feminist standpoint theory grants the idea that the amount of power an individual has influences his or her perspective. In this analysis, feminist standpoint theory provides insight into the societal position and perspective of Meghan Trainor. The lyrics of “Dear Future Husband” are subjected to analysis to determine if they represent the feminist perspective, and feminist standpoint theory is used to better understand why Trainor chose to include certain messages in this song.

Introduction

In 2014, Meghan Trainor entered the world of music with her debut song, “All About that Bass”; this song spent eight weeks leading the Billboard Hot 100 and served as a launching point for Trainor’s career as a professional songwriter (Yuan, 2016). Since its release, Trainor received a Grammy for best new artist, two Billboard music awards, and the Music Business Association’s Breakthrough Artist of the Year accolade (“Meghan Trainor,” 2018; Yuan, 2016). Trainor continues to produce successful songs today, and her influence as a major songwriter continues. For example, this year, Trainor’s song “No Excuses” reached the Billboard Hot 100 (“No Excuses,” 2018). Also, last year the American Society of Composers, Authors, and Publishers (ASCAP) granted Trainor the Vanguard Award for her role in shaping American music (Rys, 2017). In an interview with Billboard, ASCAP president Paul Williams said the following of Trainor: “From the moment we heard Meghan’s music, we knew she was a talent to be recognized” (Rys, 2017). If Trainor is shaping American music, in what ways is she using her influence? If her songs set a precedent regarding artistic and aesthetic factors, do they also act as a model in the messages they contain—do they include messages of inclusivity, respect, and human empowerment?
Some claim Trainor is using her voice as a prominent songwriter to empower women. Yuan, a writer for *Billboard*, describes Trainor as follows: “[T]wo years into sudden stardom, she’s redefining ‘maturity’ for young female stars (less skin, more trumpet playing) and creating an approachable role model for girls…” (Yuan, 2016). In their article for *People* magazine, authors Telling and Calderone claim that Trainor wrote “All About that Bass” to be the “body anthem” for other women that Trainor herself never had (2014). Feeney (2016), writer for *Time* magazine, mentions that Trainor’s song “No” offers an empowering message to women, and *Billboard* author Trust (2014) mentions that Trainor incorporates a “positive body-image message” into “All About that Bass”. Roberts, a reporter for *ABC News*, described Trainor as “a musical powerhouse known for her girl power anthems,” and asserted that “The Grammy Award winner [is] inspiring women everywhere to embrace their shape and curves” (“Meghan Trainor in Times Square,” 2016). Roberts mentioned “All About that Bass” and “Lips are Moving” as examples of Trainor’s empowering songs, and she praised Trainor for requiring her video editors to replace a photoshopped version of her music video “Me Too” with the original, unedited version. In reference to her song “No,” Roberts told Trainor, “you’ve always written good songs for others” (“Meghan Trainor in Times Square,” 2016).

Has Trainor always written empowering songs for others? Although “All About that Bass” is seen by some as an empowering anthem for women, others claim that the song contains problematic elements. For example, McKinney (2014), a writer for *Vox*, claims that although “All About that Bass” promotes the liberating message that women should accept and celebrate themselves regardless of whether their body size meets unhealthy societal expectations, the song simultaneously demeans women whose body size falls into those societal standards. “All About that Bass” is not the only song of Trainor’s that contains potentially problematic messages. According to Beaudoin, author of an opinion piece on *Mic*, “the crown jewel of Trainor’s anti-feminism is easily ‘Dear Future Husband’” (2015). “Dear Future Husband” is a song where Trainor lists out requirements for her future husband, and the messages that the song contains may be problematic (Petri, 2015). If Trainor has been incorrectly identified as a feminist role model, then it is possible her listeners may embrace the perspectives her songs exhibit, believing that those perspectives are healthy and empowering.

Determining whether the messages in Trainor’s songs are problematic requires intentional analysis. Critical theory is a useful tool in such an analysis, because with it researchers can examine power structures and how those power structures affect individuals’ perspectives. Feminist standpoint theory is a foun-
dational element of feminist critical theory; in this case, feminist standpoint theory is used to determine how Trainor’s position as a famous songwriter influences the messages she constructs in her songs. Feminist standpoint theory is also used to analyze whether these messages are problematic. Although Trainor is seen as a ground-breaking role model and feminist icon, close examination of her song “Dear Future Husband” through the lens of feminist standpoint theory reveals that the lyrics of this song further marginalize women through patriarchal language.

**Artifact**

“Dear Future Husband,” released in 2015, was written as if Trainor were addressing potential candidates for the position of her future spouse (Trainor). In the song, Trainor lists requirements for this role of life-long companion. For example, the song indicates that she wants her future husband to remember to buy her flowers every anniversary, to apologize after every fight, and to set aside time for her (Trainor, 2015). “Dear Future Husband” is an important artifact for rhetorical analysis, because if this song does not truly portray feminist messages, Trainor’s status as a feminist role model stands in jeopardy. Also, it is important that society learns to identify harmful or unhealthy messages; if the messages in “Dear Future Husband” are problematic, then they need to be identified as such in order to develop a healthier society.

**Method**

Feminist standpoint theory is an offshoot of standpoint theory, which was born from the ideas of philosophers Georg Wilhelm Friedrich Hegel, Karl Marx, and György Lukács (Cameron, 2005). Standpoint theory engages the idea that everyone has a different social position in society, and each position creates a distinct perspective. Those in inferior positions often have insights or cognitive advantages over those who are not in such positions, because those in inferior positions must learn to adapt to certain situations that more powerful individuals never face (Cameron, 2005). Another way to understand standpoint theory is through the following analogy, which originates from the ideas of standpoint theorists Marcel Stoetzler and Nira Yuval-Davis (2002): Every society has a power source that all individuals face in an attempt to gain access to power. Those close to the power source have more power, but do not have a solid perspective of the world around them because their attention is captivated by the power source directly in front of them. Less powerful, marginalized groups are far away from the power source and have a better vantage point to
understand social hierarchies, but less ability to change society because they lack access to power. Feminist standpoint theory, then, is the assertion that women have insights or cognitive advantages regarding the plight of women that men do not have (Cameron, 2005), due to women’s position relative to the power that is generally held by men.

To better understand the lyrics of “Dear Future Husband” and to gain insight into why Trainor wrote the song the way she did, feminist standpoint theory is used to explain the current position of Trainor in relation to society’s power source and to understand how Trainor’s power position influences her perspectives and attitudes. Then, an analysis of the lyrics of “Dear Future Husband” is presented, with examples of how the song’s lyrics do not represent the feminist perspective (see lyrics in Appendix A). Finally, feminist standpoint theory is used to explain why the lyrics of “Dear Future Husband” are so entrenched in patriarchal language.

**Application**

Using feminist standpoint theory as a lens, three insights into Meghan Trainor’s current position related to power can be seen. First, as a woman who previously lived in a position that was further away from society’s power source than where she is now, Trainor likely understands the marginalized situation of women and their lack of power against oppressive patriarchal attitudes. For example, in her interview with Telling and Calderone, Trainor revealed that she used to be insecure because of her body size and shared that one of her male peers in junior high suggested to her that she lose ten pounds (2014). Since she was further from the power source, Trainor experienced the impact of damaging societal messages relating to body size, but she did not have enough power to create positive change by promoting healthier standards. Now, however, Trainor’s fame and voice as a celebrity serve as an avenue for Trainor to share her experiences and fight to bring change to unhealthy societal expectations.

Second, as a woman who is now in a position of power, Trainor could use her access to the power source to drag the female perspective into the public sphere and instigate societal change; Trainor attempted to do this through her song “All About that Bass” (Telling & Calderone, 2014). Third, as someone who has moved close to the power source, Trainor faces the blindness that comes from a desire to maintain power (Kramarae, 2005); this blindness could inhibit Trainor and keep her from truly exposing the female perspective. “All About that Bass” serves as an example of this, because in this song Trainor does not fully represent the feminist perspective. While the song may provide lib-
erating messages to women with a curvy body type, in “All About that Bass,” Trainor inadvertently demeans women with thinner body types when she flip-

dantly refers to such women as skinny b****** (Trainor, 2014). Through the

rhetoric of this song, Trainor unwittingly instigates a new cycle of power—this
time not with men in a position of greater power compared to women, but
rather with curvy women in a position of greater power compared to their
thinner counterparts. When viewed through the lens of feminist standpoint
theory, Trainor demeaning slender women in “All About that Bass” can be at-
tributed to her desire to maintain power and to a newfound lack of sensitivity
toward those still marginalized (Kramarae, 2005). It is this blindness brought
by power that can also explain the marginalizing and objectifying lyrics of
“Dear Future Husband.”

The lyrics of “Dear Future Husband” do not liberate women, but rather
follow patriarchal language patterns that objectify and sexualize women, as
seen in the following three examples. The first instance of objectifying lyrics
is: Dear future husband/ if you wanna get that special lovin'/ tell me I'm beautiful
each and every night (Trainor, 2015). A second example is: After every fight/ just
apologize/ and maybe then I'll let you try and rock my body right (Trainor, 2015).
Still a third section of the song professes, I'll be sleeping on the left side of the bed
(hey)/ open doors for me and you might get some... kisses (Trainor, 2015). These
lyrics reinforce the patriarchal idea that women's bodies are objects that both
men and women use in a toxic power dynamic. Patriarchal language is so per-
vasive that it is often difficult to recognize. To discover patriarchal language, it
is useful to ask the following question: What would be possible options for a
feminist perspective in the given situation? For example, a feminist perspective
would likely see the woman represented in “Dear Future Husband” as an equal
companion, a confidante, and a friend to her husband rather than primarily as
an object for sexual gratification. A feminist perspective would likely indicate
that the woman in the song wants her husband to tell her she is beautiful not
to gain sexual favors, but rather because he wants to compliment her or simply
because he wants her to know that he thinks she is a beautiful person. This
perspective would likely avoid implying that being told she is beautiful is so
important that a woman should go to sexual means to obtain that praise. A
feminist viewpoint might profess that the woman's husband would apologize
because it is the right action to take because he values his wife and respects her
worth as a person, or because he wants to restore the relationship to what he
believes it should be. It would suggest that the husband should open doors for
his wife simply because he is being particularly considerate; the feminist per-
spective might even reveal that women are content to open doors themselves.
Some might argue that these lyrics represent the feminist perspective because they portray the woman as the one making the demands and they show the woman as having control over her own body. This argument is weak for several reasons. First, if the goal of feminism is to liberate women and raise them to an equal status with men, then these lyrics may go beyond that goal and move into the realm of women having control over men, because the lyrics demonstrate a manipulative relationship where the woman uses a system of rewards to make the man do what she desires. The goal of feminism is not to introduce another cycle of power with one party dominating or coercing the other—it is to emancipate the marginalized and create an environment of mutual respect. Second, while this description does portray the woman as having control over her own body, in other ways it portrays her as incompetent and reliant on the man—incapable of communicating in a healthy manner to resolve a conflict without resorting to manipulation and too unmotivated to open doors. Also, while the woman does have control over her body, it is at the cost of it being viewed in a sexualized and objectified manner because she uses her body as an object in exchange for the man’s desired behaviors. One of the major struggles feminists face is the reduction of objectification and sexualization of women (Papadaki, 2010). Trainor’s lyrics, however, limit the primary value of women to their sexuality, instead of recognizing women’s intellect and other admirable qualities. The words of “Dear Future Husband” reinforce linguistic oppression—they objectify and sexualize women, rather than liberate them.

The lyrics to “Dear Future Husband” are particularly problematic because they not only capture women in a rhetorical net of patriarchal language and objectification, but they simultaneously put restraints on men who are trying to break free of that same harmful net. Through her lyrics, Trainor limits men by implying that the only reason husbands would apologize or open doors or tell their wives that they are beautiful is because of sexual motivations. While “Dear Future Husband” reduces women to sexual objects, it also limits men by reducing the foundation of their characters to nothing more than a desire for sexual gratification. This becomes even more problematic when one considers that the man described in “Dear Future Husband” is allegedly Trainor’s ideal choice of a husband.

“Dear Future Husband” also showcases oppressive language that puts women in fixed, traditional roles rather than portraying the feminist perspective as dynamic and intelligent beings; women should be represented in a variety of settings rather than only the stereotypical ones. At one point in the song, Trainor declares: *Cause if you treat me right/ I’ll be the perfect wife/ buying groceries/ buy-buying what you need* (Trainor, 2015). These lyrics reinforce the
patriarchal idea that a “perfect wife” is always a laudable grocery-shopper. The feminist position, on the other hand, would likely argue that an exemplary wife is an intellectual partner to her husband, or the feminist position might not be concerned with the role of wife at all but might rather focus on other possibilities for women (such as being a business executive) that are not commonly used in the language connecting women with life roles. Also, “Dear Future Husband” does not offer an empowering representation of women as rational human beings, but rather exhibits the stereotype that women are ruled by their emotions: You gotta know how to treat me like a lady/ even when I’m acting crazy/ tell me everything’s all right (Trainor, 2015). These lyrics affirm the common male-influenced discourse that suggests women are irrational, emotionally-unstable creatures that need to be consoled. While Trainor could use her songs as a platform to represent women as resilient, dynamic, and rational beings, she is instead using her voice to reinforce stereotypes that often restrict and limit women.

**Analysis**

Why are the lyrics of “Dear Future Husband” so entrenched in patriarchal language? Why, when Trainor is seen as a feminist hero, has she not only failed to represent the feminist perspective, but also generated lyrics that are damaging toward women? Feminist standpoint theory would suggest that, through moving closer to the power source, Trainor’s perspective changed. She no longer accurately sees the perspective of marginalized women, but rather sees a biased perspective that will help her maintain her power. Since Trainor is closer to the power source, she is subconsciously catering to the ideas perpetuated from those closest to the power source in order to maintain rapport with those powerful people, and to sustain the adoration of the masses. To accurately represent the feminist perspective, Trainor must think critically, as argued by Wood: “A standpoint is achieved—earned through critical reflection on power relations and through engaging in the struggle required to construct an oppositional stance. Being a woman does not necessarily confer a feminist standpoint” (2005, p. 61). It is possible for Trainor to represent the feminist perspective, but to do so she must push aside the blindness that comes from her desire to maintain her new level in the social hierarchy.
Conclusion

Through analysis based on the feminist standpoint theory, it has become apparent that, although Trainor is seen as a feminist icon, the lyrics of “Dear Future Husband” do not perpetuate feminist ideas. Although she is a woman in a position of power, in this song, Trainor does not use her power to expose the feminist perspective, because she no longer understands that perspective. She does not use feminist language and does not challenge existing oppressive language in the areas of objectification and sexualization, and she does not challenge existing discourse regarding the stereotypical roles of women.

If women believe damaging messages that masquerade as feminist, but are in reality patriarchal, it will become harder for women to recognize the feminist perspective—much less expose that perspective to society. It is imperative that women learn to think critically, to recognize the feminist perspective, and to create messages that dismantle harmful patriarchal ideas instead of confirming those ideas. Standpoint theory implies that it is not possible for a male-dominated society to compose the feminist perspective without females providing that perspective. To break the loop of patriarchal ideas that is accepted as the standard for society, it is vital that women with power—such as Meghan Trainor—promote the female perspective.

The lyrics of “Dear Future Husband” would indicate that it may well be time for society to raise the standards on exactly what it means to be a feminist role model. If Trainor began to intentionally analyze the messages of the songs she creates, however, she could use her voice as a powerful force in the feminist movement. Instead of fortifying negative stereotypes, she could help rebuild them in a positive light. Instead of marginalizing and objectifying women, she could liberate and empower them. If Trainor begins to engage with and think critically about what feminists are fighting for, she could use her artistic genius to create anthems that truly represent and empower all women.
REFERENCES


Rys, D. (2017). ASCAP awards to honor Warren: Meghan Trainor will also receive a top accolade this year. Billboard, 129(11), 16.

Telling, G., & Calderone, A. (2014). Meghan Trainor is...‘All About that BaSs’. *People, 82*(12), 82.

Trainor, M. (2014). All about that bass. On *Title [Epic Records]*.


Appendix A

“Dear Future Husband” Meghan Trainor (2015) on Title [Epic Records].

Dear future husband
Here’s a few things
You’ll need to know if you wanna be
My one and only all my life

Take me on a date
I deserve a break
And don’t forget the flowers every anniversary
‘Cause if you’ll treat me right
I’ll be the perfect wife
Buying groceries
Buy-buying what you need

You got that 9 to 5
But, baby, so do I
So don’t be thinking I’ll be home and baking apple pies
I never learned to cook
But I can write a hook
Sing along with me
Sing-sing along with me (hey)

You gotta know how to treat me like a lady
Even when I’m acting crazy
Tell me everything’s alright

Dear future husband,
Here’s a few things you’ll need to know if you wanna be
My one and only all my life
Dear future husband,
If you wanna get that special lovin’
Tell me I’m beautiful each and every night

After every fight
Just apologize
And maybe then I’ll let you try and rock my body right
Even if I was wrong
You know I’m never wrong
Why disagree?
Why, why disagree?

You gotta know how to treat me like a lady
Even when I’m acting crazy
Tell me everything’s alright

Dear future husband
Here’s a few things
You’ll need to know if you wanna be
My one and only all my life (hey, baby)
Dear future husband
Make time for me
Don’t leave me lonely
And know we’ll never see your family more than mine

I’ll be sleeping on the left side of the bed (hey)
Open doors for me and you might get some kisses
Don’t have a dirty mind
Just be a classy guy
Buy me a ring
Buy-buy me a ring, babe

You gotta know how to treat me like a lady
Even when I’m acting crazy
Tell me everything’s alright

Dear future husband,
Here’s a few things
You’ll need to know if you wanna be
My one and only all my life
Dear future husband,
If you wanna get that special loving
Tell me I’m beautiful each and every night

Future husband, better love me right
College of Health and Human Services
Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease: Efficacy of Long-Acting Bronchodilators Combined with A Nursing-Based Clinical Approach

Kylee Farnum

Abstract

Chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD) is the fourth-leading cause of death worldwide and serves as a steadily growing healthcare problem resulting in severe morbidity and mortality (Cope et al., 2013). It is estimated that by the year 2020, COPD will develop into the third-leading cause of death, resulting in 5 million deaths per year (Cazzola, Matera, & Ora, 2015). The progression of understanding COPD and its components has steadily expanded over the past 100 years. Knowledge of the disease pathogenesis, course, prognosis, and new approaches to therapy have dramatically improved our understanding of this important clinical entity (Wang, Nie, Xiong, & Xu, 2012).

Patients with COPD experience a variety of disease symptoms. The disease pathology presents itself in a variety of ways, including airway obstruction, reduced pulmonary function, and increased lung inflammation. Symptoms experienced by the COPD patient involve labored breathing, narrowed airways, shortness of breath, and abnormally low concentrations of oxygen in the blood (Wang, Nie, Xiong, & Xu, 2012). Collectively, this causes a steady decline in health-related quality of life. Since COPD is a progressive disease, the main objective of treatment is to improve lung function, prevent and control symptoms, and ultimately improve health status (“GOLD,” 2018).

Bronchodilator medications are central to symptom management in COPD, with long-acting preparations serving as the preferred variety (Kaufman, 2013). Modern research reveals that early disease identification and treatment combined with a nursing-based clinical approach is a promising method to manage this rising concern.
Methods, Sources, Strength, and Evaluation of Evidence

The Missouri State University’s library database was the primary search tool used to achieve the literature review search. Out of the several databases available, Academic Search Complete served as the chief investigative modality. The Global Initiative for Chronic Obstructive Lung Disease (GOLD), an assessment tool used by healthcare professionals to implement effective disease diagnosis, management, and prevention strategies, provides a solid outline for this research involving patient assessment, risk factors for disease exacerbation, and comprehensive treatment strategies for the chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD) patient (“GOLD,” 2018). Scholarly journals, including the Journal of Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease, Journal of Clinical Pharmacy and Therapeutics, as well as Nursing Standard and Clinical Risk Management, served as a foundational basis for research findings.

The critical appraisal tool used to assess each individual study was the Centre for Evidence-Based Medicine (“CEBM” 2018). The United Kingdom Department for International Development was the standardized tool used to assess the strength of the body of evidence (“DFID,” 2018). Together, these tools aim to analyze the clarity of the research questions, the validity of the methods used, the validity of the study results, and the potential applicability of study verdicts.

In the literature review, information is assembled from each primary research study and their findings are evaluated regarding the clinical effectiveness of long-acting bronchodilator treatment modalities and clinical-based nursing treatments. The studies were critiqued further to determine threats to internal and external validity and to ascertain their overall viability. There were a moderate number of contextual, high-quality evidence relating to the efficacy of long-acting bronchodilator pharmacologic treatments, as well as promotional, preventive, and holistic modalities in treating the COPD patient.

Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease: Efficacy of Long-Acting Bronchodilators Combined with a Nursing-Based Clinical Approach

COPD is a progressive disease that affects more than 200 million people annually worldwide (Martino et al., 2013). It produces a significant economic burden in both direct and indirect healthcare costs in addition to causing substantial morbidity and mortality. Distinguishing factors of this disease include progressive difficulty breathing, excessive cough, mucus production, and shortness of breath (“GOLD,” 2018). This is primarily due to a chronic
overextension of the lungs, which serves as the chief pathologic mechanism of COPD (Cazzola, Matera, & Ora, 2015). Methods for COPD patient care have radically changed over the past 20 years, and several novel therapies have been discovered that have proven to significantly improve the health status of patients. In the case of moderate to severe COPD, exacerbations, or persistent symptoms, regular treatment with long-acting bronchodilators is recommended (“GOLD,” 2018). This method helps to control disease symptoms while simultaneously improving quality of life. In addition, nurses play a key role in providing education regarding both the disease and medication itself, medication administration guidelines, safety precautions, and inhaler mechanism care.

Although the earliest references to COPD were recorded in the early 1600s, it was not until 1846 when John Hutchinson invented the diagnostic tool of the spirometer that the disease was formally diagnosed (Kaufman, 2013). Then, in 1959, the American Thoracic Society Committee on Diagnostic Standards Convention was the first entity to label the clinical definition of COPD (Martino et al., 2013). In earlier times, the only therapies that were readily available for disease treatment included antibiotics for pneumonia, mucus thinners, and various bronchodilators (Wang, Nie, Xiong, & Xu, 2012). Nonetheless, shortly thereafter in the 1960s, the first long-acting bronchodilator was used as a clinical intervention (Cope et al., 2013). Over the past five decades, additional treatment options have arisen, including antimuscarinic agents, oxygen therapy, and pulmonary rehabilitation; nonetheless, the use of long-acting bronchodilators has been demonstrated to be the most effective method and has thus secured its place as the universal standard treatment modality.

Long-acting bronchodilators serve a variety of effective clinical functions. Thus, there are many reasons why this has remained the chief management choice for COPD in past decades. These medications work by stimulating respiratory muscle relaxation which in turn opens constricted airways, effects of which can last for up to 12 hours or more (Martino et al., 2013). Studies show that utilizing various combinations of diverse long-acting bronchodilators can enhance the effects of other medication and treatment alternatives as well (Cope et al., 2013). Benefits of these anti-inflammatory medications include significantly reduced COPD respiratory symptoms at rest or with exercise, improved expiratory volume, reduced forced vital capacity, fewer acute exacerbations, decreased inflammation, and increased overall life quality (Wang, Nie, Xiong, & Xu, 2012). Due to the prolonged effects and consistent history of clinical success long-acting bronchodilators have on opening airways, promoting adequate respiration, and improving oxygenation long-term, this method
reigns as the premiere foundational choice for successful COPD management. The nurse plays a vital role in ensuring the success of this medical intervention. The nurse should educate the patient on the medication itself, administration guidelines, safety precautions, and inhaler mechanism care. First and foremost, the nurse should explain the purpose of the medication, the pharmacologic mechanism of action, potential side effects, and safety administration precautions (Kaufman, 2013). Additional instruction elements include taking the inhaled medication before meals as well as before and after exertion. Although a variety of different preparations exist, the most common inhaler requires the patient to shake the canister prior to use, deeply exhale before administration, fully seal the lips around the mouthpiece, and inhale slowly and deeply. The patient should also hold their breath for at least 10 seconds before expelling the inhaled medication (Martino et al., 2013). It is essential that the patient be familiar with appropriate storage and cleansing methods, such as storing the medication in a dry environment with a mild temperature, in addition to cleansing the inhaler with warm soapy water to ensure the inhaler is not compromised and functions to its fullest capability (Cazzola, Matera, & Ora, 2015). This educational supplement, provided under the direction of the nurse, can greatly enhance treatment direction and efficacy for the COPD patient.

**Clinical Intervention Presentation**

COPD is categorized by poorly reversible airflow obstruction and abnormal inflammatory responses in the lungs. This is primarily due to long-term exposure to noxious chemicals and gases, predominantly tobacco smoke. This augmented response to particulate exposure results in the hypersecretion of mucus, tissue destruction, as well as narrow airway inflammation and fibrosis (Wang, Nie, Xiong, & Xu, 2012). These pathological alterations increase resistance to airflow, which increases the compliance of the lung and produces air trapping, in addition to progressive airflow obstruction (Martino et al., 2013).

More than 11 million people have been formally diagnosed with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease, while it is estimated that 65 million people currently suffer from this ailment. In 2015 alone, more than three million people died from this illness. It is projected that total deaths from COPD will increase more than 30% in the next decade unless pressing action is taken to diminish underlying risk factors, particularly tobacco use, and provide effective education and treatment for affected persons (Townsend, Bennett, & Harding, 2016). This disease develops slowly and progressively worsens over time. In the
earliest stages of disease, symptoms may be minimal or non-existent (Wang, Nie, Xiong, & Xu, 2012). This complicates the implementation of early prevention and treatment strategies. Therefore, becoming aware of personal risk factors, such as tobacco use, is crucial for ensuring the greatest success with a COPD diagnosis ("GOLD," 2018).

The principal risk factor for contracting COPD is tobacco use, accounting for up to 90 percent of COPD-related deaths according to the American Lung Association (ALA) (Kaufman, 2013). Research shows that people who consume tobacco products are 13 times more likely to die from COPD as opposed to those who have never previously smoked (Kaufman, 2013). Long-term tobacco smoke exposure is exceedingly dangerous, and every exposure increases the risk of developing COPD. Furthermore, exposure to secondhand smoke can be equally hazardous (Cazzola, Matera, & Ora, 2015). Therefore, eliminating these sources can improve a COPD patient’s status significantly.

Inflammation is the normal defensive response to inhaled toxins and is further amplified in the patient with COPD. These inflammatory and structural changes persist even after smoking cessation, and the progression of destruction corresponds with disease severity. The two primary pathogenic processes involved with COPD include the imbalance between proteases and anti-proteases in addition to the imbalance between oxidants and antioxidants (Siafakas & Celli, 2016).

Cigarette smoke and exposure to toxins trigger the inflammatory process, which releases an increased number of proteases and inactivates several anti-proteases via oxidation, which creates a pathologic imbalance. Regarding oxidation, oxidative affliction is considerably increased in COPD patients (Wang, Nie, Xiong, & Xu, 2012). When exposed to tobacco smoke and other noxious chemicals, inflammatory cells release a superfluous source of oxidants resulting in oxidant and antioxidant imbalance. This can lead to oxidative stress which can stimulate excess mucous production and increase the risk of exacerbation. These pathologic mechanisms result in the disease characteristics found in COPD (Martino et al., 2013). These altered chemical processes result in excess mucous production, obstruction of airflow, air trapping, abnormalities in gas exchange, pulmonary hypertension, and many other systemic effects such as skeletal muscle wasting and cardiovascular disease (Siafakas & Celli, 2016).
LONG-ACTING BRONCHODILATOR ADMINISTRATION AND NURSING SUPPORT

The patient with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease presents their own unique features and corresponding complications. Many COPD patients do not seek medical attention until late in the disease course. This is due to the gradual progressive nature of COPD. Therefore, the patient can temporarily adapt their lifestyle to minimize disease symptoms such as dyspnea, cough, and sputum production for a significant amount of time (Wang, Nie, Xiong, & Xu, 2012). When the patient finally reaches a point where clinical intervention is needed, they normally present with an assortment of symptoms. Common comorbidities include chronic bronchitis, emphysema, and a reactive airway disease (“GOLD,” 2018). These ailments present themselves with progressive cough, dyspnea, exercise intolerance, sputum production, breathlessness, wheezing, and alteration in mental status (Martino et al., 2013).

There are competencies that must be possessed by the nurse in order to effectively administer long-acting bronchodilator therapy to the COPD patient. Specific nursing responsibilities regarding medication administration, in addition to patient and family teaching, serve as key components of this nursing-based approach. Before pharmacologic administration, the nurse should assess the patient for allergies and peak flow readings, and complete a full respiratory assessment to determine a baseline for post-administration comparison (Cope et al., 2013). The nurse should inquire about current medications the client is taking as well as past medical and surgical history. The primary rationale behind this assessment is to identify any history of cardiac problems and potential pharmacologic contraindications. Furthermore, the nurse should ensure that the patient and family are aware of the proper inhalation technique (Kaufman, 2013). A basic regimen includes administering the bronchodilator and then waiting five minutes before the next dosage, or before the next inhaled drug. This enhances the efficacy of the bronchodilator treatment due to the increasingly open airways (Wang, Nie, Xiong, & Xu, 2012).

Post-administration of long-acting bronchodilators is primarily centered upon a nursing assessment. This includes monitoring the clinical intervention’s effectiveness via a thorough respiratory assessment, and then comparing those findings to baseline values. It is also important for the nurse to monitor for side effects (Martino et al., 2013). This can be accomplished by taking vital signs and observing for tachycardia, increased blood pressure, tremors, and chest pain. It is standard practice that, if utilizing peak flow readings, these values should improve at least 15% after the first round of bronchodilator medication.
Regarding patient and family teaching, there are several things that should be communicated by the nurse. The overall goal is that patients will know how to appropriately administer their long-acting bronchodilator drugs through proper devices. The nurse can start by informing the patient of these medications and their intended uses. It is important to teach the patient how to record and monitor the intensity and frequency of their symptoms, their peak flow rate, and how often they utilize their long-acting bronchodilator (Martino et al., 2013). Patients should also be taught how to recognize emergency situations, and the proper protocols to follow; this includes never doubling up on a dose of medication and contacting their primary healthcare provider if they cannot obtain sufficient symptom relief (Wang, Nie, Xiong, & Xu, 2012). Lastly, nurses should educate patients on the mechanics of the inhaler technology and how to properly clean and operate said equipment, for example, cleansing inhalers with warm, soapy water and ascertaining the amount of medication in the inhaler by placing the inhaler in a bowl of water, where an indication of a full inhaler is when the inhaler unrestrictedly sinks to the bottom (Cazzola, Matera, & Ora, 2015).

Nursing Interventions

There are many nursing interventions that can be implemented that support the clinical intervention of administering long-acting bronchodilators in the treatment of COPD. Collectively, this clinical intervention plan focuses on appropriate medication administration, smoking cessation, nutrition, exercise, and supplementary support.

First and foremost, ensuring proper medication management is perhaps the most important step (Martino et al., 2013). This entails that the nurse properly educates the patient and the patient’s family regarding the precise types of medications prescribed by the physician, the rationale behind why those specific medications were selected, the pharmacologic mechanism of action, exact dosages as well as any additional administration instructions, and potential adverse effects. Furthermore, prior to discharge, it is of the utmost importance that the nurse administers said medications abiding by safe patient medication administration rites and other customary clinical protocols such as the hallmark “the right patient, the right time, the right medication, the right dose, and the right route” standard (Wang, Nie, Xiong, & Xu, 2012).

Regardless of the progression of the disease, smoking cessation has been proven to lengthen life (Kaufman, 2013). Unfortunately, lost lung function (“GOLD,” 2018).
cannot be regained; however, the cessation of smoking has been proven to significantly decline the deceleration of lung function and therefore serves as a vital part of the nurse’s role in COPD patient care (“GOLD,” 2018). Although this is a difficult undertaking, success is possible. Specific training in counseling patients on smoke cessation methods, such as nicotine replacement therapy, is becoming increasingly prevalent in the clinical workplace (Martino et al., 2013).

Imbalanced nutrition is often an unfortunate consequence of COPD that contributes to heightened clinical complications, deteriorated physical performance, and overall decline in prognosis. COPD patients most often experience anorexic effects due to hypoxia; thus, malnourishment is the most common dietary issue encountered (Wang, Nie, Xiong, & Xu, 2012). The nurse can collaborate with a registered dietitian to address this issue by exploring both the patient and family’s usual dietary habits, formulate an effective meal plan, and counsel the patient to incorporate high-protein and high-calorie food choices (Martino et al., 2013). In addition, nurses can advise that patients take supplemental vitamins and other prepackaged food supplements that are good sources of both protein and calories that can be consumed in between meals (Cope et al., 2013). Ingesting smaller and more frequent meals that are easy to chew and swallow further conserve energy.

Keeping active helps maintain general fitness and overall well-being. Breathlessness, perhaps the most common and severe side effect of COPD, can be very distressing and is prevalent during physical activity. However, the patient should continue to be encouraged to carry out frequent moderate exercise to enhance and maintain optimal lung function (Siafakas & Celli, 2016). The nurse can be a great asset in formulating an individualized exercise program that best suits the patient’s personal abilities and preferences, level of illness, and personal resources.

To prevent ineffective breathing patterns and ineffective airway clearance, the nurse can encourage the patient to use coordinated breathing techniques. Such methodologies include pursed-lip breathing, tripod position, and abdominal breathing. These practices help to control labored breathing and anxiety while simultaneously enhancing inspiration and expiration during breathing and reducing overall air-trapping (Kaufman, 2013). Additionally, the nurse can educate the patient on employing effective coughing maneuvers, such as the huff coughing technique, that can successfully clear the airway and adequately meet oxygen demands (Martino et al., 2013). The nurse should also encourage adequate fluid intake to keep respiratory secretions mobile.

Respiratory infections, responsible for producing acute disease exacerba-
tions, serve as one of the most common complications of COPD. Such infections can lead to an increased respiratory rate, irritated mucosa, and increased mucus production (Wang, Nie, Xiong, & Xu, 2012). Therefore, the nurse should evaluate the patient's knowledge of personal care measures and ensure the patient's well-informed of proper cleansing techniques for inhalant and nebulizer equipment. Additional measures that can be taken to prevent infection include avoiding large crowds, especially during influenza seasons, avoiding others with respiratory infections, remaining up-to-date with influenza and pneumonia vaccines, and being proactive with contacting the health care provider and seeking treatment if infection is suspected (“GOLD,” 2018).

Many clients suffering from COPD experience several obstacles due to the severity and longevity of this disease. Such challenges include financial hardship related to medical treatment and therapies, caregiver burden due to the complexities and time-consuming nature of care, and overall isolation as a result of the physical limits COPD places on the affected individual (Siafakas & Celli, 2016). By providing tactful inquiries, the nurse can assess the patient and family's ability to cope and provide necessary support. The nurse can also aid in providing home and lifestyle modifications, social service referrals, and contact information for support groups and organizations with COPD affiliations that can further aid these patients on an individual basis and provide a network of others who can provide additional provision.

**Holistic Nursing Care and Rehabilitation**

Although research indicates that treatment with long-acting bronchodilators is the most effective clinical intervention in the treatment of chronic obstructive pulmonary disease, there are other holistic and rehabilitation options available that can be used concurrently and treat the patient comprehensively. Such treatment options include smoking cessation, diet and exercise, acupuncture, and natural herbal supplements such as thyme and ginseng (Martino et al., 2013).

Smoking cessation is one of the best implementations that decreases disease advancement and preserves lung function. Research shows that quitting smoking significantly improves longevity of pulmonary health (Wang, Nie, Xiong, & Xu, 2012). Concerning COPD, smoking rapidly accelerates the disease process and exponentially deteriorates lung viability (Cazzola, Matera, & Ora, 2015). Although ceasing use of tobacco products can often be a difficult endeavor, the outcome is undoubtedly worth the effort. Nurses can play a primary role in helping patients by formulating smoking cessation plans in
addition to making appropriate referrals.

In COPD and other extraneous health issues alike, implementing a healthy diet and good exercise regimen can prove to be an extremely successful form of preventative medicine. Even in patients who suffer from limited mobility, simple exercise routines can be incredibly beneficial. Studies show that even walking 30 minutes a day significantly improves cardiovascular function, which in turn, improves body oxygenation (Martino et al., 2013). Other alternative forms of physical activity include yoga and tai chi.

Acupuncture is considered an exceptionally holistic approach. Although it is not as commonly practiced in the Western hemisphere as it is in other parts of the world, its effects cannot be overstated. It is a practice that has existed for hundreds of years, and many studies worldwide showcase the efficacy of this method through extensive research (Kaufman, 2013). Commonly practiced in Japan, acupuncture studies have shown that this modality has the potential to decrease breathlessness, relax respiratory muscles, decrease inflammation, and ultimately facilitate enhanced respiration in COPD patients (Siafakas & Celli, 2016).

To date, a plethora of natural supplements are readily available that meet a wide array of health needs. Specifically pertaining to COPD, a wide variety of vitamins and nutrients exist that aid in the reduction of inflammation within the airways, reduce phlegm production and cough, and promote natural breathing. Such supplements include N-Acetylcysteine (NAC), Vitamin D, and Bromelain (Imran, Kotwani, & Chhabra, 2015). Such supplements can prove to be a great resource for patients; they are cost effective, easily accessible, and aid in not only treating COPD symptoms, but also in promoting overall health and wellness.

Holistic medicine focuses on treating the body as a cohesive whole to combat illness. The primary goals of implementing natural remedies into the COPD care regimen are to promote airway clearance, reduce mucus production, and to decrease inflammation. Such therapies include lobelia, oregano, eucalyptus, ginger, rosemary, lungwort, and osha root (Wang, Nie, Xiong, & Xu, 2012). These preparations help relax the airways to relieve congestion and cough, to promote breathing, to reduce irritation, to strengthen the immune system, to improve pulmonary circulation, and to provide supplementary vitamins and minerals (Martino et al., 2013).
Health Promotion and Maintenance

For the patient with COPD, assigning health promotion and maintenance as a priority can significantly slow disease advancement and help maintain optimal health. In theory, all varieties of COPD could be prevented with universal smoking cessation and eliminating all environmental respiratory irritants (Martino et al., 2013). Although currently this is not the case, continued efforts can and should be made to educate all persons regarding respiratory aggravations and dangers. The educational content should focus on all pulmonary health hazards, regardless of the irritant source.

Healthy People 2020 also outlines specific health promotion objectives for the reduction of chronic respiratory diseases, primarily COPD. These goals involve reducing cigarette smoking across all populations, reducing the proportion of nonsmokers exposed to environmental tobacco smoke, and reducing the proportion of persons exposed to “unclean” air that fails to meet the ozone standards of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (Martino et al., 2013).

Concerning health maintenance specifically, there are four primary components that fall under the umbrella of nursing responsibility. These professional objectives include continuous assessment and monitoring of the disease, reducing risk factors, appropriately managing stable COPD, and managing potential exacerbations of the disease (Imran, Kotwani, & Chhabra, 2015). Early detection and assessment of the disease is necessary to help prevent further progression and to warrant cost-effective illness management. Even if a patient is already diagnosed with COPD, health promotion strategies can still be implemented to aid in optimal health maintenance, such as pulmonary rehabilitation, smoking cessation, vaccinations, and reducing exposure to noxious air particles (Martino et al., 2013). This can help diminish symptoms, increase physical ability, and improve overall life quality.

Discharge Planning

To date, there is no cure for COPD. Furthermore, there is no way to reverse the damage that COPD is responsible for causing (Wang, Nie, Xiong, & Xu, 2012). However, there are ways to help preclude disease progression and improve overall quality of life. Therefore, based on best practice, goals for discharge planning include relieving COPD symptoms, becoming more physically active, making healthy diet choices, eliminating smoking, promptly treating additional infections, illnesses, and complications, and limiting overall disease advancement (Imran, Kotwani, & Chhabra, 2015).

Pharmacological intervention is often the focal point of discharge planning,
and thus it is important to be appropriately familiar with the medication intervention plan prior to discharge. This includes knowing prescribed medicines well. Characteristics such as outward appearance, arranged dosage amounts, and administration timing outlined by the provider are crucial components of information. It is also good practice to carry a comprehensive list of medicines and supplements. The rationale behind utilizing these medications is often to relax and open the airways, reduce inflammation, loosen and expel mucus, prevent or treat infection, and to ease breathing (Cazzola, Matera, & Ora, 2015).

Implementing a healthful diet, a successful exercise plan, and other positive lifestyle changes serves as another primary focus of the COPD discharge plan. To begin, this includes receiving sufficient rest: approximately seven to nine hours a night is recommended (Siafakas & Celli, 2016). Consuming a healthy and balanced diet representative of all food groups, with abundant sources of protein and calories, is another incredibly important element for the COPD patient. Maintaining adequate fluids while simultaneously implementing a realistic and consistent exercise regimen can greatly benefit the patient. A major component of the discharge strategy is to eliminate smoking. This includes avoiding secondhand smoke, air pollution, and extreme temperatures and humidity. Remaining up-to-date with vaccinations and avoiding close contact with those who are ill, especially with flu and pneumonia, aid greatly in preventing lung infections (Martino et al., 2013).

Some providers add an additional recovery plan upon hospital discharge to help with the transition into living life with COPD (Siafakas & Celli, 2016). A pulmonary rehabilitation strategy can help both the patient and family learn ways to live optimally with this disease. These programs can outline, implement, and follow up with plans that incorporate realistic strategies that are individually tailored to each patient and their family. These tactics are employed using a multidisciplinary approach often comprising of a physician, home-health nurse, registered dietitian, physical therapist, occupational therapist, and psychologist as appropriate. This diverse team can provide thorough education regarding the physiological disease process and other lifestyle changes that can be made to live idyllically with COPD. Furthermore, these methods can provide a constant source of support for those who are affected, directly or otherwise, and ease the transition of living with this chronic pulmonary illness (Wang, Nie, Xiong, & Xu, 2012).

It is of the utmost importance to follow the provider’s instructions exactly for medication administration, follow-up appointments, and all routine testing (Siafakas & Celli, 2016). Verbalizing questions or concerns to the primary healthcare provider is highly encouraged and should be consistently empha-
sized in clinical practice. In addition, recognizing worsening symptoms or potential emergency situations is a supplementary educational need for both the patient and family. Certain warning signs include trouble talking or walking due to shortness of breath, dark blue or grey discoloration of the lips or fingernails, trouble breathing that is not relieved by medicine, fever greater than 101.5 degrees Fahrenheit, expelling blood-tinged mucus, chest discomfort, as well as accompanying pain that radiates to the arms, neck, jaw, or back. If any of these symptoms occur, it is important to contact emergency medical services immediately (Imran, Kotwani, & Chhabra, 2015).

**Family Resources**

Living with COPD is no easy undertaking for either the patient or family. From diagnosis to discharge, COPD causes both the patient and the family to experience a variety of physical, mental, and emotional difficulties (Nichols, 2013). Therefore, it is important to realize how deeply this disease can influence the family dynamic, but it is equally important to educate those under the disease’s influence on how much they can help and be helped. Promoting family resilience and support can help sustain health and stimulate family coping to face the challenges of living with a chronic disease. There are countless resources that can be easily accessed via the internet, offering a variety of support including disease education, health promotion and maintenance, holistic care and rehabilitation, fiscal support, and community services which can contribute to inclusive family adaptation and wellness (Siafakas & Celli, 2016).

There are a plethora of articles and journals that can be of great benefit for those living with COPD, as well as their caregivers. For those who are looking to better understand COPD and its pathophysiology, etiology, and prognosis, there are several helpful publications available. Perhaps the patient and family are searching for more information concerning the disease itself (Townsend, Bennett, & Harding, 2016), or how to live with a COPD diagnosis post-discharge, preventing acute exacerbations, and improving overall quality life, (Ling, Harris, Lewis & Crist, 2015); regardless, the resources to gain further knowledge concerning this disease is limitless.

Living in the modern age of technology, the internet is an incredibly invaluable resource that provides a vast amount of accessible information in seconds. Sometimes when faced with a COPD diagnosis, a patient and their family can feel overwhelmed, ill-informed, and helpless (Nichols, 2013). It is important for patients and caregivers alike to realize that they are not alone, and although there is not currently a cure for COPD, there are many useful resources tai-
lored to providing optimal assistance (“COPD Definition,” 2017). Whether someone is looking for a disease summary, diagnostic symptoms and tests, risk factors, prevention techniques, or treatments and therapies, there is an arsenal of valuable information just waiting at their fingertips (“COPD,” 2017).

For the benefit of parents, families, and caregivers alike, there are many established organizations that contribute to the betterment of lives that involve COPD. Such organizations include the COPD Foundation, the AL Association, and the Breathe Better Network (“COPD Foundation,” 2017; “American Lung Association,” 2017; “Breathe Better Network,” 2016). These establishments possess great tools that provide information for patients and families alike to gain a comprehensive understanding of COPD, manage treatment and lifestyle changes, relieve caregiver burdens, provide support, locate financial resources, and connect affected individuals worldwide. Most importantly, utilizing these assets can increase awareness of COPD and empower affected persons to act and make positive life differences.

Conclusion

COPD is a prevalent healthcare issue that has affected millions of individuals worldwide, and is on a trajectory to affect an even greater number of people, cultivating severe morbidity and mortality. Over the past several hundred years, much has been discovered about this disease and the knowledge that modern science has obtained has dramatically improved our understanding of this ailment while simultaneously formulating successful clinical remediation strategies.

COPD causes a variety of unique challenges. This disease presents with very severe characteristics such as airway obstruction, reduced pulmonary function, and increased lung inflammation causing dysfunctional breathing, shortness of breath, and low oxygen saturation. COPD is a progressive disease, and thus, the main objective of treatment is to improve lung function, prevent and control symptoms, and ultimately to improve health status.

Long-acting bronchodilator medications have proven to be considerably successful in treating this disease. This pharmacological modality helps to control COPD symptoms, reduce the occurrence of acute exacerbations, and improve quality of life. The nursing profession plays a chief role in ensuring the proper administration of these medications. The ultimate goal of this methodology is to produce a treatment plan that can be carried out safely and effectively by the affected person and caregivers as appropriate.

Furthermore, supplemental health promotion and maintenance strategies
implemented by the nurse, such as coordinated breathing techniques, disease exacerbation prevention methods, smoking cessation practices, and meaningful diet and exercise regimens, combined with the support of other alternative therapies, such as the use of herbal supplements, can greatly enhance the COPD treatment plan. By conducting discerning explorations, the nurse can also carry out a social assessment on both the patient and family to ascertain whether effective coping mechanisms and necessary supplementary support are in place. The nurse can provide home and lifestyle modifications, social service referrals, and connect affected families to support groups as applicable.
References


Jordan, S., & White, J. (2012). Bronchodilators: implications for nursing prac-


Getting “Clued” in: The Usage and Significance of Context Clues

Flora-Jean Forbes and Dr. Erin Buchanan

Abstract

The usage of context clues to determine the meaning of target nonsense words (emphasized made-up words) was examined to determine the types and structure of context clues people use in reading. Specifically, participants were provided with sample sentences and were then asked to define a target nonsense word. Second, they reported a specific word from the sentence that was used as a context clue to help them define the emphasized nonsense word. These words were then analyzed to determine how context clues impacted interpretation of an unknown word by exploring the combination of reported words and nonsense words parts of speech (i.e., noun, verb, etc.). For noun target words, verb and adverb context clues were used most frequently and for verb context clues, noun context clues were used most frequently. These findings suggest the application of semantic bias in processing, or that the structure and meaning of the sentence predisposes readers to specific interpretations. However, for adjective context clues, noun context clues were used most frequently, utilizing the principle of right association (i.e., using the closest word to the unknown word in order to help discern meaning).

Keywords: context clues, meaning, nonsense words, parsing

In relation to reading comprehension, one of the most common phrases while discussing learning processes is context clues, which are concepts that help readers disambiguate unknown words. Context clues are an important tool used to help indicate the meaning of unknown vocabulary. Context is often used to very quickly activate the meaning of a word (Harley, 2014). The brain can access context and process word meaning incredibly quickly. Often, not much conscious thought has to go into reading and comprehending sentences as people go through later stages of cognitive development. Currently, many ideas of the usage of context and types of context exist. Various models have been established to attempt to define context, and the processes used to create and understand context (Beck, McKeown, & McCaslin, 1983; Askov & Kamm, 1976). Research indicates the importance of context clues for reading comprehension and the various components that define significant context,
but there is a gap in the research involving the technical usage of various types of context clues.

**Word Context**

Before the specifics of context clues can be explained, one must first understand the different presentations of words and how words can be used to provide meaning in general. Beck et al. (1983) discuss primarily two main types of contexts. Pedagogical context is information that is formatted primarily for teaching unknown words. When people are learning to read or attempting to improve vocabulary, pedagogical context can provide support in a specifically structured environment. An example given to a learner to teach the meaning of *commend* might include the following sentence: "All the students made very good grades on the tests, so their teacher commended them for doing so well," (Beck et al., 1983). This structure was created specifically to attempt to indicate the meaning of the target word *commend*. Natural contexts, on the other hand, are any range of contexts that could be surrounding an unknown word, which is not specifically formulated to indicate any word definition. This example would be any type of sentence that could be found in print. So for example, in the previous sentence, if *sentence* were the target word, the sentence was not specifically designed to give any cue words to indicate that meaning. Beck et al. (1983) described four sub-types of natural contexts: misdirective (words are purposefully misleading), nondirective (words are of no additional support), general (words are somewhat helpful), and directive (words are pointed and actively meaningful) contexts. They noted that directive contexts are very similar to pedagogical contexts because they both directly help the reader determine meaning; however, an author may not write directive contexts in order to provide meaning to words, whereas an author of pedagogical contexts uses those contexts for the purpose of supplying meaning. When put in practice, the ideal use of context clues would be to assist a reader to determine the meaning of unknown words in real world application contexts. From that more practical standpoint, there is debate regarding the true effectiveness of context clues.

Schatz and Baldwin (1986) supported the argument that context clues are not universally useful, and that they are only useful when attempting to define high frequency (common) words. In cases in which the text is directive and gives explicit clues as to the definition of words, context clues can be very helpful to determine word meaning. However, Schatz and Baldwin argue that in natural prose with more difficult low frequency words, or words that are uncommon for an individual to encounter, context clues would be of little
help. An example statement appears as follows with the low frequency word italicized: “No one would deny the pragmatic advantages, both cultural and civic, of such arts districts” (Schatz & Baldwin, 1986, p. 445). Presentation of the passages in prose allows for a more practical application of context usage. Through their research, they found that context clues, synonyms in particular, can be incredibly helpful in determining the meaning of low frequency words, but they could also be just as misleading. This dichotomy indicates a need for further research. In regards to the specific teaching aspect of using context clues, however, the idea that context clues can be used as tools to help improve learning is still so commonly referenced that researchers have developed different ways to categorize these tools.

**Teaching Classification Systems**

Askov and Kamm (1976) published an article discussing the significance of an effective classification system for context clues across third, fourth, and fifth grade classes. They focused on teaching students about direct description context clues, in which students are given a description of something and then must define the target word that follows, and cause-effect clues paired with four specific parts of speech (nouns, verbs, adjectives, and adverbs), in which a scenario is given and the outcome word must be determined through context. In this case, their experiment omitted the target word and manipulated whether students would receive particular training regarding context clues or no training at all. The experimental group received ten days of training with four hours of training each day involving the use of worksheets and games to practice context clue usage, while the control group just received normal classroom instruction. The main implication of their study was the idea that context clues can be taught to young students (grade school) and that they can be used to supply meaning to words, even omitted or nonsense ones. The understanding of omitted or nonsense words was particularly notable because, as expressed through the names, they are words that should have no meaning attached to them or the lack of a target word at all.

Attaching meaning to a nonsense word, which inherently has no meaning, is an important aspect of reading and word recognition. Baker and Sonderegger (1964) conducted an experiment in support of the effectiveness of context clues in which participants were shown a sentence with a nonsense word. They were still able to derive meaning from that nonsense word due to the use of those context clues. Although those words were, in practice, meaningless, they should ideally be able to acquire meaning, and their research supported the hy-
pothesis. Although there are existing classification systems of types of context clues (Askov & Kamm, 1976), the frequency of use of specific word types (i.e. noun) for context disambiguation appears to be understudied.

When discussing what are commonly referred to as context clues in particular, the idea of word and meaning frequency for a concept is an integral component of word recognition. Hafner (1967) discussed how students engage in a type of problem solving when using context clues. He compiled numerous sources in order to discuss multiple types of context aids. One particularly notable classification system includes seven types of context aids including definition, experience, comparison or contrast, synonym, familiar expression or language experience, summary, and the reflection of a mood or situation (McCullough, 1945). Synonym and familiar expression are two of the most important aspects that relate to the usage of context clues. By having words in context that have the same meaning as the target word, deriving meaning of the word in question becomes much easier. Also, when a high frequency phrase is used to provide context, the ability to recognize the word in question increases. Because of the importance of word frequency to context clues, this study examined other frequency aspects of words, specifically parts of speech.

**Parsing**

Context clues can be considered part of a larger psycholinguistic process of parsing a sentence. Parsing is a process of decoding the syntactic structure of a sentence, which then leads to building a representation of the information read. When ambiguous words are found in a sentence, a reader must decode the ambiguity, usually through a meaning based interpretation.

This process is often described as “syntax proposes, semantics disposes” (Harley, 2014). A serial processing model would suggest that readers complete a parse tree and then use word meaning to determine if the overall interpretation is valid within our comprehension (Mitchell, 1994). Figure 1 displays a parse tree, which represents the structure of a sentence, and in a serial model, the entire parse tree is created to examine if the interpretation of meaning is correct. Parallel or interactive models suggest that individuals concurrently use semantic information to guide possible syntax parsing options and creation of a parse tree (Pickering, 1999). Research has supported that people integrate semantic information as they read each word (Marslen-Wilson, 1973, 1975; Marslen-Wilson & Welsh, 1978; Tyler & Marslen-Wilson 1979).
Figure 1. An example of a parse tree. Determiners are words (often *the, an, a*) that occur with nouns to suggest the reference of the noun. In this example, *the* is an article that indicates a specific cat ate a specific mouse.

The structure of a sentence furnishes important information into the syntactic structure of the sentence, and thus helps build semantic representation (Kimball, 1973). Readers will start constructing a parse tree (i.e., a map of a sentence) that is top-down by breaking sentences into noun and verb phrases. The working memory of the reader only allows for a limited number of words to process, and readers use the principle of right association to attach concepts to the closest lower-level node possible (Fodor & Frazier, 1980). In Figure 1, right association for mouse would imply that it belongs to the verb phrase (on the right) rather than the noun phrase (on the left). In terms of context clues, this type of parsing system would predict that, potentially, words that are in the same phrase structure (i.e. noun or verb) would be the most influential in deconstructing ambiguous meanings of words. However, Taraban and McClelland (1988) have shown that readers have a semantic bias when creating parse trees, such that complex structure does not slow reading; rather, unexpected semantic and thematic roles do (see also, Crain & Steedman, 1985; Ni, Crain, & Shankweiler, 1996). For example, the famous sentence “colorless green ideas sleep furiously” would be difficult to process because the semantic role of ideas does not permit them to “sleep” (Chomsky, 1957, p. 15). Therefore, it is also plausible that context clues may best be found in the contrasting phrase node, as the choice of noun phrase will limit the available representations in the verb phrase. Consequently, if the noun phrase is ambiguous, readers may look to the verb phrase for confirmation of semantic interpretation.
CURRENT STUDY

The current study sought to provide insight about the effectiveness of context clues involving specific parts of speech in order to define the meaning of a nonsense word, examined through the lens of an interactive parsing model. This study focused on which part of speech participants indicated most frequently for context clues when attempting to determine meaning of a nonsense word, which would indicate where the ambiguity is resolved in processing unknown words. Participants were expected to use noun context clues more frequently than verb context clues when attempting to define nonsense words based on research from Askov and Kamm (1976) and Baker and Sonderegger (1964). However, based on interactive parsing model explanations, we expected results to vary based on the part of speech of the nonsense word. The right association hypothesis would imply that concepts in the same phrase structure (i.e. adjectives to nouns, adverbs to verbs) would be the most helpful, while semantic bias in processing would imply that words in an opposite phrase structure (i.e. nouns to verbs) might be more beneficial at helping process ambiguity.

METHOD

Participants

Participants (N = 51) were recruited from the undergraduate participant pool of Introductory Psychology students at a large Midwestern university after obtaining approval from the Institutional Review Board (15-0121). The sample (N = 51) was approximately 19.35 years old (SD = 3.16) and had 31 females and 20 males. They were required to have no other qualifications for the study other than access to the SONA Systems software used by the university to advertise research studies. Participants were compensated with one research credit for their participation.

Materials

The materials used for this study included a modified form of a Warren County Public School vocabulary assessment exam (2014) as well as a compilation of sample GRE vocabulary questions drawn from The Princeton Review 2nd edition (2012). Although sentences vary in composition, the average number of parts of speech are as follows: nouns (M = 7.83, SD = 3.44), verbs (M = 6.60, SD = 2.97), adjectives (M = 6.60, SD = 2.97), and adverbs (M = 1.47, SD = 1.20). Experimenters manipulated these questions by replacing a word in each sentence with a nonsense word. Participants answered 30 multiple choice
questions that were structured like a vocabulary exam based on the perceived meaning of a bolded “nonsense” word. An example question was as follows; “If you don’t dortap your spending, you’ll be broke in no time at all! Which word is a synonym of ‘dortap’? A. Reduce B. Follow C. Behind D. Buy.” In total, there were 16 nonsense words that appeared as adjectives, 8 that were classified as nouns and 6 that were classified as verbs as part of the 30 questions used in the study.

After answering this question, participants then indicated one specific word from each example that they felt helped to determine the answer to the multiple choice question by typing in their answer to a fill in the blank question. In each case the participant was to indicate the meaning of the bolded word, the placement of the bolded word in the sentence varied. At the end of the questionnaire, participants answered a brief six question demographic survey; however, these variables were not reviewed for primary analysis. All study information, including exact materials, can be found online at https://osf.io/3sz25/.

Procedure

Participants first signed up to complete the study in the SONA system, a participant management system. They were then directed to a link to complete the online survey through Qualtrics, an online survey software system. Each participant was given directions at the beginning of the study that they would be able to discontinue participation at any point during the questionnaire. After giving written consent to participate, they began answering the questionnaire. Participants were instructed to indicate the meaning of the bolded word for each question from four multiple choice options and then to type the single word that helped to indicate the meaning of the bolded word the most. Finally, participants answered six demographic questions at the end of the survey. Participants were then directed to a separate questionnaire to enter in their identifying information in order to receive research credit while maintaining anonymity from their responses.

Results

Data Processing and Data Analysis

The goal was to measure the various parts of speech that participants used most often to define unknown/nonsense words in a sentence. Each answer choice was coded into four different parts of speech (noun, verb, adjective, adverb) for the words listed by participants. This information was combined with
the parts of speech of the target word (noun, verb, and adjective). Fifty-one
participants each answered 30 questions; thus, 1530 data points were recorded. All data points that were other types of speech (prepositions, conjunctions, and pronouns) were excluded from the analysis (n = 46). Table 1 indicates the
frequencies of part of speech for the selected word by the part of speech for the ambiguous word. The participants generally got all of the answers correct
about the meaning of the nonsense words (90.47%), so this variable was not
analyzed as a dependent variable.

Table 1. Observed frequency of parts of speech used as context clues for target
nonsense words.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Listed Word</th>
<th>Target Word</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Noun</td>
<td>Noun</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Verb</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Adjective</td>
<td>346</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Verb</td>
<td>Noun</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Verb</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Adjective</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adjective</td>
<td>Noun</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Verb</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Adjective</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adverb</td>
<td>Noun</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Verb</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Adjective</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Because of the nested nature of this data (i.e., each participant has 30 con-
text clue selections), we employed a multilevel model to analyze the interaction
between target part of speech and chosen part of speech. Multilevel analyses
control for the correlated error of repeated measures designs by designating the
participants as a random intercept factor. Each participant's answer choice was
dummy coded to use in a logistic regression. Therefore, if a participant chose a
noun, this answer would be coded as a 1 for nouns, and a zero for verbs, adject-
ives, and adverbs for that question. This coding scheme allowed us to examine
the interaction between answer choice part of speech and target ambiguous
word part of speech.

Each question is therefore nested under participants, and a random factor
for item was examined to determine if this repeated factor needed to be con-
trolled for. This model was not significantly different than a model with only
a participant random intercept, p = 1.00. However, each question did contain
a different proportion of nouns, adjectives, adverbs, and verbs to select from.
These differences were controlled for by including frequency count covariates
in the logistic regression. Each question was coded for the number of nouns,
adjectives, adverbs, and verbs, and these frequencies were included in the mod-
el. Therefore, the final model included frequency covariates for each part of
speech, the main effects of target type and answer choice, and the interaction
of target type and answer choice.

**Logistic Regression**

The model with the covariates of frequencies of parts of speech for each item was not significantly better than an intercept only model, $\chi^2 (2) = 0.00, p = 1.00$. The addition of the main effects of target speech type and answer choice was significant, $\chi^2 (5) = 419.92, p < .001$. Lastly, the addition of the interaction term significantly improved the model, $\chi^2 (6) = 245.41, p < .001$. The final model coefficients are presented in Table 2. To investigate the interaction, we split on target ambiguous word part of speech and analyzed three logistic regressions (noun, adjective, verb) with the same covariates focusing on answer choice. Answer choice is a dummy coded variable (i.e., noun versus adjective, noun versus adverb, etc.), and the comparison level was recoded so that all pairwise combinations could be examined. To control for Type 1 error, a new alpha of $0.05/6 = 0.008$ was used to determine statistical significance for each target type of speech.
Table 2. Coefficients and statistics for logistic regression analyses.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Effect</th>
<th>b</th>
<th>SE</th>
<th>z</th>
<th>p</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intercept</td>
<td>-0.23</td>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>-1.97</td>
<td>0.048</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frequency Nouns</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>1.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frequency Verbs</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>1.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frequency Adverbs</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.03</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>1.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Target Type Noun</td>
<td>-1.08</td>
<td>0.14</td>
<td>-7.59</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Target Type Verb</td>
<td>0.46</td>
<td>0.14</td>
<td>3.25</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Answer Choice Verb</td>
<td>-0.50</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>-4.77</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Answer Choice Adjective</td>
<td>-1.35</td>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>-11.35</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Answer Choice Adverb</td>
<td>-2.50</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>-15.09</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interaction T_noun X A_verb</td>
<td>0.96</td>
<td>0.19</td>
<td>4.95</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interaction T_verb X A_verb</td>
<td>-0.55</td>
<td>0.20</td>
<td>-2.75</td>
<td>0.006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interaction T_noun X A_adjective</td>
<td>1.31</td>
<td>0.21</td>
<td>6.21</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interaction T_verb X A_adjective</td>
<td>-1.37</td>
<td>0.27</td>
<td>-5.00</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interaction T_noun X A_adverb</td>
<td>2.89</td>
<td>0.23</td>
<td>12.36</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interaction T_verb X A_adverb</td>
<td>-0.43</td>
<td>0.31</td>
<td>-1.38</td>
<td>0.167</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Dummy coded variables are coded such that the variable is a comparison between two categorical categories; thus, not all categories are included as predictors. T = Target ambiguous word, A = answer choice. Frequency indicates the number of nouns/verbs/adverbs in the sentence. Target type indicates the part of speech for the nonsense word. Answer choice indicates the part of speech for the context clue word selected by participants. b is the regression coefficient, SE is standard error, z indicates the test statistic, and p indicates the p-value associated with that test statistic.

Table 3 portrays all statistics for pairwise comparisons after controlling for frequency covariates. For target ambiguous nouns, we found that verbs were selected more often than nouns and adjectives, while verbs and adverbs were not significantly different. Nouns, adverbs, and adjectives were not significantly different from each other. This result supports the semantic bias hypothesis, in that ambiguous nouns were clarified by verbs (and somewhat adverbs), which would be on a separate phrase node. For target ambiguous adjectives, we found that all comparisons were significantly different and the clues most commonly used were nouns, followed by verbs, other adjectives, and finally adverbs. Adjectives are more commonly clarified by a corresponding noun,
thus supporting right association, as these are in the same phrase node. Lastly, target ambiguous verbs showed that nouns were significantly greater than verbs, which were chosen more than adjectives and adverbs. Adjectives and adverbs were not significantly different. This result supports the semantic bias hypothesis, in the reverse of the noun results, as nouns were most likely to clarify ambiguous verbs.

Table 3. Coefficient comparisons for target types of speech.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Target</th>
<th>Answer Choice Comparison</th>
<th>b</th>
<th>SE</th>
<th>z</th>
<th>p</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Noun</td>
<td>Noun v Verb</td>
<td>0.46</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>2.82</td>
<td>0.005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Noun</td>
<td>Noun v Adjective</td>
<td>−0.05</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>−0.26</td>
<td>0.794</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Noun</td>
<td>Noun v Adverb</td>
<td>0.39</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>2.36</td>
<td>0.018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Noun</td>
<td>Verb v Adjective</td>
<td>−0.51</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>−3.08</td>
<td>0.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Noun</td>
<td>Verb v Adverb</td>
<td>−0.07</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>−0.47</td>
<td>0.641</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Noun</td>
<td>Adjective v Adverb</td>
<td>0.44</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>2.62</td>
<td>0.009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adjectives</td>
<td>Noun v Verb</td>
<td>−0.50</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>−4.77</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adjectives</td>
<td>Noun v Adjective</td>
<td>−1.35</td>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>−11.35</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adjectives</td>
<td>Noun v Adverb</td>
<td>−2.50</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>−15.09</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adjectives</td>
<td>Verb v Adjective</td>
<td>−0.85</td>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>−6.99</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adjectives</td>
<td>Verb v Adverb</td>
<td>−2.00</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>−11.92</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adjectives</td>
<td>Adjective v Adverb</td>
<td>−1.14</td>
<td>0.18</td>
<td>−6.46</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Verb</td>
<td>Noun v Verb</td>
<td>−1.05</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>−6.17</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Verb</td>
<td>Noun v Adjective</td>
<td>−2.72</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>−11.07</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Verb</td>
<td>Noun v Adverb</td>
<td>−2.93</td>
<td>0.26</td>
<td>−11.10</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Verb</td>
<td>Verb v Adjective</td>
<td>−1.67</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>−6.67</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Verb</td>
<td>Verb v Adverb</td>
<td>−1.88</td>
<td>0.27</td>
<td>−7.00</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Verb</td>
<td>Adjective v Adverb</td>
<td>−0.21</td>
<td>0.32</td>
<td>−0.64</td>
<td>0.523</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Discussion

This experiment established the idea that there were significant differences between the parts of speech for context clues that are used to define types of target words. The initial hypothesis indicated appeared to be much too simplistic in regards to the types of context clues that participants would select. For this study, participants produced seven different parts of speech to serve as context clues, but only four parts of speech were used often enough for statistical
examination (Table 1). The hypothesis was partially supported, such that for both nonsense verbs and adjectives, nouns were used most frequently to disambiguate context. For verb target words, nouns were used as context clues most often to indicate word meaning. Semantic bias in processing could explain this finding, because to understand the meaning of a verb, the reader may need to attend to the adjacent noun phrase to determine meaning.

For nonsense nouns, verbs and adverbs seem equally important for context clues. These findings also conform to the idea that, due to semantic bias in processing, words in the opposite phrase structure may be beneficial in order to confirm a semantic interpretation of the word in question (Taraban & McClelland, 1988). This can be best explained through an example. Participants are likely using the action of the verb as well as modifiers of the verb to help determine the definition of the noun. For example, if the verb were *kick*, the participant would know that the noun must be something that you would be able to kick. Although for nouns and verbs, participants may have been utilizing semantic bias in processing, adjectives seem to be understood differently. For adjectives, it was shown that nouns were used significantly more than other parts of speech to indicate context. The right association hypothesis describes how we use words in the same phrase structure to understand the meaning of a specific concept (Fodor & Frazier, 1980). Since adjectives describe nouns, it would be logical for participants to use nouns to help understand the meaning of adjectives and the right association hypothesis further supports our understanding of this finding.

**Improvements**

Although this study showed significant results, additional improvements in future studies are discussed here. In order to increase consistency, it would be important to make sure there are an equal number of target words for each part of speech that will be investigated. In this case, there were sixteen adjectives, eight nouns, and six verb target words. This variable could easily be controlled in the future. Although parts of speech were used as the dependent variable in this study, the specific word cues picked by participants did vary (i.e. *ball* and *wind* would both be coded as nouns). Although the part of speech of the words indicated as “context clues” can be explained by theories of parsing, the reason for the variation of words selected for each sentence is less clear. Therefore, to get more information than just parts of speech, it would be interesting to add a qualitative measure to determine why participants chose those specific words. Also, perhaps in the cases in which the context clue choices were most varied, those words may have been more difficult, or the participants may have been
unsure about the meaning of the nonsense word. Having more information about the thought processes associated with these decisions could further clarify our understanding of mean disambiguation.

In addition to creating more consistency overall, it would be ideal to create a questionnaire with a higher difficulty level. Since the participants generally got all of the answers correct about the meaning of the nonsense words (90.47%), percent correct results were not usable as a dependent variable. If there were a way to increase item difficulty, cue choices could be examined to see if they varied with item correctness. It is also important to consider that these results could not be generalized to a greater population since all of the participants were college students who have an above average level of education and may have more exposure to a complex vocabulary.

If this experiment were conducted in the future, it would be ideal to have a much greater sample size and a different variety of participants, rather than just introductory psychology students. It would be important to discover whether a sample more representative of the general population would emulate the same results and how level of education interacts with the ability to determine context clues.

*The Importance of Future Research*

Current data supports that context clues are significant and that structured context clues can help establish meaning. By establishing this research and continuing to investigate these ideas in the future, scholars in the field would be able to gain an understanding of why these processes are occurring. When implementing these ideas in teaching and benefitting a person’s day-to-day life, many people want to have answers as to why these practices are important for students to learn. Especially when teaching children, it can often be beneficial to be able to explain how something works and why things are important rather than just telling them. Even more importantly, by having significant research to give more concrete applications of these seemingly common and simple ideas, the implications of these simple habits can be seen as beneficial tools for everyone, not just students. If the research continues, there could be significant support to create a more methodical way of teaching context clues to help improve general reading comprehension.
References


Can a Sustainable Context Predict Recycling? Sustainable Design Impacts on Pro-Environmental Behaviors and Perceptions

Eva Klein

Abstract

This research assessed the effect of Missouri State University students’ built campus environment on their disposing of waste. Out of a sample of 46 students (mean age = 18.71), 36.4% reported eating in on-campus dining centers “most of the time.” ZipGrow Towers—hybrid hydro-aeroponic systems that grow herbs and greens sustainably—were introduced into these campus dining centers. In this experimental study, participant recycling (dependent variable) was measured under two conditions: presence or absence of a ZipGrow Tower in the study area. It was hypothesized that the presence of the tower would predict both actual recycling and whether participants asked if they might recycle. A broader survey of participants’ preexisting pro-environmental behaviors, values, and perceptions related to campus and daily life also served as a measure to predict recycling. The experiment showed that there was no significant effect on recycling or asking about recycling based on the ZipGrow Tower’s presence. However, follow up statistical tests showed that higher concern for food and waste production was correlated with participants’ asking if they might recycle, $r = .266, p = .026$.

Keywords: sustainability, pro-environmental behaviors, sustainable perceptions, environmental behavior research, recycling.

Author Note: Support for this study was provided by Missouri State University's College of Health and Human Services and the Honors College. Additional thanks to Missouri State University’s Sustainability Coordinator, Jordan Schanda.
Achieving sustainability can be a pretty weighty task; however, there are simple actions that, when done by many, can have a large impact. Recycling is one such action: it can extend the lifespan of single-use products, making it an important action for resource management and environmental protection. Although environmental issues have been discussed more frequently in the last decade, there are still many who do not acknowledge or put resources toward alleviating these global issues. Sustainability is defined as utilizing resources so they fulfill present needs, as well as those of future generations (Brundtland, 1987). Thinking in a sustainable way involves long term orientation, inclusive organization, and compromising on consumerist habits. It calls for an awareness that the resources we have available to us, both in their raw forms and as processed commodities, are finite.

Key parts of living sustainably and addressing environmental issues are recycling, composting, and reducing waste. The EPA reported that in 2014, in the United States alone, 258 million tons of municipal solid waste was generated. Of that, 136 million tons of garbage ended up in a landfill, while just about 66.4 million tons were recycled, and a mere 23 million tons were composted. Recycling and composting in the US has been on the upswing; in 1980, just 10% of all municipal solid waste was recycled or composted compared to over 34% in 2014, but still in 2014, 18.5% of landfilled items were plastic (EPA, 2016). Often, when discussing waste management and sustainability in general, only the environmental impacts are discussed. In order to truly change the current paradigm of single-use convenience products, the economic and equity pillars of sustainability must be incorporated.

The Three Pillars of Sustainability and Waste Management

The environmental impacts of landfiling plastics are severe. Though there has been improvement, the production of such excessive amounts of waste has extremely negative impacts on the health of the environment. Landfilled plastics not only take up natural land space, but they also produce a high potential for soil and groundwater contamination. Chemicals from plastics leach into the soil and water when landfill liners break, poisoning healthy soil and water (North & Halden, 2013). Recycling plastics actually has negative net greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions, while landfiling plastics increases the amount of GHG emitted into the atmosphere. This produces more extreme weather events, which in turn produces more landfilled debris. Hence, landfiling triggers a dangerous snowball effect (EPA, 2006). The EPA has identified that
landfilling can have severe negative effects on our lands, but not all trash ends up in a landfill.

Ocean pollution negatively impacts marine health and biodiversity; it has been named a global problem. Of the 639 species identified to come in contact with marine pollution, 92% of the debris was plastic (Gall & Thompson, 2015). This makes not only the disposal of our waste important, but also what types of waste we are making. Of all manufactured plastics, 50% are used to make single-use items. If the items are landfilled, the energy and the material used to produce them stop there. Of the world’s oil supply, 4% provides the raw material for plastics and another 3–4% is used to manufacture them. This makes recycling one of the most important sustainable actions because it puts energy and materials back into our available resources (Hopewell, Dvorak, & Kosior, 2009). How we use resources, as well as how we dispose of them, directly impacts the environment.

Economically, recycling is an important part of maximizing the bottom line on a global scale. Alissa Zhu, a reporter for the Springfield News-Leader in Missouri, reported that the Springfield City Council is looking to extend the life of the city’s landfill by purchasing 42 more acres, which would cost 1.885 million dollars. The Superintendent of Solid Waste, Erick Roberts, explained that the landfill receives about 650 tons of waste per day. Revenue to pay for the additions to the landfill will come from landfilling tipping fees paid by waste haulers. Currently, citizens of Springfield pay on average more than $12 per month for trash services, which does not include extra services like recycling (City of Springfield Environmental Services, 2017). Ultimately, the burden for landfilling costs falls on the citizens.

Environmental inequality is an issue that is commonly overlooked. The concentration of landfills is significantly higher in minority communities (Bullard, Mohai, Saha, & Wright, 2008). McKinny, Kick and Cannon (2015) determined that landfills immediately end land productivity potential for communities. On top of this, property devaluation and health risks both further marginalize historically neglected groups of people through systemic waste management actions (Mohai & Saha, 2006).

The Role of Higher Education in Sustainability

The injustices and hazards associated with landfilling are numerous, which indicates that institutional action is needed. According to the UN’s report “Higher Education’s Commitment to Sustainability: From Understanding to Action,” universities are obligated to provide tools to students to develop
and manage the world sustainably (Tilbury, 2011). Beringer and Adomßent (2008) highlighted that sustainable development goals from the institution need to take a holistic approach through university operations and academia. The Association for the Advancement of Sustainability in Higher Education (AASHE) has a sustainability certification specifically for universities. Missouri State University submits Sustainability Tracking, Assessment, and Rating System (STARS) reports and currently has bronze certification. This system is used to organize sustainability efforts on campuses and gain recognition for best practices (AASHE, 2017). On-campus recycling is available at the university to students, faculty, and staff; however, each department is in charge of purchasing their own recycling bins. This has resulted in a variety of different styles of bins.

A Psychological Approach to Sustainability

When approaching the topic of sustainability, identifying human behaviors and motivation for those behaviors is crucial. Taking a psychological approach to tackling environmental problems is gaining popularity. The field of environmental psychology emerged as human’s actions in the environment began to have tangible consequences. There are two ways to approach human behavior in relation to the environment: a mechanistic approach and an organismic approach. A mechanistic approach describes an organism that is reactive to the environment, and an organismic approach describes an active organism that reacts to and acts upon the built environment, describes Deci & Ryan (as cited in Reeve, 2015). Behaviors are moderated by our physiological and psychological needs. Often, environmental degradation is not clearly apparent in our everyday lives. This begins to explain why sustainable and pro-environmental building models are often ignored or deemed unimportant. When there is a disconnect between actions and their consequences due to physical space, it is hard to generate motivation. Through the lens of mechanistic approach, the immediate environment of relatively privileged college students will not drive the needed paradigm switch. This perception implies that the status quo is operational. So, what does drive Pro-Environmental Behavior?

In 2004 a self-report phone survey with 622 participants was conducted in Missouri with about three out of four participants stating they recycled (74%). Participants that did not recycle responded most frequently that this behavior was due to not having a recycling center, that they did not know where it was, or that it was too inconvenient. The survey concluded that making recycling more convenient and incentivizing recycling with pay would increase recycling
based on 159 responses (Missouri Department of Natural Resources, 2004). However, years later, 640,068 tons of plastic were still being landfilled.

Moganadas, Corral-Verdugo, and Ramanathan (2013) found that currently there is an emphasis on external motivation for acting in a pro-environmental way. Extrinsic motivators include prestige, funding, and social benefits (Deci & Ryan, 2000; Geller, 2002; Lehman & Geller, 2004; Kasser, 2014). Another type of motivation, intrinsic motivation, is often more beneficial because it builds commitment and generates internal satisfaction. Psychologists have identified satisfaction, sense of efficacy, and wellbeing as intrinsic motivators for sustainable actions (Deci & Ryan, 2000; Crompton & Kasser, 2009; Corral-Verdugo, 2012; Kasser, 2014). Corral-Verdugo (2012) reports that acting pro-environmentally does lead to satisfaction and happiness and is a significant predictor of acting sustainably. In a research study conducted by Cooke, Fielding, & Louis (2016), participants who felt higher levels of autonomy and relatedness when completing PEBs were also more intrinsically motivated to complete said behaviors. In a follow-up study, she found that all three precursors to intrinsically motivated behavior, autonomy, relatedness, and competence, were positively correlated with completing PEBs and lower reported environmental impact.

In contrast, social referencing, which can have social benefits, supports the power of extrinsic motivation. Kim & Kwak (as cited in Jones, 2015) highlight that social referencing takes place in ambiguous situations and is defined by referencing others’ behaviors. In daily life, strong situational cues for behaviors are not common. Numerous researchers including de Kwaadesteniet, van Dijk, Wit & de Cramer, Jones & Parameswaran, McDonald & Donnellan, Mullins & Cummings, Suls & David, and lastly Webster & Crysel (as cited by Jones) have supported that in ambiguous situations, individual perceptions are better predictors of behaviors. Stronger still is the significance of the situation. In loosely defined or novel situations where decisions must be made, individuals simply rely on the information they receive from other’s behavior. In short, we behave like those around us (Jones, 2015).

A large component in adaption to climate change, or performing more PEBs, are the physical characteristics of the local setting (Armah, Luginaah, Hambati, Chuenpagdee, & Campbell, 2015). Wu, DiGiacomo, Lenkic, Wong, and Kingstone (2016) analyzed the impact of sustainable versus unsustainable building design on recycling. The sustainable building had new environmental technologies such as a rooftop garden, “green wall” covered in ivy, a water purification system on display, solar panels, and messages of sustainability throughout the building. The control building had little natural
light and no messages of sustainability. To cover the purpose of the study, the researchers emphasized the organization quality of the experimental task; however, recycling, composting, and trashing behaviors were recorded. Participants in the sustainable building were less likely to use the trashcan than those in the unsustainable building; however, there was a higher accuracy of items correctly trashed in the unsustainable building. This study supported factoring in building context when trying to predict recycling behaviors. A clearly explained recycling program, in conjunction with a culture of recycling, and individuals with high green efficacy would presumably lead to increased recycling behaviors. However, little is known about the moderating power of a sustainable built environment on PEBs.

**METHODS**

This research attempts to control for social modeling, ambiguity, and external motivators in order to identify if a sustainable built environment will produce the PEB, recycling. Participants were individually asked to dispose of a plastic recyclable plate before taking a survey. To capture natural behaviors, participants were unaware that this behavior was being observed, nor did they know that the survey was about sustainability. It was hypothesized that the presence of the ZipGrow Tower, a tower used to grow herbs and other vegetables, would cause more participants to recycle.

**Participants**

In the principle study, undergraduate students (45) enrolled in Introduction to Psychology at Missouri State University participated in this study. All students were around the same age (mean age 18.71). There were 32 females and 13 males with the majority living on campus (70.5%). Of the participants, 36.4% reported eating at on campus dining centers “most of the time.” Predominantly, all participants were from the United States and only 4 participants identified as another nationality or preferred not to answer. Additionally, 71.7% of all participants were first year students. Before the principle study, to test the procedure, a pilot study was conducted consisting of 26 participants with comparable demographics.

**Materials and Procedure**

The study was approved by the Institutional Review Board before research procedures began. Intro to Psychology students were recruited through SONA, a campus-run research participation recruiting portal. They were able to sign
up for a half hour session to participate in a study titled “Your Student Perspective!”. Sessions started at 2:00 p.m. on either Monday or Wednesday of the same week.

The experiment was a seated survey held in the largest on-campus dining hall. Participants in each session were advised to come to the dining center where they were instructed by the researcher to take a seat at the dining tables and enjoy a cookie before being given further instruction. At each seat, there was a cookie on a hard, white, plastic plate. The plate had a small recycling symbol indicating the plastic number on the bottom.

For the Monday sessions, the ZipGrow Tower was present, during the Wednesday sessions, the ZipGrow Tower was moved to another room where participants could not see it. A ZipGrow Tower is a hybrid hydro and aeroponic system for growing lettuces and herbs. It consists of eight vertical towers in which the plants can grow. The unit is on wheels and is plugged into an electrical outlet to power the release of water. It is always present in the section of the dining hall where students were tested, in front of large windows looking out on the recreation center and solar powered tables (see Figure 1). For the purpose of this experiment, a sustainable built environment was defined as having the aforementioned ZipGrow Towers present.

The researcher handed out consent forms with ID numbers in the top right corner used for identifying the surveys handed out later with the consent forms. Each participant was brought to the testing area and instructed to bring the consent form and their “waste” with them. The researcher led the participant to the testing table which had two seats divided by cardboard dividers. The dividers prevented the waiting participants from seeing the recycling behaviors of the other participants. Two identical black bins were located behind the table with ample space between the bins and the chairs so that both bins could be easily reached. Flip lids prevented the inside contents of the bins from being visible. The first bin had a white recycling symbol and the second one did not. The primary researcher observed whether the participant recycled when they were instructed to dispose of the plate. When participants sat down before disposing of the plate, they were politely asked to dispose of the plate so their space was not messy. It was also noted if the participant asked whether they could recycle the plate. If they asked, they were told yes. Participants were then given a Sustainability Survey (attached in Appendix), which included a modified version of the Importance of Organizational Sustainability Measure (Lamm, Tosti-Kharas, & Williams, 2013) adapted to the university. It contained three questions including and similar to “All things being equal, I would prefer to study at a university that cares about its impact on the environment” with a
Likert-type scale ranging from “not important” to “very important.” Portions of the Pro-Environmental Behavior Perception Questionnaire (Lacasse, 2016) were included in the survey. Three subscales consisted of questions on PEBs (“I eat meatless meals.” True, Not True), environmental identity, (“Acting environmentally friendly is an important part of who I am.”, rating scale from 0 to 10) and attitude towards climate change (“I am concerned about the potential negative impacts of climate change.”, rating scale from 0 to 10). Questions created by the Missouri State University’s Sustainability Coordinator for the Sustainability Culture Assessment (Schanda, 2016) that all incoming freshmen took were also included. See the attached survey in the appendix. Each participant was asked to write the number found on the top right corner of their consent form on the survey. Lastly, they were instructed that, once finished, they should bring the survey and consent form to another researcher seated at a table next to theirs. The assistant researcher wrote on the survey whether that participant had recycled, and if they had asked about recycling from the information provided by the Primary Researcher and his own observations. Participants were told they could leave once they finished the survey. The Primary Researcher then replaced the open spot with another participant. Follow up questions at the end of each survey asked if the participant did or did not recycle, if they were confused whether they could recycle the plate, if they noticed the ZipGrow Tower directly before taking the survey, and if they were familiar with the ZipGrow Tower Program far in advance to taking the survey. A pilot group of 26 participants was tested with slightly different procedures but the same survey. The pilot study had comparable demographics: 80.8% were first year students with a mean age of 18.84. There were 21 females and 5 males, only one being of a foreign nationality. Only 24% of participants ate in the dining halls “most of the time,” and more participants ate there only sometimes (28%). The data from their tests were used to create composite scores and to run the correlations discussed in the Results section.

**Results**

Cronbach’s alphas were found to determine if questions hung together on the survey. From this, five composite scores were created. Environmental Behaviors consisted of four items ($\alpha = .596$, $M = 1.152$, $SE = 1.173$), Environmental Self Identity consisted of 3 items ($\alpha = .946$, $M = 5.181$, $SD = 2.089$), Attitude Towards Climate Change consisted of 4 items, one reverse scored ($\alpha = .935$, $M = 6.299$, $SD = 2.087$), Food Waste Concern consisted of two items ($\alpha = .652$, $M = 2.206$, $SD = 0.807$), and finally, Environmental Preferences
for the University consisted of three items ($\alpha = .768$, $M = 2.101$, $SD = .929$). Similar alphas, means, and standard deviations for the Self Identity were found by Lacasse in her 2016 study ($\alpha = .96$, $M = 5.95$, $SD = 2.45$) and for Attitude Towards Climate Change ($\alpha = .96$, $M = 6.97$, $SD = 2.75$). Moreover, on the Environmental Preferences for the University, the alpha found was comparable to Lamm’s $\alpha$ of .79 (2013). Participants recycling or trashing behavior and the presence or absence of the ZipGrow Tower were compared in a 2 x 2 chi-square $\chi^2 (1, N = 45) = .379, p = .538$. The null hypothesis failed to be rejected; the presence of the ZipGrow Tower did not influence recycling behaviors, see Figure 2. Bivariate correlations were run including the pilot data. There was a significant correlation found between Food and Waste Concern ($M = 2.10$) and participants asking whether or not they could recycle ($M = .157$). When participants were more concerned with where their food is from and the amount of waste people produce, they were more likely to ask if they could recycle, $r(70) = .266, p = .026$. Participants who reported more environmental behaviors (having meatless meals, taking shorter showers, buying organic food, and using eco-friendly cleaning products) also identified as being more environmentally aware [$r(72) = .418, p < .01$], were more concerned with food and waste [$r(72) = .421, p < .01$], and were more concerned about climate change [$r(72) = .316, p = .007$].

**Discussion**

It cannot be concluded that the presence or absence of the ZipGrow Tower influenced participants’ recycling behaviors. Moreover, the amount of PEBs completed, even if they were performed at least occasionally, did not predict recycling behaviors; neither did identifying as an environmentally friendly person, concern for climate change, concern for the way food is produced and waste production, or their preferences for Missouri State University’s sustainability efforts. It was found that participants who were concerned with how their food is grown and those with concern for waste production’s effects on the environment were more likely to ask about recycling. Fostering awareness and concern through environmental education is important. This is evident because when students were concerned with waste, they were more likely to ask. Positive correlations were found between performing environmental behaviors, identifying as environmentally aware, having higher concern for food and waste production, and having concern for climate change. These later results were consistent with Lacasse’s findings in her 2016 study.

Threats to internal and external validity were controlled to the best of the
researcher’s ability. However, threats to internal validity could have arisen from participants’ confusion on whether or not the plate was recyclable. Other studies could use an item that is identifiably recyclable like a plastic water bottle. The sample was only tested in the dining hall; in order to increase generalizability to campus as a whole, this study might be repeated in different settings such as dorms, department buildings, and offices. In the pilot, social modeling was not controlled. This affected the results substantially so students were called up one by one, eliminating social modeling as a confounding variable in the actual study. Assessing whether or not students perceive the environment as sustainable would strengthen the design of this experiment. Questions regarding participants perception of the environment could have been included in the demographics section. Since not all participants were aware of the ZipGrow Tower, another study could be run where the Tower is present for both groups. A question calling attention to the ZipGrow Tower, given before the observed recycling behavior, would serve as the manipulation. It was assumed that the ZipGrow Tower conveys an image of sustainability, which may not be the case.

Core information for the field of environmental psychology needs to be collected, which includes how valued the sustainability of the built environment is to students. Outcome evaluations on recycling programs are needed, given that a large majority of students were confused about recycling the plate. Other research might explore labeling the recycling bins differently. Future studies should look at what factors make an environment perceived as sustainable. Repeating this study in an environment perceived to be more sustainable, like Wu, DiGiacomo, Lenkic, Wong, and Kingstone’s 2016 study, would be beneficial. It is possible that the ZipGrow Tower’s presence was not enough for students to deem the space sustainable.

In the pilot study, social modeling was not controlled, and was seen to be a powerful moderator of PEB. The action of the first participant was repeated by every consecutive participant. In the first session of the pilot, all 10 participants put the plate in the trash, and in the second and third sessions, all participants recycled. The ZipGrow Tower was present for the pilot study. Since social input strongly shapes behavior, fostering pro-environmental values and behaviors is crucial. Studies looking at environmental knowledge versus pro-environmental norm behavior would help explain motives for pro-environmental behaviors.
References


Lacasse, K. (2016). Don’t be satisfied, identify! Strengthening positive spillover


APPENDIX

Sustainability Survey

Q1: What year in college are you?
   ◦ First
   ◦ Second
   ◦ Third
   ◦ Fourth
   ◦ Fifth+

Please specify your age here:

Q2: Where are you from?
   ◦ Asia
   ◦ Africa
   ◦ Europe
   ◦ Mexico
   ◦ South America
   ◦ United States
   ◦ Other
   ◦ Prefer not to answer

Q3: What is your gender?
   ◦ Male
   ◦ Female
   ◦ Other

Q4: Do you live on campus?
   ◦ Yes
   ◦ No

Q5: How often do you eat in the dining halls?
   ◦ Never
   ◦ Sometimes
   ◦ About half the time
   ◦ Most of the time
   ◦ Always
Behaviors

Instructions: The following is a list of behaviors that are related to a person’s carbon footprint and environmental impact. Each of these behaviors decrease the amount of greenhouse gas emissions released into the atmosphere, and limit a person’s individual impact on climate change. If you perform the behavior at least occasionally, then mark “true” for you. Otherwise mark that the behavior is “not true” for you.

Q6: I unplug appliances from the wall if they are not in use.
   ○ True
   ○ Not True

Q7: I purchase environmentally-friendly cleaning products.
   ○ True
   ○ Not True

Q8: I eat meatless meals.
   ○ True
   ○ Not True

Q9: I take showers that last less than 5 min.
   ○ True
   ○ Not True

Q10: I purchase local or organic foods.
    ○ True
    ○ Not True

Q11: Please type out the number of environmental behaviors from the list that you indicated “True” for: ________
**Self-Identity**

Instructions: Please read each statement, and indicate how much you agree or disagree with it.

Responses: 0 (Strongly disagree) to 10 (Strongly agree)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Options</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q12: Acting environmentally-friendly is an important part of who I am.</td>
<td>• 0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q13: I am the type of person who acts environmentally-friendly.</td>
<td>• 0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Perception

Instructions: Please report how much you agree or disagree with the following statement based on how you are feeling right now, when you think about how you responded to the environmental behaviors questionnaire.

Responses: 0 (Strongly disagree) to 10 (Strongly agree)

Q15: I feel guilty.

- 0
- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7
- 8
- 9
- 10
**Attitude**

Instructions: Please read each statement, and indicate how much you agree or disagree with it.

Responses: 0 (Strongly Disagree, Unconcerned) to 10 (Strongly Agree, Concerned)

Q16: I am concerned about the potential negative impacts of climate change.
- 0
- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7
- 8
- 9
- 10

Q17: I am not really worried about climate change.
- 0
- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7
- 8
- 9
- 10

Q18: Climate change is a serious problem.
- 0
- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7
- 8
- 9
- 10

Q19: I am worried about the potential negative impacts of climate change.
- 0
- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7
- 8
- 9
- 10
Sustainability Culture Assessment

Instructions: Please answer the following questions as truthfully as possible.

Q20: When choosing where to live, how important is being able to take the bus to campus?
  ◦ Extremely important
  ◦ Very important
  ◦ Moderately important
  ◦ Slightly important
  ◦ Not at all important

Q21: When choosing where to attend college, how important were the school’s sustainability efforts and programs?
  ◦ Extremely important
  ◦ Very important
  ◦ Moderately important
  ◦ Slightly important
  ◦ Not at all important

Q22: During the past year, how often did you use a reusable water bottle, coffee cup, travel mug, etc.?
  ◦ Did not use this in the past year
  ◦ Occasionally
  ◦ Sometimes
  ◦ Often
  ◦ All the time

Q23: How concerned are you about whether food is grown and produced in a way that is good for the environment?
  ◦ Not at all concerned
  ◦ Slightly concerned
  ◦ Somewhat concerned
  ◦ Quite concerned
  ◦ Extremely concerned

Q24: How concerned are you about people producing too much waste?
  ◦ Not at all concerned
  ◦ Slightly concerned
  ◦ Somewhat concerned
  ◦ Quite concerned
  ◦ Extremely concerned

Q25: Who or what have been the main influences in shaping your views about sustainability?
  ◦ Friends or Classmates
  ◦ Parents or other family
  ◦ K-12 teachers
  ◦ MSU Professors
  ◦ Childhood experiences
  ◦ Media

Q26: Have you ever taken a course at MSU that addressed sustainability?
  ◦ Yes
  ◦ No
  ◦ I don’t know

Q27: Overall, how would you rate/grade MSU’s sustainability efforts?
  ◦ Very Good
  ◦ Good
  ◦ Fair
  ◦ Poor
  ◦ Very Poor
Sustainability Importance

Q28: All things being equal, I would prefer to study at a university that cares about its impact on the environment.

◦ Not Important
◦ Slightly Important
◦ Somewhat Important
◦ Quite Important
◦ Very Important

Q29: It is important to me that MSU takes steps to implement efforts to be sustainable.

◦ Not Important
◦ Slightly Important
◦ Somewhat Important
◦ Quite Important
◦ Very Important

Q30: It is not important to me whether MSU is trying to reduce its use of nonrenewable resources.

◦ Not Important
◦ Slightly Important
◦ Somewhat Important
◦ Quite Important
◦ Very Important

Follow-Up Questions

Q31: Did you recycle your plate after eating the cookie provided?

◦ Yes
◦ No

Q32: Were you confused as to whether the plate was recyclable or not?

◦ Yes
◦ No

Q33: Did you notice the Zip Grow Tower in the dining hall directly before taking this survey?

◦ Yes
◦ No

Q34: Were you familiar of the Zip-Grow Towers at MSU far in advance, before taking this survey?

◦ Yes
◦ No
◦ Maybe
Figure 1. ZipGrow Tower (when the experiment was conducted, there was more vegetation).

Figure 2. Effect of the absence or presence of the ZipGrow Tower on participant’s recycling behavior.
College of Humanities and Public Affairs
Environment, Governance, and Conflict in Northern Nigeria and Darfur

Patricia Busch

Abstract

This research paper discusses what relationship exists, if any, between environmental change, governmental decision-making, and conflict in northern Nigeria and Darfur, Sudan. In particular, the research explores how climate change, desertification, and drought have affected the creation and scale of conflict in these areas. The essay introduces what environmental problems the regions are facing, the origins of each environmental issue, and how the governments handle them. Additionally, the research uses case studies on northern Nigeria and Darfur to compare factors driving conflict—environmental scarcity, poor governance, and weak institutions. Specifically, the paper considers whether the government plays a role in failing to prevent fighting—or may even be the source of conflict—due to harmful policies and ineffectual governance in dealing with natural resource management, land degradation, and climate change. These studies tie into how resource scarcity and marginalization generate the possibility of conflict—a challenge not only in Nigeria and Sudan, but also in many developing post-colonial states. After thorough examination, the research study finds that limited resources, a result of both environmental and institutional forces, have triggered conflicts over land and water in both northern Nigeria and Darfur, Sudan. Moreover, the Nigerian and Sudanese case studies lead to this paper’s conclusion that poor governance and inadequate institutions intensify resource scarcity that result in environmental problems, setting the stage for conflict.
**Introduction**

Nigeria’s inadequate distribution and availability of resources produces instability as citizens face the effects of land and water shortages, including economic hardships and starvation. These stresses could increase as the country continues to receive less rainfall while the global mean temperature increases, as predicted by international scientists (IPCC 2013, 20). With internal strife as a threat to national security, northern Nigeria must promptly address these environmental strains. However, the local and national Nigerian government, as well as the international community, has not had much success addressing violence over resource scarcity issues. This paper explores why and how the government’s poor evidence-based policymaking has resulted in clashes between pastoralists and agriculturalists. Furthermore, the cyclical nature of poor government response to resource shortages precipitating violence—bringing about greater land and water scarcity—is discussed.

In Sudan, similar pastoral-agricultural clashes occur, particularly in Darfur since the drought began in the 1970s. Massive displacement due to this drought, population growth, increasing desertification, and conflict has impacted not only the security of Sudan, but of surrounding states as well. Those that could make a difference—policymakers, activists, researchers, and other entities—have chosen to ignore the impact of climate change on the fighting in Sudan, instead focusing mostly on ethnicity, religion, and substandard governance. Emphasis on the environment is important, nonetheless, as climate change compounds these other causes of friction, triggering armed dissention over necessary resources such as water and crops. Moreover, another source of friction is the government’s failure to adequately monitor and regulate water sources and address conflict related to migration routes of pastoralists. Problems associated with the government’s insufficient natural resource management are furthered by the overgrazing of animals, drought, and famine, and lead to hostility between pastoralists and agriculturalists, similar to the circumstances in Nigeria.

Northern Nigeria and Darfur, Sudan were chosen as case studies because they face similar environmental issues in the Sahel, alongside weak institutional capacity and poor governance. Both suffer from desertification because of climate change, increasing population density, and poor environmental practices in areas where people rely on agriculture as their means of survival and livelihoods. Both governments have failed to implement effective land and water policies prior to issues and have poorly responded to changes in the environment. These cases are used to demonstrate the paper’s following argument:
environmental issues factor into why conflict happens, but weak institutional capacity, poor policymaking, and patronage networks that support the unequal distribution of resources mobilize people to fight over land and water resources. While environmental issues may not be a direct cause of intrastate conflict, the consequences of resource scarcity, poverty, displacement, and hunger—exacerbated by grievances with the state—prompt unrest.

**Theoretical Overview**

As scientists analyze and release more research and findings about climate change, desertification, and predictions of resource shortages—such as water and arable land—research about resource scarcity’s role in intrastate conflict is increasingly relevant. The Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC), a body of international climate scientists that provides policymakers with climate assessments and response options, notes in its Fifth Assessment Report (2013) that humans’ continuous emission of greenhouse gases will intensify global warming and the effects of climate change (19). The resulting deterioration of the planet will impact agriculture, economies, and, notably, humans’ interactions over access to land, water, and other resources. If it holds true that environmental degradation correlates with conflict, the international community must be aware that the development of climate change will result in a significant increase of conflict around the world. Moreover, if substandard governance affects how environmental scarcity impacts a population, research on this topic is imperative to projecting where “future international resource conflicts are likely to occur [to] guide policy focus and allow for preventative diplomacy” (Giordano 2005, 48). Political scientists must have a theoretical framework capable of predicting and mitigating conflict related to environmental change.

The most simplified approach in prior research concludes that environmental scarcity directly impacts conflict: If more demand for a resource exists than there is a supply, groups will fight over control of said resource (David 2006/2007, 6). John W. Maxwell and Rafael Reuveny (2000) assert that resource scarcity in the least developed countries “plays a pivotal role in initiating or exacerbating conflict” (303), and in areas of less development, resource scarcities are more devastating (302). However, most researchers now note that a mere lack of supply and heightened demand cannot adequately predict where conflict will happen (Giorano 2005, 53). Val Percival and Thomas Homer-Dixon (1998) suggest the supply and demand theory as a factor, yet offer a third source of resource-based conflict: “an unequal social distribution of a
resource that concentrates it in the hands of relatively few people while the remaining population suffers from serious shortages” (280). These grievances against the state for unfairly allocating resources can cause individuals to form groups to change the situation. Groups frequently demand that the state provide necessary resources while the state has less resources to do so, decreasing the state’s authority in the eyes of its people and laying the grounds for civil unrest (281–282). If grievances about resource concentration can trigger conflict, then research should focus on a state’s ability to precipitate or reduce conflict.

Mark Giordano and Meredith Giordano (2005) criticize the supply and demand theory of resource scarcity and conflict and propose examining the regimes and institutions in charge of dealing with conflict over environmental stresses (47). In their piece, “International Resource Conflict and Mitigation,” the authors argue “conflict is most likely to emerge in those areas where resource sovereignty is ill-defined or nonexistent, where existing institutional regimes are destroyed by political change, and/or where rapid changes in resource environments may outpace the capacity of institutions to deal with the change” (61). This state-centric institutional approach is the main theoretical framework for this research paper as institutional weakness and poor policy-making—from factors such as those mentioned by Giordano and Giordano—allow environmental problems and resource scarcity to impact populations so harshly that conflict emerges or intensifies. For an institutional analysis, it is important to define what institutions entail to understand their role in conflict. Yujiro Hayami and Vernon W. Ruttan (1985) define institutions as “the rules of a society or of organizations that facilitate coordination among people...[and] reflect the conventions that have evolved...regarding...behavior” (94). One must understand a state’s institutions and regimes to understand the context in which environmental problems occur, particularly if the state is involved in why these issues have the impact they do.

Marc A. Levy (1995), author of “Is the Environment a National Security Issue?,” opposes the resource scarcity engendering conflict narrative. Levy argues that researchers trying to link environmental degradation directly to the deterioration of security have “no basis except as a rhetorical device aimed at drumming up greater support for measures to protect the environment” (36). Instead, he suggests that environmental issues indirectly impact conflict alongside many other considerations (61). The theory of resource-based conflict has evolved to show that resource scarcity can factor into violent conflict, but also vice versa. Maxwell and Reuveny (2000) emphasize the “importance of the bidirectional interplay between conflict and resource scarcity, as opposed to the unidirectional notion that resource scarcity leads to conflict” (301). Charles-
Philippe David and Jean-François Gagné (2006/2007) also acknowledge the multidirectional ability of these factors: “Environmental scarcity hampers economic productivity, spawns mass migrations and produces other ill effects... [that] snowball and further limit the state’s capacity to adapt to environmental scarcity” (8).

The international community has particular interest in Africa as a breeding ground of instability. With militant organizations such as the Islamic State in West Africa (also known as Boko Haram) in addition to many intrastate conflicts, it is important to understand both the plight of those facing environmental issues and the factors in the region that may increase conflict. Religion and ethnicity narratives drive research on conflict in these states, but researchers must examine other elements that may drive conflict that seem ethnically or religiously driven. For example, David and Gagné (2006/2007) see a pattern of resource-based conflict occurring in “very weak postcolonial regimes that are dependent on export revenues from one or a few natural resources” (16). Trends of increasing demand from population growth and higher consumption, decreasing renewable resources, and disproportionate resource dispersal within poor countries “create an increasing probability of serious environmental scarcity...that fuel preexisting grievances, such as ethnic, religious, or economic marginalization” (7). For this reason, Nigeria and Sudan are helpful case studies because they historically have conflict relating to ethnicity and religion. Strains such as drought, deforestation, and soil depletion increase already-high tensions and promote hostility, and ethnicity and religion are used as mobilizing forces for groups with disputes over land and water.

While past literature establishes a connection between resource scarcity and conflict, it often fails to take into account the negligence of regimes to mediate conflict over resource shortage and to create robust policy to make land or water ownership clear. Moreover, it rarely emphasizes the explicit involvement of a regime in the misappropriation of resources, favoring one group over others. The Nigerian and Sudanese cases are used to refine current theories of resource scarcity with a broader evaluation of the cyclical interaction between poor governance and its effects on environmental issues and conflict. The following research on northern Nigeria and Darfur links historically inadequate policymaking and practices with regions facing intense strains on the environment. Understanding that governance or lack thereof plays a role in the daily lives of citizens, this paper seeks to answer to what degree government functioning impacts environmental issues and associated consequences such as resource depletion, conflict, and further environmental strains.
Environmental Issues and Resource Scarcity

Before examining northern Nigerian and Darfuran resource-based conflict, it is important to note the environmental problems the two areas are facing. Moreover, research in the resource scarcity-related conflict field must pay attention to the causes and factors linked with these issues, such as climate change, growing global population, and harmful environmental practices. In Nigeria, erratic rainfall patterns, severe weather, and rising temperatures accelerate desertification and drought (Onyia 2015, 181). Similar to fifteen other states in the Sahel region, 63.83% of Nigeria’s once arable land is rapidly converting into desert (Olagunju 2015, 196). The outcomes of these environmental pressures severely impact the economic livelihood and health of millions. As the land quality deteriorates and water availability decreases, land becomes unsuitable for farming or grazing.

Human activities for survival also increase environmental degradation in Nigeria. The custom of many African farmers to use slash-and-burn techniques to produce short-term fertility in already depleted soil greatly harms vegetation and in turn engenders desertification (Olagunju 2015, 201). Overpopulation in urban areas creates an additional strain on the environment. As the population increases, more food is needed; consequently, deforestation occurs as the demand grows for agricultural land to feed the population (Falola 2011, 11). Another explanation for deforestation is that wood fuels 70% of the energy in Nigeria because few energy alternatives, such as petroleum, can be transported to the rural population without adequate roads. Furthermore, deforestation occurs when pastoralists chop down trees so goats may graze on higher leaves, provoking farmers because it accelerates desertification on their fields (UNEP 2006, 389). Clearing trees and other plants contributes to desertification by degrading the soil and removing what vegetation was able to grow in those conditions (Olagunju 2015, 201). In conclusion, citizens degrade land for temporary solutions without giving adequate attention to the long-term impact on the already-struggling environment.

Sudan, also in the Sahel region, faces many of the same environmental problems as Nigeria. Agriculturalists’ productivity has diminished due to the many rounds of droughts Sudan has faced since the 1970s. At the same time, Darfur’s population has increased “from 1.3 million in 1969 to about 6 million in 2007” (Suliman 2011, 56). The need for more food has caused a higher density of farming in arable areas, but this furthers the growth of desertification south of the Sahara (Akasha 2014, 32). As the need for food grows, the need for livestock grows with it. According to Osman Suliman (2011), author
of “Poor Governance and Institutional Failures,” desertification decreases productivity on the deteriorated land, causing agriculturalists to augment their livestock numbers “to make up for the revenue foregone from the lower levels of productivity, [accelerating the] exhaustion of the soil and erosion” (57). At the same time, desertification reduces the land pastoralists may utilize for migration routes, resulting in greater concentrations of livestock in a given area. This produces overgrazing and stress on both water and land resources (60). Agriculture is threatened; consequently, Darfurians’ means of living are threatened.

The success of agriculture is a necessity not only to feed Darfur’s people, but also because most citizens “earn their livelihoods through subsistence agriculture, either farming or pastoralist” (Akasha 2014, 13). Nevertheless, drought and growing desertification has led to the displacement of over five million Sudanese (22) and has led to sub-Saharan Africa having “the highest percentage of malnourished inhabitants in the world, with nearly 70 percent of people living in a state of chronic hunger” (Adano 2012, 1). Displacement induces a large stress on vegetation and water sources and contributes to famine as seen in Sudan over the years (Suliman 2011, 60). Harry Verhoeven (2011) asserts in “Climate Change, Conflict and Development in Sudan: Global Neo-Malthusian Narratives and Local Power Struggles” that the famines occurred in large part due to farming techniques. Verhoeven argues:

Environmentalist advice was ignored, whether about the risks of capital-intensive farming depleting soils, [or] using up groundwater (or being overly dependent on seasonal rains in areas with a notoriously erratic climate).... Unsustainable methods were adopted by absentee landlords who were driven by political motives or the desire to make money quickly....These civil servants, urban elites and army personnel lacked know-how, and preferred to exhaust their lands and then move on, realizing they could rely on extra-legal ways to confiscate new land which was easier than re-investing in old plots. (689–690)

Poor land quality and an unstable water supply—effects of climate change—exacerbates conditions in areas already struggling with access to food (690). This causes Darfurians to use unsustainable agricultural methods to survive. Because environmental factors relate to the economics, health, and wellbeing of Darfur’s people, further examination is required into the correlation between environmental issues, government response, and potential resulting conflict.
Inept Governance and Ineffectual Institutions

Poor political leadership contributes to Nigeria's inability to deal with natural resource management and desertification; this failure extends to preventing conflict relating to pastoralists and agriculturalists. According to Simon Milligan and Tony Binns (2007), authors of “Crisis in Policy, Policy in Crisis: Understanding Environmental Discourse and Resource-Use Conflict in Northern Nigeria,” Nigerian political leaders lack strategy, consensus building, and commitment to creating evidence-based environmental policy (152). During their research, they observed “partisan practices, poor transparency,” and large power inequality among citizens (148). For example, Milligan and Binns found political marginalization of Ful’be pastoralists, burdened by the absence of a “‘political space’ to defend their rights, thus creating resentment and feelings of injustice” (148). As with Percival and Homer-Dixon’s (1998) theory on groups forming as a result of grievances with the state (280), these governmental practices set the stage for conflict among those not benefiting from policies that could adequately address the environmental factors leading to poverty and unreliable access to food.

Inadequate governance has led to many citizens not respecting governmental authority or migration law. Nigerian politicians’ inability to control migration routes in the north have produced “earlier migratory movements, as pastoralists depart wet season and early dry season pastures in the quest for access to late dry season pastures before the arrival of others” (Milligan 2007, 146). Livestock eat and trample on growing crops agriculturalists must sell to survive. As a result, agriculturalists feel unheard because the government does not respond to their legitimate concerns over their economic livelihoods. They then focus their anger on the pastoralists destroying the limited arable land.

Furthermore, the structure of Nigeria’s governmental institutions inherently creates difficulties in preventing conflict and further environmental harm. National legislators have little investment in citizens besides those from their district (Falola 2011, 256). Laws are created and enforced to benefit the elites—those doing the majority of damage to the environment—rather than those who face the most repercussions of environmental problems—the poor (Olagunju 2015, 206). This corruption prevents legitimate, positive change from combating desertification (206). While the government used to respond to struggles over land use, it no longer does (Milligan 2007, 143). Accordingly, Toyin Falola and Adam Paddock (2011) claim in their book, Environment and Economics in Nigeria, “the only solution [to these land use conflicts] is to reorganize the Nigerian State and to restore a sense of representative government
that includes transparency and responsiveness to all minority groups” (12). Thus, the federal government must restructure political institutions to better represent all citizens and their environmental concerns.

Local governance and the power it yields also plays a role in environmental regulation. Local governments have the most power at the local level through controlling and managing land due to the Land Use Act of 1978. But, according to Milligan and Binns (2007), the local governments lack the proper manpower and finances to create and implement policy (152). Although lower level governments typically have a better understanding of local needs and directly deal with conflict management, this level of government holds no significant power within the structuring of the Nigerian government to regulate or enforce. This causes local governments to yield to higher up political figures as the ones with actual influence in policymaking (152). Consequently, “technical expertise within the civil service is neither always utilized nor provided to the political decision-makers, and systems of patronage open and close off avenues for political debate” (152). Like Falola and Paddock, Milligan and Binns call for changes in Nigerian institutions to incorporate the marginalized into policymaking and to better respond to the state’s environmental problems (152). By reducing the power and voice of the local governments that need the most national governmental support, Nigerian policymakers are able to ignore land management issues that set the stage for conflict.

The government’s lack of evidence-based environmental regulation policy corresponds with the inadequate funding for research, untimely access to information, and the government’s lack of motivation, strategy, and consensus building on environmental issues, resulting in clashes between pastoralists and agriculturalists (Milligan 2007, 152). The inappropriate distribution of financial resources also harms the large population in northern Nigeria whose livelihood depends on agricultural success. Unlike other agrarian-based countries, the Nigerian government does not subsidize the agricultural sector with grants or loans (Onyia 2015, 188). The government largely neglects the agricultural sector and prioritizes its budget to oil in southern Nigeria. Chukwuma Onyia (2015) contends in “Climate Change and Conflict in Nigeria: The Boko Haram Challenge” that the resources allocated to the agricultural sector are “grossly inadequate to support subsistent [sic] farming in such a way that could cushion environmental effects of climate change—particularly drought” (187). Because drought is not adequately addressed, northern Nigerians must deal with the consequences: “crop failure; high and rising food prices; distress sale of animals; de-capitalization; impoverishment, hunger, and famine” (187). Nigerians’ displeasure with this impoverished state of living translates into des-
operation to survive, which influences conflict over resources. Accordingly, the government’s failure to address agricultural issues plays a substantial role in resource scarcity related conflict.

**Interventionist Legacies**

Colonialism and interventionism also impact environmental policymaking in Nigeria. When the British colonized Nigeria, their harsh techniques used for agriculture, mining, and transportation had negative consequences for the environment. Once Nigeria gained independence, “Nigerian governments largely failed to effectively correct the environmental and infrastructure problems left by British colonialism, and to some extent those problems have been exacerbated in the last twenty years” (Falola 2011, 257). Nonetheless, outside influences did not entirely leave once Nigeria gained independence. While some donor funding is spent countering desertification, corrupt political elites direct most if not all of that money elsewhere, particularly to patronage systems (Olagunju 2015, 206). Although outside sources have respectable intentions in intervening in this conflict and in fighting desertification, their assistance is not always successful at addressing the root issues. The donor institutions that try to implement effective policy can only temporarily address the environmental issues and not fix the systemic governance and policymaking problems behind these issues. The Nigerian government, of course, welcomes donor funding since it retains control over its own involvement (Milligan 2007, 152). While important that states have control over resources dedicated to combating their own issues, legacies of corruption with donor funding complicate the matter. If donor funding enables corruption while doing nothing to combat the serious problems citizens face, outside influences are not helping to fix resource scarcity and other environmental issues that influence conflict.

**Sudanese Land Management**

In Sudan, changes in land tenure present an immense challenge to sustainable land use that could combat land degradation. Before the 1970s, customary law determined land and natural resource ownership. People informally shared collective titles to agricultural land—a situation that worked well—until the 1970s brought along laws that ignored Darfur’s informal institutions (Suliman 2011, 59). The laws designated much of Sudan’s agricultural land as government property, causing many to now farm and graze their animals on government property (59). Without titles on the land, one cannot do much judicially to solve encroachment on farming or migration land, thus creating conflict and allowing those who are “more economically powerful or better
armed” to take over land (59). Whereas before customary laws resolved conflicts over land through mediation, the 1970s laws removed these ways to solve conflicts and did not replace it with a new means (UNEP 2007, 83). Moreover, because people do not own the land they farm or graze livestock on, they are not as concerned about sustaining the land and protecting natural resources (Suliman 2011, 59–60). As Giordano and Giordano (2005) theorized, areas in which resource control is not clearly defined and institutions deteriorate alongside political change have a higher likelihood of conflict (61). In this context, the failure of the Sudanese government to regulate land tenure results in environmental degradation that leads to conflict over land. Thus, violent land disputes in Sudan transpire as the result of the failure of institutions to mediate dissention and make land usage rights clear.

The analysis of the UNEP (2004) case study on “Communal Conflicts in Darfur Region, Western Sudan” shows that, whereas government leaders before the early 1980s helped regulate pastoral migratory routes, local governments currently do not enforce these laws and therefore pastoralists and agriculturalists do not follow them (4). Rather than traditional leaders managing local affairs—such as enforcing “strict regulations on the timing and route of pastoral migrations”—as in the past, government administrators, “seen as inexperienced and [lacking] credibility...have been unable to establish effective laws” (UNEP 2006, 389). However, as Sudan moved into the 1990s, the government’s role was minimized while not having local traditional government regain the level of authority it once had. The government controlled and supervised the water supply before that point, but after 1990 it delegated the responsibility to communities without giving proper support from the national water ministry (UNEP 2004, 3). This ministry is responsible for managing water resources, but does not possess the technical knowledge to make necessary decisions allocating resources over conflict (8). For example, settled communities control and manage water pumps, but when pastoralists engage in violence against these communities, the settled people migrate elsewhere. This results in water pumps that no longer work because they are not maintained, which causes pastoralists to create new routes that trigger another conflict (3). This dire situation over water scarcity could even prompt conflict in the future “between countries sharing a common major water source,” so governments must maintain water systems to prevent water conflict within and outside their territory (UNEP 2002, 317). In a community that is economically based on agriculture and pastoralism and struggles with environmental issues, there must be an authoritative government with strong policies in place to prevent violence over environmental resources vital to survival.
Patronage and Misaligned Agendas

Verhoeven (2011) emphasizes that the power struggle among elites competing for resources and wealth has had dire effects on the environment and the institutions responsible for protecting the natural resources (679). Resource scarcity and resulting conflict are the products of the political elite and their corresponding patronage systems, burdening the rural pastoralists and farmers while supporting their clientele (691). While climate conditions exist that create land degradation and drought, “what really matters are the long-term processes of marginalization and scarcity creation—the conditions that make people vulnerable to ‘natural’ disasters by shaping the livelihood strategies available to them” (693). This results in poverty and food shortages. Verhoeven remarks that much like in Nigeria, Sudan uses the climate change crisis narrative not only to receive funding from donors for “development,” but also to conceal the role the regime plays in the problem. By highlighting the pastoralist-farmer conflict in Darfur as a result of climate change, the state can obfuscate its own patronage networks and violence that generated the inequality and conflict over land and water resources to begin with (695). This allows for outside actors to intervene “in ways that can be extremely harmful for local communities” (701), rather than addressing the root of the conflict—the government’s failure to govern and regulate land policy.

The Cyclical Nature of Conflicts

As the Nigerian government now admits that the pastoral-agricultural fighting constitutes “a significant threat to the internal security of the nation” (Milligan 2007, 145), it is significant to note not only how environmental issues and poor governance have led to conflict, but also how conflict has led to resource shortages. More than three-quarters of northern Nigerians rely on agriculture as their source of wages (Onyia 2015, 186), suggesting that when crop and livestock productivity is low, many Nigerians have an insufficient income and face poverty. This influences pastoralists to migrate south with their livestock towards areas without as much desertification and environmental damage (188). This gives way to pastoralist-agriculturalist clashes over livestock grazing on farmers’ crops where the groups are “both agents and victims of the crises described” (Milligan 2007, 145–146). Another example of how poverty from low crop and livestock production impacts the conflict in northern Nigeria involves younger agriculturalists who move to urban areas to look for better employment. “The migrant youths lack formal education and skills vital for survival in urban areas,” and little to no social welfare exists to assist the youths,
which allows religious militant groups, such as Boko Haram, to indoctrinate the unemployed youths against the state while providing for their basic needs (Onyia 2015, 188). By ignoring the agricultural problems of northern Nigerians, the Nigerian government risks harming its citizens economically and therefore creating larger anti-government forces that produce violence.

Climate change not only influences resource shortages that indirectly provoke conflict; conflict itself contributes to resources shortages, which makes this a cyclical problem. Negligent government responses to conflict result in scarce land and water resources—driving more displacement, death, and poverty, which in turn leads back to conflict (Sayne 2011, 3). Aaron Sayne (2011), author of “Climate Change Adaptation and Conflict in Nigeria,” published by the United States Institute of Peace, displays in Figure 1 the relationship between conflict, poor responses, and environment. Observing this connection is critical because adequate governmental responses could end the cycle of resource scarcity and the secondary impacts that lead to conflict.
Described as “the world’s first climate change conflict” (Verhoeven 2011, 679), the fighting in Darfur has massive implications for future crises related to the environment. Conflict in Darfur not only impacts Sudan’s national security, but also the national security of other states in Africa, such as Chad and the Central African Republic, “resulting in [between 200,000 and 500,000] civilian deaths, the widespread destruction of villages and forests, and the displacement of [over two million] victims into camps for protection, food and water” (UNEP 2007, 75). As published in the 2007 United Nations Environmental Programme (UNEP) report, Sudan: Post-Conflict Environmental Assessment, four environmental factors contribute to the Darfur conflict over land: supply, demand, land use (and sharing of these resources), and institutional and development factors (84). Darfur faces problems over the supply of land due to
desertification, soil erosion and exhaustion, deforestation, and climate change, which decreases the productivity of agriculture (83). Meanwhile, greater demand for arable land exists with large population growth on behalf of humans and livestock (85). With decreasing grazing land for increasing amounts of livestock to graze due to desertification and drought, this creates the third factor of conflict: issues over land. Furthermore, agriculturalists expanding farms to increase their low crop productivity encroaches on migratory routes for pastoralists—an institutional and developmental factor of conflict. This makes it harder for pastoralists to find water and crops to graze on and is complicated by the fact “that sedentary farmers are increasingly raising their own livestock, and are hence less willing to give grazing rights to nomads in transit” (UNEP 2007, 85). Simultaneously, the drought and desertification in Northern Darfur has meant that pastoralists have had to change their routes to areas that have more access to water and crops (UNEP 2004, 3). However, it is often difficult to find arable land unclaimed by other pastoralists or agriculturalists.

Pastoralists have several approaches to cope with this, but they tend to involve possible conflict. They might try to “[compete] directly with other grazers for preferred areas of higher productivity…[have their] livestock [infringe] on cropland without consent…[or try to reduce] competition by forcing other pastoralists and agriculturalists off previously shared land” (UNEP 2007, 86). Furthermore, UNEP’s 2004 case study explains that pastoralists have a “long-term strategy of destabilizing large parts of Darfur in order to force people off productive land to gain control of it for themselves” and have become well-armed with weapons (4). By involving violence in the dispute, the situation becomes much more complex (UNEP 2007, 83). Pastoralists and agriculturalists have ignored land rights laws, and the government has been unable to respond to land disputes through mediation (UNEP 2004, 4). The 2007 United Nations Environmental Programme (UNEP) report, Sudan: Post-Conflict Environmental Assessment, best shows the frequency of Darfurian conflict over grazing and water rights in Figure 2, “Causes of local conflicts in Darfur from 1930 to 2000” (82).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Tribal groups involved</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Main cause of conflict</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Kababish, Kawahlia, Berti and Medoub</td>
<td>1932</td>
<td>Grazing and water rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Kababish, Medoub and Zyadiya</td>
<td>1957</td>
<td>Grazing and water rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Rezeigat, Baggara and Maalia</td>
<td>1968</td>
<td>Local politics of administration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Rezeigat, Baggara and Dinka</td>
<td>1975</td>
<td>Grazing and water rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Beni Helba, Zyadiya and Mahriya</td>
<td>1976</td>
<td>Grazing and water rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Northern Rezeigat (Abbala) and Dego</td>
<td>1976</td>
<td>Grazing and water rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>N Rezeigat (Abbala) and Bargo</td>
<td>1978</td>
<td>Grazing and water rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>N Rezeigat and Gimir</td>
<td>1978</td>
<td>Grazing and water rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>N Rezeigat and Fur</td>
<td>1980</td>
<td>Grazing and water rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>N Rezeigat (Abbala) and Bargo</td>
<td>1980</td>
<td>Grazing and water rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Taasha and Salamat</td>
<td>1980</td>
<td>Local politics of administration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Kababish, Berti and Zyadiya</td>
<td>1981</td>
<td>Grazing and water rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Rezeigat, Baggara and Dinka</td>
<td>1981</td>
<td>Grazing and water rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>N Rezeigat and Beni Helba</td>
<td>1982</td>
<td>Grazing and water rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Kababish, Kawahlia, Berti and Medoub</td>
<td>1982</td>
<td>Grazing and water rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Rezeigat and Mysserlya</td>
<td>1983</td>
<td>Grazing and water rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Kababish, Berti and Medoub</td>
<td>1984</td>
<td>Grazing and water rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Rezeigat and Mysserlya</td>
<td>1984</td>
<td>Grazing and water rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Gimir and Fellata (Falani)</td>
<td>1987</td>
<td>Administrative boundaries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Kababish, Kawahlia, Berti and Medoub</td>
<td>1987</td>
<td>Grazing and water rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Fur and Bidayat</td>
<td>1989</td>
<td>Armed robberies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Arab and Fur</td>
<td>1989</td>
<td>Grazing, cross-boundary politics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Zaghawa and Gimir</td>
<td>1990</td>
<td>Administrative boundaries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Zaghawa and Gimir</td>
<td>1990</td>
<td>Administrative boundaries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Taasha and Gimir</td>
<td>1990</td>
<td>Land</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Bargo and Rezeigat</td>
<td>1990</td>
<td>Grazing and water rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Zaghawa and Maalia</td>
<td>1991</td>
<td>Land</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>Zaghawa and Manareit</td>
<td>1991</td>
<td>Grazing and water rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Zaghawa and Beni Hussein</td>
<td>1991</td>
<td>Grazing and water rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Zaghawa, Mima and Birgid</td>
<td>1991</td>
<td>Grazing and water rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Zaghawa and Birgid</td>
<td>1991</td>
<td>Grazing and water rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Zaghawa and Birgid</td>
<td>1991</td>
<td>Grazing and water rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Fur and Turqum</td>
<td>1991</td>
<td>Land</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Zaghawa and Arab</td>
<td>1994</td>
<td>Grazing and water rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Zaghawa Sudan and Zaghawa Chad</td>
<td>1994</td>
<td>Power and politics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Masait and Arab</td>
<td>1996</td>
<td>Grazing, administration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>Zaghawa and Rezeigat</td>
<td>1997</td>
<td>Local politics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>Kababish Arabs and Medoub</td>
<td>1997</td>
<td>Grazing and water rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>Masait and Arab</td>
<td>1996</td>
<td>Grazing, administration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>Zaghawa and Gimir</td>
<td>1999</td>
<td>Grazing, administration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>Fur and Arab</td>
<td>2000</td>
<td>Grazing, politics, armed robberies</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Figure 2.* United Nations Environmental Programme (UNEP). 2007. Causes of local conflicts in Darfur from 1930 to 2000. In Sudan: Post-Conflict Environmental Assessment. Image courtesy of UNEP.
Pastoralist livestock routes from northern Darfur to the south encroach on farmland because their livestock—pastoralists’ economic livelihoods—require grazing land and water sources that no longer exist in the expanding path of desertification. Although this is a major issue for pastoralists, livestock trampling on fields disrupts crop cultivation and consequently impacts agriculturalists’ livelihoods as well, which can cause violence between pastoralists and agriculturalists (UNEP 2004, 2). This competition between pastoralists and agriculturalists “further aggravates the already uneasy political, social, and ethnic relationships in the Darfur region” (Akasha 2014, 8), particularly when certain groups feel as though the “government is intentionally ignoring the development of Darfur” (14). Pastoralist-agriculturalist conflicts have resulted in massive displacement and casualties and require better policymaking addressing environmental problems to resolve fighting.

**Conclusion**

It would be remiss to assert that environmental problems and poor governance are the only causes of the Sudanese and Nigerian conflicts. The violence in these countries is much more complicated and is connected with issues such as ethnicity, tribal division, economics, and religion. The juxtaposition of these cases suggests that depleted and degraded natural resources precipitates competition; in particular, when the government has not played an active role in implementing policy that lessens the impact of climate change or even marginalizes communities, it increases the impact of environmental deterioration. In northern Nigeria, local governments with little voice and power, the national government’s marginalization of pastoralists and farmers, and international intervention without addressing root issues compounds on problems of deforestation, desertification, and water shortages. Darfur’s minimalized government, changes in customary law that leave land usage rights unregulated and unmonitored, and patronage—an issue of both Nigeria and Sudan—lead to serious consequences, such as poverty and a lack of food. Violent disputes over water and arable land resources in northern Nigeria and Darfur result from both governments failing their people with poor practices and policymaking, as well as environmental problems related to climate change and unsustainable practices.

This research on northern Nigeria and Darfur contributes to the body of environmental security literature by emphasizing that resource scarcity—whether from climate change, poor agricultural practices, or conflict—needs to be adequately addressed by robust institutions, policy, and governmental
practices. When policymaking marginalizes groups or policies do not exist to prevent or mitigate problems, it aggravates resource scarcity-related problems that occur during subsistence farming and livestock practices necessary for survival. Moreover, these studies reveal what may happen in other states in the Sahel and other areas dealing with severe environmental issues if their governments and institutions are not strong enough to handle these problems. Looking at both the northern Nigerian and Darfurian cases gives insight into the future of high-risk populations from climate change that are also plagued by weak governance and institutions as well as interventionist legacies.

Both scholars and leaders have framed environmental problems and climate change as a global security threat. Although it is predicted that Earth’s resource supply will decrease while demand will increase, this does not explicitly lead to future conflict. Rather, if the international community works with individuals and states, risk reduction is possible. It is crucial to figure out how to save the environment and resources, and focus on building and maintaining institutions that can withstand issues of resource scarcity and environmental degradation to prevent and predict interstate and intrastate conflict. The international community must provide better technical support to agriculturalists and pastoralists to prevent environmental degradation while holding governments more accountable for how they use donor funding, how policy is developed and implemented, and how land, water, and other resources are distributed. Further research on the interactions between resource scarcity, environmental issues, and governance is imperative for understanding where environment-based conflict may occur and how to prevent it.
REFERENCES


Walking the Path of Cold Mountain

Brendan Diedrich

Abstract

The poetry of Cold Mountain has impacted generations, extending from Chinese civil servants to American beat poets. Touching on everything from wealth inequality to Buddhist parables, the poems left behind captured a transition in China’s Tang Dynasty. Changing from a traditional, homogenous society to one embracing the outside world, Cold Mountain fuses traditional Daoist motifs with emerging Buddhist ideals. Yet, despite the corpus of poems left behind, the identity of Cold Mountain remains a mystery. Only by deeply analyzing the poems themselves can one understand the identity of this reclusive poet. Looking through religious, linguistic, and thematic lenses can reveal a deeper meaning beyond an English translation.

自羡山間樂，
逍遙無倚托。
逐日養殘軀，
閒思無所作。
時披古佛書，
往往登石閣。
下窺千尺崖，
上有雲盤泊。
寒月冷颼颼，
身似孤飛鶴。

Cold Mountain 259

I love the joys of the mountains, 
wandering completely free.
Feeding a crippled body another day, 
thinking thoughts that go nowhere.

Sometimes I open a sutra, 
more often I climb a stone tower.
And peer down a thousand-foot cliff, 
Or up where clouds curl around.
Where the windblown winter moon, 
Looks like a lone-flying crane.
Throughout China’s history, the greatest art form has been poetry. During particularly tumultuous times, some of China’s greatest poets have joined a historical literary canon on par with the Confucian classics. One poet, Cold Mountain (Pinyin: Hánshān 寒山) emerged at the time of China’s renaissance during the Tang Dynasty (618–907 CE), merging new religious attitudes with ancient beliefs. The Tang produced a society embracing cosmopolitanism, feeling traditions, and questioned futures. After the failed military coup known as the An Lu Shan Rebellion (755–763 CE), the Tang failed to recover their place in heaven. In less than 150 years, the dynasty split into a collection of small states and short-lived dynasties before being reunified by the Song Dynasty in 960 CE. Buddhism had made its way into the imperial court by the An Lu Shan Rebellion, and its acceptance as a state religion allowed for traditional Chinese philosophies to merge with Buddhism. During this fusion, the legendary figure and recluse poet Cold Mountain began to write, yet his identity remains a mystery. Achieving Bodhisattva status in Zen Buddhism, legend holds that he wrote vernacular language poetry on unorthodox surfaces like bamboo bark, trees, and walls of temples. Despite their desired impermanence, the poems of Cold Mountain transcend time. Influencing generations from Chinese civil servants to American beat poets, the works left behind have fascinated historians, philosophers, and writers for generations.

Translator and author Burton Watson wrote, “[if] the reader wishes to know the biography of Han-shan, he must deduce it from the poems themselves.” This is truly the only way to understand the life, the philosophy, and the thoughts of Cold Mountain. Throughout these poems, the name “Cold Mountain” appears in different contexts. Either as a person, a state of mind, or a physical place, there are many paths to Cold Mountain. In his book, On Cold Mountain: A Buddhist Reading of the Hanshan Poems, Paul Rouzer became the first English language scholar to write an extensive commentary on the Cold Mountain poems. Yet, despite the lengths Rouzer takes to display the poems through a Buddhist lens, he fails to go far enough to guide a reader through Cold Mountain. Here an irony is present, as at times Cold Mountain shows disdain for those obsessed with studying the classics. Any more scholarship beyond Rouzer would continue to go against Cold Mountain’s personal philosophy on the poetry. Yet, a proper, all-consuming analysis of Cold Mountain has

1 Bodhisattvas are believed to be enlightened beings, destined to become a buddha and help others along towards enlightenment.
2 Red Pine, 9.
yet to be written. This paper explores the different ways of looking at Hanshan’s poetry through religious, linguistic, and philosophical points of view. Only by diving deep within the poems themselves can one discover the true thesis of Cold Mountain.

Perhaps it is better to view the poetry collection through multiple lenses, or genres, that capture a unique fusion of outer Daoist knowledge and inner Buddhist spirituality. Three distinct types of poems are found in the collection: biography, philosophy, and commentary.⁴ Admittedly, not all the poems are easily classified. Some fall into more than one category and others are parables, exhibiting no strong identity. Reading the poems through multiple lenses raises questions on the nature of Cold Mountain’s message. Alongside contemporaries of the Tang, Cold Mountain’s poetry generally follows the rules of regulated verse (lǜshī 律詩), characterized by eight lines of five, six, or seven syllables each. Cold Mountain breaks away from the prescribed tonal patterns of regulated verse to “create a brief vignette: each verse is long enough for some rhetorical elaboration, but short enough to contain an aphoristic punch.”⁵

While finding one’s own path toward Cold Mountain should be the first step, a guided reading can help to navigate beyond the surface level within the poems. With issues of problematic dating and a forged biography, viewing the Cold Mountain poems through different genres can allow readers to capture an all-encompassing image of Cold Mountain in its many forms.

As in any ancient poetry, meaning can be lost in translation; only by analyzing Cold Mountain’s poems in both English and Chinese can a deeper meaning arise. Comparing these poems with Tang contemporary poets—such as his friends Pick-Up (Shídé 拾得), Big Stick (Fènggān 丰干), and masters of prose like Du Fu and Wang Fangzhi—contextualizes the world inhabited by Cold Mountain. Walking along the path toward Cold Mountain requires a deeper reading than English translations can provide; to extract Chan Buddhist principles mixing with imperial Daoist knowledge, a guided reading of the poetry welcomes readers toward Cold Mountain rather than following false paths.

---

⁴ For convenience sake, this essay will refer to all poems by Cold Mountain, Pick-Up, and Big Stick by Red Pine’s translation, The Collected Songs of Cold Mountain, like so: RP CM 1, RP PU 1, and RP BS 1. All mentioned poems can be found in Appendix A.

**Historiography**

The discourse among English language scholars has led to two camps on the author’s identity: first, that Cold Mountain was a single person, perhaps a monk taking on a pen name; second, that Cold Mountain was a legendary figure created to unify the collection of poems by more than one author.⁶ Due to the mysterious authorship of the Cold Mountain poems, a few notes must be addressed before diving into the substance of the poems. Current scholarship has culminated in Paul Rouzer’s *On Cold Mountain*, in which he uses the entirety of English works, along with Chinese and Japanese commentaries. Rouzer’s monograph opens new interpretations and questions into scholarship largely unavailable to Western researchers. Without proper knowledge of either language, and the difficulty of finding commentary copies, a holistic analysis of the Cold Mountain poems is nearly impossible.

With these issues in mind, focusing on the legendary figure of Cold Mountain becomes much easier, beginning with a biography including copies of the poems. This biography is the basis for understanding Cold Mountain. A full translation and analysis appears in “A Study of Han-Shan” by Wu Chi-Yu. In this biography, the author writes about a governor of the Taizhou prefecture, Lüqiu Yin (閭丘胤) with evidence from the *Complete Library of the Four Treasuries* that he served from between 633–37 CE.⁷ Lüqiu Yin is said to have traveled to Guoqing Temple in search of a teacher who could help him reach enlightenment. On the road to the temple, Yin encounters Big Stick, who cures him of a headache while reminding him that “illness is only illusion.” When Lüqiu Yin inquires for a sage, Big Stick recommends Cold Mountain and Pick-Up, who are revealed to be incarnations of Mañjuśrī (Wénshū 文殊) and Samantabhadra (Pǔxián Púsà 普賢菩薩), respectively.⁸ Lüqiu Yin finds Cold Mountain and Pick-Up in the kitchen of Guoqing Temple and bows in respect upon arriving. This sends the two recluses into a fit of laughter, saying that Big Stick “has a long tongue. You did not recognize Maitreya (Mílè

---


⁷ Rouzer, 34.

⁸ Mañjuśrī is considered one of the first Bodhisattvas, likened to the sun, provoking introspection into topics such as emptiness, free will, and the nature of self. For a full analysis on Mañjuśrī, see Paul Harrision’s *Mañjuśrī and the Cult of the Celestial Bodhisattvas*. Samantabhadra, also an early Bodhisattvas, is immortalized in the *Samantabhadra Meditation Sutra* is described as practicing the message of the Lotus Sutra, protecting the teachings of Dharma, and a witness to the progress of mortals on the path of Nirvana. Further reading can be found in Nikkyo Niwano’s *Buddhism for Today: A Modern Interpretation of the Threefold Lotus Sutra*, pages 405–406.
Pûsà 彌勒菩萨) at sight, why are you making obeisance to us now?”9 As Cold Mountain and Pick-Up leave the temple together, Lûqiu Yin asks other monks when they will return and has medicine and clothes sent for them. When the packages arrived, the two men ran away, accusing the deliverers to be thieves.10 After their disappearance, Lûqiu Yin requests the poems left behind by Cold Mountain, Pick-Up, and Big Stick be complied by an “undistinguished local monk,” Daoqiao (dàoqiào 道翘). In a review of Robert Hendrix’s full translation of Cold Mountain’s poems, Victor H. Mair argues that this unknown monk is “the most credible candidate” for the authorship of the poems. He describes Daoqiao as a monk without a mastery of classical Chinese, someone who “would have had a natural prediction to rely on” medieval vernacular Chinese.11 It is plausible Daoqiao joined the other authors and donned the identity of Cold Mountain, but proving the existence of Daoqiao is impossible. Mair is not wrong in his assumptions, but he connects one aspect of the biography with other loose ends to identify Cold Mountain.

While Lûqiu Yin’s biography has become the principal source for the “life” of Cold Mountain, through scholarly analysis it can be concluded that it was most likely faked in the centuries following Hanshan’s death. With such a mystery surrounding the creation of the biography, research based on piecing together “evidential scholarship” known as kaozheng, has become the basis for understanding the legend and the life of Cold Mountain.12 In creating an argument based on kaozheng, one must be able to look at all evidence presented and make a logical conclusion from sources available. Any venture into the legacy of Cold Mountain should begin with the biography. Yet, a major issue arises: the style of writing. The biography overuses the conjunction 乃 (nǎi), which could be translated into either “yes” or “and then,” appearing twenty-eight times. The idea that a man holding such a high, official title with a clumsy prose style would lead readers to, in Robert Borgen’s view, see that such

9 Maitreya is presented as the “future Buddha” one who will return to Earth to teach a new Dharma to replace the teachings of Gautama Buddha. His name comes from the Sanskrit maitri, meaning “friendliness” and is characterized by expectancy and promise for a greater teaching.
12 Rouzer, 33. Rouzer writes that “assumptions that underlie kaozheng work may be summarized the following ways: (1) A document that can be proved to have any evident factual errors becomes immediately suspect, and should probably be ignored in its constructing analytical models; (2) a document that cannot be proved to have any factual errors can be accepted completely without reservation; (3) our current textual record is complete enough to arrive at a reasonable conclusion (we thus disregard the possibility that countless documents that could clarify our speculations have probably been lost over the centuries); and (4) consequently there must be an irrefutable conclusion based on the currently surviving materials.”
an author “could have not passed his civil service examinations, much less risen to such a high position in the Tang officialdom.” This lack of imperial language is problematic, but Lüqiu Yin’s position as a magistrate in Taizhou prefecture is corroborated by a biography of Zhiyan, a general turned monk. In Daozuan’s Biographies of Eminent Monks Continued, the author claims Yin was a former colleague of Zhiyan, who Lüqiu Yin visited between 621–643 CE. While Lüqiu Yin may have been a sloppy writer, we can assume that a certain Lüqiu Yin served in the Tang state during the first half of the seventh century.

This raises concerns about the authorship of the biography. Was the historical Lüqiu Yin the same as the legendary Lüqiu Yin? Did the compiler of the poems or some scribe dig up the identity of a minor official to strengthen the legend? Further kaozhang-based research would be necessary to begin an inference of the historical reliability of the identity of Lüqiu Yin.

Another source supporting the existence of the historical Lüqiu Yin is Yu Jiaxi’s (余嘉錫 1884–1955 CE) Evidential Analysis of the Catalogue of the Four Treasuries (四庫提要辨證). Jiaxi writes twice in the biography section that Lüqiu Yin was assigned to Tangxing country in Taizhou. Counties were subject to renaming and reorganization during the Tang; in Lüqiu Yin’s time, this country would have been known as Shifeng. As Rouzer writes, “For Yu, this is an insurmountable obstacle: we have our proof that the entire preface is unauthentic, a later forgery.” This change in prefecture name was likely due to a textual transmission by “some later scribe [who] saw the name, ‘Shifeng’ in the text and silently corrected it to the ‘proper,’ more recent name.” Changes to the biography over time surround Cold Mountain with more questions. Was the location of Shifeng the only change? Do different manuscript copies of the biography show distinct changes from one another? At this point, scholars like Yu and Rouzer would agree that Yin’s biography is indeed a forgery, yet it indicates a mid-seventh and early-eight century date for the origins of Cold Mountain.

Another biography that collects the “lives” of Cold Mountain, Pick-Up, and Big Stick is Zanning’s (919–1001, 贊寧) book, Biographies of Eminent Monks Compiled in the Song Dynasty (宋高僧傳), written between 982 and 988. Zanning shows great dependence the Lüqiu Yin’s biography, as well as a lost work attributed to an unknown Wei Shu. Wei

14 Rouzer, 34.
15 The Four Treasuries were a Qing Dynasty (1636–1929 CE) document collection of important historical, philosophical, and literary works.
16 Rouzer, 34–35.
records the apparent death of Big Stick between 712–713 during the reign of Emperor Xuanzong (Xuánzōng 玄宗), giving a reasonable assertion of an eighth century date for Hanshan's lifespan. Zanning also records a popular tale of Cold Mountain in the biography of Chan Master Guishan Lingyou (771–853 Wéi shān líng yòu 漪山靈祐), who supposedly encountered Cold Mountain while on his way to Guoqing temple. If this encounter is to be taken at face value, confusion arises as the dates of Cold Mountain's life would be extended over two centuries. While all mentions of Cold Mountain as a person should be taken with a grain of salt, sources giving competing ranges of dates cannot be ignored as they constitute the closest primary sources available in determining exactly who Cold Mountain was.

The Poetry of Hanshan

Besides these loosely connected biographies and tales of Cold Mountain and his compatriots, the poems themselves provide insight into the grand reality of Cold Mountain. In his analysis of Cold Mountain's rhyme words, E. G. Pulleyblank places his lifespan between the late-eighth and early-ninth centuries, fitting with the biographies mentioned above. Pulleyblank continues, writing that B. Csongor, among other scholars, have “noted a feature in some of Han-Shan's rhymes that is also found in popular poetry of the late Tang period.” In a Chinese analysis of the rhymes, Jo Fan (Ruò Fán 若凡) notes “there are departures from the formal rules of Tang poetry and attributes this to Han-Shan's being a vernacular poet.” In his analysis, Pulleyblank finds a poet picky with rhymes, one who recognizes a disappearance in certain rhyming categories during the early Tang. He splits the poems into two categories, Hanshan I and II, concluding that about two-thirds are the product of the early seventh century and the rest were likely written in the early ninth century. Rouzer notes that Pulleyblank's work contrasts the idea of kaozheng. While both methods “assume a closed system of data that can be analyzed with a resultant series of conclusions,” they also “assume that unknown historical factors cannot interfere with the process.” Here, Rouzer makes the case that both Pulleyblank and kaozheng scholars take the poems and surviving primary sources at face value and do not dive deeply into the content of the poems themselves. Rouzer

17 Rouzer, 35.
18 Pulleyblank, 164.
19 In his translation, Robert Hendrix notes the poems which fall into the Han-Shan II category, unless noted otherwise each of the poems exhibited are in the category of Han-Shan I.
20 Rouzer, 38.
21 Rouzer, 38–39.
raises questions about Pulleyblank’s analysis, specifically:

Does situating Hanshan (or one of the Hanshans at least) in the seventh century rather than the eighth tell us anything about him as a poet? Does it make certain elements of his received biography more likely to be rooted in reality, or less? Is there a coherence to Han-Shan I’s use of imagery, and is there one to Han-Shan II’s? Are there perhaps multiple Hanshans in both eras?  

These questions go unanswered by Rouzer’s monograph, but they are important to keep in mind when reading or researching the nature of Cold Mountain. Rouzer sides with Chinese scholarship on the matter, which argues “that most if not all of the Hanshan corpus was composed in the eighth and ninth centuries.” From his mention of both Chang’an (today known as Xi’an) and Luoyang, Pulleyblank claims that Cold Mountain is from the north; Rouzer rebuts this, arguing that Chang’an was never mentioned and Luoyang is only mentioned twice “deliberately imitating popular poetry motifs inherited from Han dynasty verse” which “suggests a poet who is quite familiar with the style of older, pre-Tang poetry.” Knowledge of older forms of poetry would fit into Burton Watson’s description of the poet as “a gentleman farmer, troubled by poverty and family discord, who after extensive wandering and perhaps a career as a minor official” who retreated at the age of thirty to Cold Cliff on Taintai Mountain in Eastern China after traveling in the search for everlasting life, only to find solace on the Cold Cliff as exhibited in the next paragraph in RP CM131.

Pulleyblank’s analysis of Cold Mountain’s rhymes gives perhaps the only solid ground to build the identity of Cold Mountain upon, but looking beyond the scope of secondary scholarship, the poems themselves speak to both the life and the legend surrounding this recluse. Many of the poems have strong biographical elements which tell of a man lost in the world and in his own mind. This is the most distinct genre present throughout the collection, beginning with the aforementioned poem, RP CM131:

---

22 Rouzer, 40.
23 Rouzer, 40. He continues, writing, “I ultimately do not believe that this is an answerable question in any firm or perminate way. I merely mean to emphasize the degree to which our assumptions about the historical ‘reality’ of Hanshan are rooted in very little.”
24 Rouzer, 39.
25 Watson, 9.
出生三十年，
當遊千萬里。
行江青草合，
入塞紅塵起。
鍊藥空求仙，
讀書兼詠史。
今日歸寒山，
枕流兼洗耳。

Born thirty years ago,
I’ve traveled countless miles.
Along rivers where the green rushes swayed,
to the frontier where the red dust swirled.
I’ve made elixirs and tried to become immortal,
I’ve read the classics and written odes.
And now I’ve retired to Cold Mountain,
to lie in a stream and wash out my ears.

Here, as in other poems, the poet references being alive for thirty years, both before and after arriving at Cold Mountain. Whether or not this is a cliché referencing Confucius when he said, “at thirty I took my stand,” this is grounds for finding the lifespan of Cold Mountain. While confirmation of Cold Mountain’s lifespan cannot be answered here, the idea that he arrived when he was thirty years old and stayed until at least sixty gives an indication to the time period spent on Cold Cliff. The poet goes on to tell of the long journey tackled by this traveler; fascinated with the frontier lifestyle suddenly embraced. In his comment on this poem, Red Pine notes that “red dust” is a common motif for sensation, suggesting the sudden journey taken by the traveler is further and more remote than they have traveled previously. Red Pine continues, “lines five and six refer to Taoist and Confucian pursuits” as tradition held that accumulating knowledge and seeking recipes for immortality was a higher calling than the average person could attempt. Being intimately familiar with the Confucian and Daoist texts was a requirement for passing the civil service exams, which seem to be part of the traveler’s past life. Now all their training is worthless, since upon arrival at Cold Mountain all knowledge ceases to matter, leading our traveler to physically clear his mind of all that held him down. Red Pine suggests this final line is a reference to another legendary mountain recluse, Xu You (twenty-third century BCE, Xǔ Yóu 許由), who washed out his ears when offered the throne of the fabled Emperor Yao (r. 2356–2255 BCE, Yáo 堯) near the end of his life. This poem helps form a basic caricature of Cold Mountain: a scholar who failed to achieve a position and retreated into the wilderness to find true solace. These themes of failure are present throughout the collection and appear to be a major point of Cold Mountain’s distain for the imperial court structure.

26 See RP CM53.
29 Red Pine, 124.
30 See RP CM81, 99, 119.
With the An Lu Shan Rebellion defining the decline of the Tang Dynasty, the image of an exiled official is present in poems such as RP CM26. Red Pine writes that line three indicates the author to have been a refugee or a wanted man looking for total seclusion from imperial authorities. In Robert Hendricks’s translation, he notes that this poem falls into Pulleyblank’s category of Han-Shan II, contradicting Red Pine’s vision of the An Lu Shan rebellion in the background. Pulleyblank’s thesis would coincide with his theory of an early ninth century authorship with the decline of the Tang Dynasty. The final line discusses Heaven and Earth changing, referring to the Emperor and his empire, respectively. This commentary on the fragile nature of dynastic cycles finds a poet unbothered by the impending doom about to grip the Tang capital. If trained to be a scholar, Cold Mountain likely would have had a family left behind in fleeing from the capital. The persecution of scholars during the An Lu Shan rebellion and its aftermath could have targeted the political and religious beliefs of Cold Mountain. Fitting into the category of Han-Shan II, could numerous ex-civil servants be donning the identity of Cold Mountain to record their personal struggles? Again, questions are raised, yet answers are not easily found within the poems themselves without further research into specifics.

31 Red Pine, 52.
33 Red Pine, 52.
34 For another poem with similar themes of seclusion and the changing of dynasties, see RP CM169. Another Han-Shan II poem, Red Pine argues this poem gives greater indication of an exiled scholar writing under the name Cold Mountain p.150. Rouzer commends that the last two lines of the poem includes a broader theme: The passage of time as a mark of transcendence p.102.
Besides the theorized background of Cold Mountain, what is the legend without his comrades Pick-Up and Big Stick? Their importance to the legendary status of these poems is integral to understanding foundation of this legacy. Specifically, in *RP CM44*, this poem tells of our recluse coming out of hiding to visit with his compatriots. When comparing the manuscripts provided in both Rouzer and Red Pine’s translations, an issue arises. Rouzer used the *Sibu congkan* edition, a 1929 Japanese reproduction of the earliest surviving edition, *Song ying ben* (宋影本) which was produced before 1170. Red Pine uses a 1979 reproduction of the 16th century *Tientai Sanshegerho*, which he argues is “freer of copyist errors and have retained its ordering of the poems.” With multiple editions of the poems circulating, the usage of different character variants presents a challenge. The textual variants make it difficult to have a *pure* text of the Cold Mountain poems; differences in word choice between Rouzer and Red Pine’s manuscripts are exhibited in the following two poems:

慣居幽隱處，乍向國清中。時訪豐幹老，仍來看拾公。獨回上寒巖，無人話合同。尋究無源水，源窮水不窮。

Red Pine 44

I usually live in seclusion, but sometimes I go to Kuoching. To call on the Venerable Feng-kan, or to visit with Master Shih-te. But I go back to Cold Cliff alone, Observing an unspoken agreement. I follow a stream that has no spring, The spring is dry but not the stream.

---

35 In a personal correspondence with Rouzer, he warned me that it’s best not to make big conclusions based on textual variations, as these variations are often not random choices, but raising questions about the differences between the two can open multiple interpretations.
36 Rouzer and Nugent, ix.
37 Red Pine, 301.
Line two changes little between the versions, the use of 中 (zhōng) by Red Pine would mean “center,” that is to say visiting the literal center of Guoqing Temple; Rouzer’s use of 畲 (zhòng) implies Cold Mountain is speaking to a group of monks at Guoqing—again these words largely mean the same in this context. Line five of both manuscripts presents even less difference in meaning; 回 (huí) and 迴 (jiǒng) largely mean “return” to Cold Cliff. By far, line three has the greatest difference in meaning between the two editions. Red Pine’s usage of the noun 老 (lǎo) would describe Big Stick as a “senior person,” or as he translates “venerable.” The inclusion of 道 (dào) in the Sibu congkan edition could give the line a religious tone more than simply visiting Big Stick; however, without further analysis of other manuscripts, this cannot be answered here. In my personal correspondence with Rouzer, he suggested that Red Pine’s usage and translation is appropriate for this poem as a respectful honorific. The following line on Pick-Up is another honorific, 來看 (Lái kàn), which would mean “to come and see” or “see a topic from a certain point of view.” These two lines are parallel in Rouzer’s opinion. With the respect bestowed to his friends, Cold Mountain may have needed human interaction to further...

---

38 Form our correspondence, Rouzer agrees with the usage of this honorific, as in the preceding line referring to Pick-Up, the use of 來看, another honorific which would make both lines of the couplet paralleling one another.

39 In our personal correspondence, Rouzer writes “I don’t see the dao in line 3 as particularly figurative, partly because it would be odd to relate this to the verb fang, which usually means visit in a highly social sort of way (usually if dao is meant more figuratively, there are semantic clues in other words that would lead to this reading—also, parallelism would suggest that reading, since line four doesn’t suggest a greater seeking of wisdom from Shide). I think it’s just being used to mean that he goes to see him.”
his spiritual journey, but only got “so much benefit from socializing with his fellow eccentrics.” Does this discrepancy truly give a different interpretation? Could the different usage of 老 and 道 simply be the mistake of a scribe? Another potential difference is found in the characters for Big Stick, 豐幹 used by Red Pine and 豐干 used by Rouzer, which could be an artistic choice in their composition related to 老 and 道. A proper analysis of all available manuscripts and their commentaries is required to address these questions and concerns. Comparison of the language variants could lead to a better understanding many Cold Mountain poems under a literary lens.

The final couplet begins the journey into Cold Mountain’s philosophy. He seeks not an actual stream of water, but rather is looking to trace the flow of karma back to its origin, stopping the flow and hence escaping samsara (shēngsǐ 生死). Red Pine comments that these last two lines “describe someone who is not destined to be reborn.” Cold Mountain’s consultation of Big Stick and Pick-Up could indicate the writing of this poem was completed before reaching enlightenment. The verb 窮 (qióng) appears twice in the last line, with two different definitions, “to run out” or “to become exhausted” and “to seek to its source.” The idea of seeking a source, whether a stream, a river, or a creek becomes an allegory for the true nature of reality. Rouzer writes that the last line could be extrapolated to mean “Though one can discover the ultimate source of a spring, this water cannot have its source discovered” or perhaps “Though a source may become exhausted, this water [for which I am seeking] will never be exhausted.” When deciphering this meaning, Rouzer consults Hakuin Ekaku (Japanese: 白隠慧鶴, 1686–1768), a Zen master who preached and commented on the deeper significance to Buddhist doctrine in the Cold Mountain corpus. To Hakuin, these final two lines are central to the poem as a whole; he writes that the idea of water without a source is an allegory “that above everyone’s Mind there is another erroneous mind that continually arises

40 Rouzer, 110.
41 Pairing 幹 and 老 at the end of line three in Red Pine’s manuscript has the first character with more strokes and the latter with less, while Rouzer’s manuscript’s paring of 干 and 道 has the first character with less strokes than the second. The characters themselves are art, and their choice for gàn is telling of what is to be focused on. The Tientai Sanshegerho edition would have one focusing on the subject, Big Stick. The Sibu congkan edition has one focusing on the honorific, describing the knowledge of Big Stick.
42 From Buddhism: The Illustrated Guide edited by Kevin Trainor p. 56, “Buddhism shares with Hinduism the doctrine of Samsara, whereby all beings pass through an unceasing cycle of birth, death and rebirth until they find a means of liberation from the cycle. However, Buddhism differs from Hinduism in rejecting the assertion that every human being possesses a changeless soul which constitutes his or her ultimate identity, and which transmigrates from one incarnation to the next.”
43 Red Pine, 66.
44 Rouzer, 111.
45 Rouzer, 6.
and dissipates,” or in other words, enlightenment is just beyond one’s mind. The one looking for enlightenment, Hakuin argues, will “seek for it everywhere, until both the place he seeks and the mind that seeks for it disappear in one stroke.” Cold Mountain is not looking for a well of “fresh spiritual drinking water,” but is attempting to block the source of water flow because water acts as “the river of samsaric karma that is carrying us all along against our will.”

Now the basis of Cold Mountain’s spiritual journey has been established: to take upon a “difficult and seemingly absurd task in which only he can engage.” Could this task be for the betterment of Cold Mountain alone, or is his mission to help others toward enlightenment? Given the surviving evidence, this question is seemingly unanswerable, yet other poems are directed toward the reader as a means of helping them along to nirvana.

Cold Mountain’s poetry exhibits methods advocated by the Buddha in the Lotus Sutra, who argued for bringing people toward enlightenment through “skillful means” such as poetry. Exploring complex ideas such as samsara in vernacular language and images helps others in their own path toward enlightenment. The first line of RP CM100 uses the characters for “life and death,” which are used to translate samsara:

欲識生死譬  For an image of life and death,
且將冰水比 consider ice and water.
水結即成冰 Water freezes into ice,
冰消返成水 ice melts back into water.
巳死必應生 What dies must live again
出生還復死 what lives is bound to die.
冰水不相傷 Ice and water don’t harm each other,
生死還雙美 both life and death are fine.

If literally translated, this first line would be “desiring to know samsara consider [the following].” This analogy of freezing water and melting ice illustrates samsara as demonstrated by the second of the Four Noble Truths. This Buddhist truth holds that, like the natural occurrence of melting and

---

46 Rouzer, 111.
47 Rouzer, 112.
48 Rouzer, 113.
49 The Four Noble Truths are as follows: 1. Humans are prone to craving impermanent states of being and physical things which are dukkha, or things incapable of satisfying; 2. This craving keeps us in the cycle of samsara, the endless cycle of repeated rebirth and death; 3. There is a way to break free from samsara, attaining nirvana or enlightenment with the cessation of craving; 4. Achieving nirvana can be done by following the Eightfold Path, namely: Right View, Resolve, Speech, Conduct, Livelihood, Effort, Mindfulness, and Samadhi, the practicing of meditation.
freezing, life and death should not be feared as one will always lead to the other. The cycle of samsara can be escaped and understanding the nature of life and death illustrated by RP CM100 would give Buddhist lay people an insight into their own suffering. But how does one reach beyond this cycle? Looking toward the four surviving poems of Big Stick, there is a small collection displaying concepts that are clearly Buddhist in nature, highlighted by RP BS2:\(^{50}\)

兀元沈浪海  Sinking like a rock in the Sea,
漂漂輪三界  drifting through the Three Worlds.
可惜一靈物  Poor eternal creature,
無始被境埋  forever immersed in scenes.
電光瞥然起 Until a flash of lighting shows,
生死紛塵埃  life and death are dust in space.

Compared to RP CM100, RP BS2 has much more meaning to unpack. In line two, Big Stick uses the phrase 三界 (Sānjiè) or literally “Three Realms” to remind readers of the cycle of reincarnation all are born into: desire, form, and formlessness, or rather the past, present, and future.\(^{51}\) Humans are haunted by their actions and beliefs throughout their mortal life, yet knowing that one is trapped in this cycle allows for a moment of sudden enlightenment. This idea is shown in the final couplet: a flash of lighting appears in the mind when one reaches a state of enlightenment. Until that lighting cracks, samsara will continue without disturbance, like dust. These two poems reflect a schism amongst the followers of Bodhidharma (fifth through sixth century 碧眼胡, Biyān-hú literally “The Blue-Eyed Barbarian”) between the Southern School, which advocated sudden enlightenment, and the Northern School, which preached gradual enlightenment.\(^{52}\) Cold Mountain is not writing to advocate sudden enlightenment in RP CM100, but nevertheless the simplicity of language allows for enlightenment to spark in a reader’s mind. This contrasts with RP BS2, in which the poet argues that samsara cannot be escaped without the achievement of sudden enlightenment. Here the poems of both Cold Mountain and Big Stick are speaking to a larger audience of lay and ordained Buddhists seeking an escape from samsara.

The use of skillful means in Cold Mountain’s poetry fits directly within a parable from the Lotus Sutra to demonstrate those methods.\(^{53}\) As shown in

---

50 Each of Big Stick’s poems can be found in Appendix A.
51 Red Pine, 260.
Cold Mountain takes the parable of the Burning House and changes the ending to show how desire prevents humans from escaping the suffering around them. The traditional ending in the parable has the father offering his three children ox-drawn carts ordained with “ropes of jewels twined around, a fringe of flowers hung down, and layers of cushions were spread inside, on which were placed vermilion pillows.” The father, wealthy beyond his years, uses the temptation of the carts as skillful means to save the lives of his sons; but in RP CM196 the children are unenlightened, content with their desires, which prevents escape from samsara. RP CM196 portrays the Cold Mountain poems as the father using skillful means to call unenlightened beings out of the burning house of “birth, aging, disease, death, grief, and sorrow.” In another poem, RP CM181, a house allegorically represents one’s body in referenced to the Nirvana Sutra. Both RP CM196 and RP CM181 show a body deteriorating through desire, and while skillful means may help some, others continue clinging to desire and believing that changing their lives will be of little use.

Despite achieving the legendary status that Cold Mountain holds in Chan and Zen Buddhism, none of the poems appear in the seminal collection of Three Hundred Tang poems compiled by Sun Zhu (Sūn Zhū 孫洙) during the Qing Dynasty (1644–1911 CE) around 1763 CE. Yet no other poet from the Tang “occupies the alters of China’s temples and shrines, where his statue often stands alongside immortals and Bodhisattvas.” When compared to other Tang contemporaries, for example Du Fu (712–70 CE, Dù Fǔ 杜甫), Cold Mountain’s vernacular language shines through. In A View of the Wilderness (Yěwàng 野望, literally “wilderness view”), Du Fu struggles with his own mortality. He mourns the separation from his brothers through death and those...

---

54 Han-Shan II.
55 De Bary and Bloom, 449.
56 Red Pine, 170.
59 Red Pine, 3.
others traveling samsara. Knowing his time is almost up, he feels useless to his country and can only see chaos in this mortal world. A distraught man shares his feelings that all beings have experienced after facing the death of loved ones; if one does not question their own mortality, is one human?

Cold Mountain takes a different approach toward the “chaos of the world” in *RP CM32*; in this poem Cold Mountain is not a fixed place, but rather a state of mind. The road to this peaceful state is long and hard. One cannot travel there in a few days or years. During those travels, the man Cold Mountain forgets the facts of nature, ignoring the plights of life along the way to find enlightenment, enjoying the purity of one’s mind. The road to “Cold Mountain” is the road of life, and instead of dwelling on loss and mortality like Du Fu does, Cold Mountain illustrates that the “tangles of the world,” including death, must not be forgotten, but instead accepted as normal. Once one faces the suffering that is life, one can truly live in harmony with themselves and the world around them.

**Du Fu, View of the Wilderness**

Snow is white on the westward mountains and on three fortified towns,
And waters in this southern lake flash on a long bridge.
But wind and dust from sea to sea bar me from my brothers;
And I cannot help crying, I am so far away.
I have nothing to expect now but the ills of old age.
I am of less use to my country than a grain of dust.
I ride out to the edge of town. I watch on the horizon,
Day after day, the chaos of the world.
This concept of tangles of the world is present throughout the Cold Mountain collection, criticizing monastic life, meat-eaters, and wealthy individuals among other topics in the commentaries presented within the poems. In another parable, *RP CM38*, again references the Lotus Sutra, with an ox cart as a metaphor for the “Great Vehicle of Salvation, with room for all.” Rouzer interprets this poem as “an attack on altruism, or at least wrong-headed altruism.” In Rouzer’s translation, he replaced the scorpion with the *gu*, a “legendary monster said to be created by humans for the sake of poisoning their enemies.” His translation portrays a more impending doom for those “poor respectable turtles” whose accepting nature betrays them in the end. At a surface level, this poem is nothing more than a warning to those who are too accepting of others without weighing potential dangers. In his commentary on *RP CM38*, Hakuin argues that Cold Mountain is criticizing naïve Bodhisattvas. He argues that this described Bodhisattva is “at the initial stage of his development, when the strength of his capacities is still slight.” These two turtles are used as symbols of wisdom (*prajñā*) and meditation (*samādhi*), as well as the dual vows taken by Bodhisattvas of benefiting oneself and others. The ox cart is led by a Bodhisattva who questions their abilities to lead others toward nirvana, as the *gu*-monster represents “the single condition of external disturbance” which brings harm to those he brings toward enlightenment. Hakuin ends his comments on the final line with a comparison of “someone who wishes to rescue another who has accidently fallen into the water. Because his strength is weak, he will end up drowning with him.” As an outsider to the monastic community, Cold Mountain would have seen the monk’s attempts to bring lay people into the fold as futile.

Commentary on contemporary Tang society during the rise of Chan Bud-

60 For poems on the sin of meat eating see *RP CM72*, 95, 143, and 266; for hording wealth see *RP CM86* and 87; for criticisms of monastic life see *RP CM76*, *PU 21*, and 43 which could also be applied to meat eating.
61 Red Pine, 60.
62 Rouzer, 151.
63 Rouzer, 151.
64 Rouzer, 151–152.
dhism is perhaps best written by Pick-Up, the kitchen worker at Guoqing Temple. While not a monk, Pick-Up is arguably just as enlightened as Cold Mountain and Big Stick. Many of the poems attributed to Pick-Up reveal a much more personal poet. He comments on others searching for enlightenment, the concept of Buddha nature, and even on the outlook of his own poems. In a particularly personal poem, *RP PU49*, Pick-Up demonstrates both his love for nature and his disgust with the outside urban world:

可笑是林泉 Woods and springs make me smile,
數里勿人煙 no kitchen smoke for miles.
雲從巖嶂起 Clouds rise up from rock ridges,
瀑布水潺潺 cascades tumble down.
猿啼暢道曲 A gibbon’s cry marks The Way,
虎嘯出人間 a tiger’s roar transcends mankind.
松風清颯颯 Pine wind sighs so softly,
鳥語聲關關 birds discuss singsong.
獨步繞石澗 I walk the winding streams,
孤陟上峰巒 and climb the peaks alone.
時坐盤陀石 Sometimes I sit on a boulder,
偃仰攀蘿沿 or lie and gaze at trailing vines.
遙望城隍處 But when I see a distant town,
唯聞鬧嘩嘩 all I hear is noise.

Just as Cold Mountain and Du Fu grapple with the madness of the modern world, Pick-Up provides a solution: solitude in nature. In this poem, Pick-Up deliberately mentions a gibbon and a tiger, both of which are associated with wilderness and rarity in modern China. The emphasis on the cry of the gibbon leading to The Way strikes one with confusion. How does one know where the cry is coming from? Simply, one does not. The Way cannot be found by looking for it; it can only be found by living life. The tiger’s roar is the message of the Buddha, something that is not found in the bustling cities, but rather in the serenity of nature. The Buddha’s message strikes at the primal nature of humans, our flight or fight response. The stress that comes with city life has people worried about money, food, shelter, and jobs. To Pick-Up, all these worries can be abandoned in nature, which provides them all. Not all should be abandoned, but to remove oneself from day-to-day life to spend time within

---

65 Mair, 272.
66 See *RP PU16*, 32, 36.
67 Red Pine, 298.
nature can lead to an understanding of the world not found within the market places and imperial institutions.

Like many young men of the Tang Dynasty, the author or authors of the Cold Mountain poems would have attempted the civil service examinations, likely more than once. In contextualizing the canonization of Tang poetry, Pauleen Yu writes that poetry composition was a central compound to the Daoxue (道学, literally “Study of The Dao”) civil service tradition, which held an “emphasis on ethical self-cultivation, and on writing as a possible means to achieve it.” The nature of “prose composition in the service of classical exegesis and policy formulation was really capable of conveying The Way and facilitating moral improvement.”

Wang An-shih (1021–1086 CE, 王安石), a chancellor and poet of the Song Dynasty (960–1279 CE), describes Cold Mountain’s poetry as holding this status of self-cultivation. Yet, the surviving works show a poet more interested in spiritual and social matters, rather than those of state. In a commentary on the civil service examinations, RP CM201 criticizes the man who both chases and flees from books:

| 讀書豈免死 | Reading won’t save us from death, |
| 讀書豈免貧 | and reading won’t free us from want. |
| 何以好識字 | So what this love of literacy, |
| 識字勝他人 | the literate are better than others. |
| 丈夫不識字 | A man unable to read, |
| 何處可安身 | never finds any peace. |
| 黃連搵蒜醬 | Squeeze garlic juice in your crowfoot, |
| 忘計是苦辛 | and you’ll forget the bitterness. |

Cold Mountain writes that an obsession with literacy does nothing more than instill a sense of superiority over the illiterate. While knowledge of the classics is necessary for government positions, reading provides no practical skill in providing for oneself. In the second half of the poem, Cold Mountain criticizes the illiterate man, arguing that literacy inherently benefits one’s life. A sense of duality arises between these two criticisms. Cold Mountain admits that academic learning is futile for providing for oneself, but so is the efforts of those refusing to educate themselves. Neither choice is inherently right, but literacy or lack thereof has profound consequences on one’s life.

Another discrepancy between the manuscripts used by Red Pine and Rouzer

---

arises in the sixth line of their respective manuscripts. Red Pine uses the pronoun 何 (hé) meaning “what” or “where” together with the noun 處 (chù) for “place.” With the rest of the line it leads to a literal translation, “what place can peace [be found] inside.” Rouzer 208 translates 無 (wú), a verb for “not have” or “there is not” in combination with 處, meaning “nowhere”, leading to a translation “there is nowhere he can find rest.” The rest of the line is the same in both manuscripts, but the discrepancies allow for a better understanding of the couplet. While the first half of the poem criticizes the Chinese literati, the second half argues that without even basic literacy skills, one would be behind their peers. The final couplet conveys the importance of learning to read and to write. In this case, garlic represents literacy, whose juices mask the flavor of the bitter White Crowfoot or Coptis chinensis which represents hardship. While reading will not quell desire or prevent death, both of which are sought by Daoists and Buddhists alike, the power of literacy will ultimately make the hardships of life, literally, easier to swallow.

Another theme in the Cold Mountain commentaries is a disgust for accumulating wealth, as this desire keeps many monks, lay people, and civil servants from doing their jobs without selfishness. Typical Buddhist rhetoric on wealth views it as the “result of good karma in a previous life and are warned that if they do not show compassion in this existence (and earn good works by giving generously to the poor and the church), they will be reborn in a life considerably less pleasant.” Monasteries required the patronage of wealthy individuals to continue operation, and in Tang culture wealth inequality was considered part of the natural order of things. Inequality in Tang culture is best exhibited by another vernacular poet, Wang Fanzhi (seventh century, 王梵瑞).
志), in the following poem “Shi jian ri yue ming”: 72

世間日月明， Sun and moon glow bright in the world;
皎皎照眾生。 they shine upon all living things.
貴者乘車馬， The high-born ride in horse-drawn cart,
賤者膊擔行。 while the lowly walk shouldering burdens.
富者前身種， Wealth was planted in a former life,
貧者悭貪生。 poverty arose from stinginess.
貧富有殊別， The poor and wealthy have their differences,
業報自相迎。 In response to karmic repayments.
聞強造功德， He who listens well earns future merit,
喫著自身榮。 glorying in what he eats and wears.
智者天上去， The wise will ascend to the heavenly realm,
愚者入深坑。 While the foolish fall into a deep pit.

With the “light of the Zen atmosphere in which much of it was written” a high number of vernacularisms are found in both Fanzhi and Cold Mountain’s poetry. 73 In the above poem, Wang Fanzhi displays a simplistic view of karma, “not only is rebirth in Heaven or Hell determined by one’s previous life, but so are wealth or poverty.” Rouzer writes that Fanzhi’s poem “warns against stinginess as a principal karmic cause for future suffering” and that those who read it receive a warning against a “close-fisted” attitude during the present life. 74 While a warning it might be, Wang Fanzhi accepts the status quo of wealth inequality. Cold Mountain shows a sense of disgust toward a normality of hoarding wealth, best illuminated best by a story of a man fallen on hard times while an old friend relishes newfound wealth in RP CM154:

是我有錢日， Those days when I had money,
恆為汝貸將。 I always loaned you some.
汝今既飽暖， Now you’re full and warm,
見我不分張。 we meet but you don’t share.
須憶汝欲得， Don’t forget when you were poor,
似我今承望。 you clung like me to hope.
有無更代事， Ownership keeps changing places,
勸汝熟思量。 I hope you weigh this well.

72 Rouzer, 177.
73 Mair, 271.
74 Rouzer, 157.
While Wang Fanzhi portrays a simplistic and “stable world of karmic justice,” Cold Mountain creates a world that is in constant flux, “where impermanence makes things wildly unpredictable.” This flux is demonstrated by the collapse of identity and social status by the usage of 我 (wǒ), redefining “you” and “I” from instance to instance, creating no distinction between the rich and the poor. To Cold Mountain, it can be easy to ask for handouts in times of difficulty, but offering help in times of wealth should come easier. The switched positions of the two characters shows the true impermanent nature of wealth. While important for keeping a roof over one’s head, greed will fuel desire and prevent one from achieving nirvana. As impoverished scholars, the author or authors of the Cold Mountain corpus exhibit a distain for the status quo praised by Wang Fanzhi; to them, one person on hard times is one too many. By comparing these two poems, readers gain a greater insight into the larger world inhabited by Cold Mountain and Wang Fanzhi. Issues like wealth inequality are present in modern China; both poems above show that poetry of the past can still apply to issues facing the world today.

Cold Mountain’s Lasting Impact

The legacy left by Cold Mountain, Pick-Up, and Big Stick, has lasted far beyond their years. Recorded from impermanent sources, as according to legend, like tree bark and stone, their poems were not meant to be remembered. Since gaining widespread popularity in the Song dynasty, scholars and poets alike have received inspiration from the Cold Mountain corpus. The Song official Wang An-shih was greatly inspired by the works of Cold Mountain, believing that poetry should do more than just impress with style, but also “convey some moral or spiritual value.” Wang was not alone in his admiration for Cold Mountain, Neo-Confucian poet and philosopher Zhu Xi (1130–1200 CE, Zhū Xi 朱熹) was concerned about their survival. He requested that characters be big enough so that an old man can read them; this shows that those who honored and respected the legacy of Cold Mountain “valued honesty, humor, and insight into the human condition above literary refinement.” Clearly, even just a few hundred years after the apparent life of Cold Mountain, his poems have become important, yet overlooked, in Chinese literary tradition. Wang Anshi sought to preserve the poems of Cold Mountain, going as far as to

75 Rouzer, 158.
76 Rouzer, 3.
imitate Cold Mountain in the following poem:

I have read ten thousand books,  
and plumbed the truths beneath the sky.  
Those who know, know themselves,  
no one trusts a fool.  
How rare the idle man of Tao,  
up there three miles high.  
He alone has found the source,  
and thinks of going nowhere else.

Zen artists have used Cold Mountain’s image and poetry in a number of works, perhaps most notably a painting by the Japanese artist Yintobu, with a style of Zen minimalism coupled with poetry. In a Yuan Dynasty (1271–1368 CE) painting (see Figure 1 on page 206), Cold Mountain is depicted holding a staff while walking away; at the same time, he is pointing toward something, perhaps The Way (道). Strangely, his feet face toward the viewer, as if walking in the viewer’s direction, yet the position of his arms and staff indicate that his body is facing away from viewer as if to turn around to show something out of his grasp. As a Bodhisattva, it is believed that his destiny is to achieve enlightenment only to help others on earth to do the same. Cold Mountain is portrayed in a classic sage motif of walking with a staff and teaching about the world around him. Paintings like this reveal little about Cold Mountain the man. Instead they reflect the importance of his legacy as a Bodhisattva poet, one who anyone can turn to during a time of struggle or strife.

Members of the Beat generation from 1950s and 60s “rediscovered” Cold Mountain with Gary Snyder’s translation of twenty-seven poems. Snyder’s translation would inspire an opening scene from Jack Kerouac’s Dharma Bums which is dedicated to Cold Mountain. The narrator, Ray Smith (a fictional representation of Kerouac), visits a friend, Japhy Rider (a character largely inspired by Snyder) who is translating the poems of Cold Mountain. Ray comments that the legend of Cold Mountain sounds like Japhy. The story goes on to tell of the two men’s journey into Zen Buddhism and their climb up Matterhorn peak in California. Cold Mountain’s influence on a wider scope of literature is present in Dharma Bums, as Rouzer writes “the narrator’s own experiences suggest an attempt to reenact the spiritual pilgrimage of Hanshan, to see the mountain as a literal and figurative dwelling place that will bring him peace

78 Red Pine, 3. No Chinese text or title is available in Red Pine’s translation.
79 See Figure 1 in Appendix B.
and transcendence. This pilgrimage in the name of finding Cold Mountain no doubt would have had the historical Hanshan in humorous tears over this basic attempt to find enlightenment. While it could be argued that Kerouac is using skillful means to bring a message of Zen to a modern audience, his attempts to reincarnate Cold Mountain ignore the true nature of Zen within oneself.

Perhaps most recently, Phil Elverum, leader of the band Mount Eerie, out of Anacortes, Washington, has covered Red Pine’s translation number 286 more than once. Appearing on Seven New Songs and Song Islands Vol. 2, Elverum’s rendition of Cold Mountain is a somber echo, capturing an urging to look inward for harmony and not to follow the words of others to understand the universal nature of things. In another song simply entitled “Cold Mountain,” Elverum uses snippets of various poems to create a sutra of his own, telling of the legend of Cold Mountain. The lyrics of Mount Eerie’s songs explore many modern themes of duality, impermanence, greed, and desire, all of which resonate with the Cold Mountain collection.

The truth of Cold Mountain can be reached, yet its peaks and ridges are navigable only by those who can comprehend the journey ahead of them. Whoever began writing the Cold Mountain poems will always be lost to history, but the legacy crafted in the centuries following continues to inspire to this day. Envisioning a singular author not only provides familiarity, but a goal to set for oneself. The poems are more than the man—their existence is solely due to their spiritual, literary, and introspective value. Issues brought forth by manuscript discrepancies may reveal nothing more than word choices, but these slight changes have an impact on interpretation of the poems over time. With much of the scholarship on the Cold Mountain poems untranslated into English, truly understanding the poems from a cultural perspective is lost. By categorizing each of the poems into a genre of biography, philosophy, and commentary there is a sense of guidance in navigating Cold Mountain. Understanding the rural and often forgotten lifestyle of recluses in Chinese culture provides insight into one’s own journey in life. Removal from society is nothing without introspection about the wider world, the true nature of reality. Cold Mountain and his compatriots’ usage of skillful means helps readers understand the nature of the universe around them. Though their meaning may not always be clear, backing up the poems with secondary sources, multiple

80 Rouzer, 174.
81 Lyrics to Cold Mountain’s Song #286 can be found in Appendix B.
82 Three versions of “Cold Mountain” exist, a link for listening to the Song Islands Vol. 2 can be found in the bibliography.
translations and manuscripts, as well as using *koazhang* scholarship, creates a
holistic understanding of the poetry left behind. Much more can and should be
written about Cold Mountain, but perhaps it is best to end with a final poem
from the collection, which describes the criticism of the poet for not emulating
past masters and fitting into rhyming schemes of the day, *RP CM299*:

有人笑我詩，    People laugh about my poems,
我詩合典雅。   my pomes are elegant enough.
不煩鄭氏箋，   They don’t need Cheng Hsuan’s comments,
豈用毛公解。   much less Mao Heng’s explanations.
不恨會人稀，   I don’t mind few understand me,
只為知音寡。   Those who know one’s voice are rare.
若遷處宮商，   If we had no *fa* or *sol*,
余病莫能罷。   my disease would surely spread
忽遇明眼人,    One day I’ll meet someone with eyes,
即自流天下。   then my poems will plague the world.
Appendix A

Poems of Cold Mountain

**RP CM53**

一向寒山坐, 一向寒山坐,
Once I reached Cold Mountain,
淹留三十年。 I stayed for thirty years.
昨來訪親友, Recently visiting family and friends,
太半入黃泉, most had left for the yellow springs.
漸減如殘燭, Slowly fading like a dying candle,
長流似逝川. or surging past like a flowing stream.
今朝對孤影, Today facing my solidarity shadow,
不覺淚雙懸. suddenly both eyes filled with tears.

**RP CM70**

豬喫死人肉, Pigs devour dead human flesh,
人喫死豬腸. humans savor dead pig guts.
豬不嫌人臭, Pigs don’t mind human stink,
人反道豬香. humans say pork smells fine.
豬死拋水內, Throw dead pigs in the river,
人死掘地藏. bury human bodies deep.
彼此莫相噉, if they ever stop eating each other,
蓮花生沸湯. Lotuses will bloom in boiling soup.

**RP CM76**

不行真正道, They don’t walk the Noble Path,
隨邪號行婆, they say they believe as they go astray.
口恥神佛少, Their tongues don’t stop before buddhas,
心懷嫉妒多. their hearts overflow with envy.
背後噇魚肉, In private they eat fish and meat,
人前念佛陀. in public they chant *O-mi-to-fo*,
如此修身處, If this is how they cultivate.
難應避柰河. how will they deal with disaster.

**RP CM81**

徒勞說三史, I labored in vain reciting the Three Histories,
浪自看五經. I wasted my time reading the Five Classics.
洎老檢黃籍, I’ve grown old checking yellow scrolls,

---

83 Rouzer’s manuscript uses 土 in place of 地
依前注白丁。  recording the usual everyday names.
筮遭連蹇卦，  Continued Hardship was my fortune,
生主虛危星。  Emptiness and Danger govern my life.
不及河邊樹，  I can’t match riverside trees,
年年一度青。 every year with a season of green.

多少般數人，  So many kinds of people exist,
百計求名利。 hundred of plans for profit and fame.
心貪覓榮華，  Hearts intent on glory,
經營圖富貴。 always trying to get rich.
家眷實團圓，  Dependents gather around,
一呼百諾至。 one yell and a hundred heads nod.
不過七十年，  But less than seventy years from now,
冰消瓦解置。 ice becomes water and roof tiles break.
死了萬事休,  Dead at last all cares cease,
誰人承後嗣。 who will be their heir.
水浸泥彈丸,  Drop a ball of mud in water,
方知無意智。 and behold the thoughtless mind.

貪人好聚財,  A greedy man who piles up wealth,
恰如梟愛子。 is like an owl who lives here chicks.
子大而食母，  The chicks grow up and eat their mother,
財多還害己。 wealth eventually swallows its owner.
散之即福生,  Spread it around and blessings grow,
聚之即禍起。 hoard it and disaster arises.
無財亦無禍,  No wealth no disaster,
鼓翼青雲裏。 Flap your wings in the blue.

嗊嗊買魚肉,  Haggling over fish and meat,
擔歸餧妻子。 carrying it home to feed your family.
何須殺他命,  Why do you take the lives of others,
將來活汝己。 to make sure you survive.
此非天堂緣,  This isn’t heaven-bound karma,
純是地獄滓。 more like ballast for hell.
徐六語破堆，
始知沒道理。

When Hsu Liu says to dig,
you’ll know it wasn’t right.

**RP CM99**

蹭蹬諸貧士，
飢寒成至極。
閑居好作詩，
札札用心力。
賤人言孰采，
勸君休歎息。
題安糊餅上，
乞狗也不喫。 ... 84

Disappointed impoverished scholars,
know the limits of hunger and cold.
Unemployed they like to write poems,
scribbling away with the strength of their hearts.
But who collects a nobody’s words,
may as well save your sighs.
Write them down on rice-flour cakes,
even mongrels won’t touch them.

**RP CM119**

箇是何措大，
時來省南院。
年可三十餘，
曾經四五選。
囊裡無青蚨，
箧中有黃卷。
行到食店前，
不敢暫回面。 ... 87

Who is this poor dreamer,
checking South Hall walls again.
Surely over thirty,
he’s been through four or five exams.
No green beetles in his purse,
pack full of yellow scrolls.
Passing by a food stand,
he doesn’t dare to look.

**RP CM143**

城北仲家翁，
渠家多酒肉。
仲家婦死時，
吊客滿堂屋。
仲翁自身亡，
能無一人哭。
喫他盃臠者，
何太冷心腹。

Old Chung north of town,
filled his home with meat and wine.
The day Old Chung’s wife died,
mourners filled the hall.
When at last Old Chung died,
not one person cried.
They consumed his meat and wine,
but had such cold insides.

---

84 Rouzer’s manuscript uses 他 in place of 人
85 Rouzer’s manuscript uses 鷹 in place of 餅
86 Rouzer’s manuscript uses 裏 in place of 裏
87 Rouzer’s manuscript uses 回 in place of 回
一自遁寒山，
養命餐山果。
平生何所憂，
此世隨緣過。
日月如逝川，
光陰石中火。
任你天地移，
我暢巖中坐。

可惜百年屋，
左倒右復傾。
木植亂差橫。
磚瓦片片落，
朽爛不堪停。
狂風吹.leadingAnchor，
再豎卒難成。

寄語食多漢，
食時無逗遛。
今生過去種，
未來今日修。
只取今日美，
不畏來生憂。
老鼠入甕翁，
雖飽難出頭。

Since I escaped to Cold Mountain,
I've lived on mountain fruit.
What worries does life hold,
this time I'm following Karma.
Days and moths are like a stream,
time is but a spark.
Heaven and Earth can change,
I'm happy here in the cliffs.

A pitiful hundred-year house,
its sides have caved in.
Its walls are cracked,
its beams are askew.
its tiles lie shattered,
its decay won't stop.
May as well let it blow down,
to rebuild would never work.

Here's some advice for meat-eating people,
who eat without reflecting.
Living things were formerly seeds,
the future depends on current deeds.
Seizing present joys,
unafraid of sorrows to come.
A rat gets into the rice jar,
but can't get out when he's full.

88 Rouzer's manuscript uses 遁 in place of 避
89 Rouzer's manuscript uses 甎 in place of 磚
90 Rouzer's manuscript uses 狂 in place of 任
91 Rouzer's manuscript uses 肉 in place of 多
92 Rouzer's manuscript uses 飯 in place of 饭
Poems of Pick-Up

**RP PU21**

我劝出家辈，
须知教法深。
专心求出离，
辄莫染貪淫。
大有俗中士，
知非不愛金。
故知君子志，
任運聽浮沈。

I advise the monks I meet,
focus on the deeper teachings.
concentrate on getting free,
don’t be destroyed by greed.
There are laymen by the score,
who know love of gold is wrong.
Know then what a wise man seeks,
just let go and take what comes.

**RP PU43**

我见出家人，
总爱喫酒肉。
比合上天堂，
却沈歸地狱。93
念得兩卷經，
欺他市鄶俗。94
豈知鄶俗人， 95
大有根性熟。

By and large the monks I meet,
love their meat and wine.
instead of climbing to Heaven,
they slip back down to Hell.
They chant a sutra or two,
to fool the layman in town.
Unaware the laymen in town,
are more preceptive than them.

93 Rouzer’s manuscript uses 卻 in place of 卻
94 Rouzer’s manuscript uses 道 in place of 市
95 Rouzer’s manuscript uses 士 in place of 人
Appendix B

Cold Mountain’s Song #286 by Mount Eerie, from Seven New Songs (2004)

I see people singing their songs
Relying on the words
Their mouths won’t work without their minds
Singing with mouths and minds at odds
The mind creates no tangles
Our mind creates no walls or chains
Just examine your own self
Don’t look stand-ins for your work
Become the master of your mouth
Know there’s no inside and no out

Cold Mountain by Mount Eerie, from Song Islands Vol. 2 (2010)

Open handed I tried to live among all people, ideas aloft
Open handed I read the books, I learned the histories, I sang the songs
Until mountains bellowed that my friends are flawed
And not to forget sorrow and all the other Gods
And that my mouth was dirty and that my ears were clogged
And of course that I’m flawed also...
And then it stopped

Open handedness had me in it’s grasp
Running around frantically
Trying to show off my “open hands”
“Hope, Unhand me!”
I finally yelped:
“Let me dwell on bad news
Let me wallow in it”
So came long nights and hunkering down
And there stood Cold Mountain with its trickling sound

When I reached the summit, I made no camp
But I unrolled my sleeping bag in the stream
And let the cold water pour in my ears
Figure 1: Hanshan by Yintobu, Nomura Art Museum, Kyoto, Kyoto, Japan (Japanese: 寒山図 因陀羅筆). (Sourced from Wikimedia Commons. This image is in the public domain in both Japan and the United States.)
Bibliography


The Problem of Presence: A Study of Glossolalia and its Implications for Religious Ethnography

John Willis

Abstract

In the fall of 2017, I completed an ethnographic study centered on the perception of glossolalia—colloquially referred to as “speaking in tongues”—in the Assemblies of God (AG) in Springfield, Missouri. In pursuit of a holistic understanding of the phenomenon, I observed several Sunday services at a local Assemblies of God church closely affiliated with the AG headquarters, taking notes on the various details of glossolalic performances as they occurred. In addition to my firsthand observations of the phenomena, I interviewed several AG pastors, denominational officials, academics, and churchgoers to understand how their experience with glossolalia interacted with their faith at large. The study was officially approved by the Institutional Review Board (IRB) at Missouri State University, and all interviews were conducted according to IRB guidelines for interview ethics and participant confidentiality.

The paper is organized such that after discussing some of the data I observed in the study, I move on to address some of the methodological difficulties I encountered in my study—particularly the problem of encountering the subjectivity of the observed and the observer alike during religious phenomena. To do this, I look to theorists of religion Robert Orsi and Rudolf Otto, whose attempts to address subjectivity and experience in their theories proves very useful in interpreting my observations. After outlining some of the essential concepts discussed in their works, I proceed to understand the interviewees’ responses in light of Orsi’s and Otto’s emphasis on the “really realness” of religious experience, emphasizing the difficulties of doing so in objective religious studies. Finally, I conclude with a call to self-reflection and critical analysis for scholars in Religious Studies in an attempt to address the implicit biases against the validity of religious experience that often occur in attempts to study religion with an objective lens.
INTRODUCTION

Over the course of a month in the autumn of 2017, I attended Central Assembly of God in Springfield, Missouri—a church of about 1,000 members located no more than 200 feet from the headquarters of the Assemblies of God International, the largest Pentecostal denomination in the world.¹ My purpose in attending the church’s weekly services was to observe the practice of glossolalia—the utterance of words or sounds resembling another language in response to a religious practitioner’s encounter with the Holy Spirit in worship or prayer.² This practice is an integral part of the Assemblies of God (AG) faith, so much so that it is indoctrinated in the AG’s guiding document of beliefs, the “Sixteen Fundamental Truths.”³ While observation of glossolalia in an AG congregation proved to be a helpful tactic in grasping some general features of glossolalic performance, I decided to dive deeper into the qualities of glossolalic experience in order to provide a thick description⁴ of the phenomenon.

METHODS

My approach to the study was to observe glossolalia in the context of Pentecostal worship as an observer rather than a participant, and to pursue a thick description of the phenomena through interviews with those who experienced it. I conducted interviews with several members of the church, including pastors in the AG, employees of the AG national headquarters, and academics and theologians at educational institutions affiliated with the AG. These interviews focused on their personal experience with glossolalia and how they understood glossolalia within the larger context of their faith. While methods of study involving the scholar’s full immersion and participation in the observed community—such as those of Karen McCarthy Brown and Tanya Luhrmann—were considered, my approach focused on understanding and describing glossolalic phenomena at Central in a more observationally neutral way.

However, as I attempted to proceed in such a manner, my neutral methodology was forced to encounter the holy aspects of religious phenomena. In my observations and interviews, it became apparent that a phenomenon as fundamentally experiential and subjective as glossolalia could not be viewed along

---

² This phenomenon is more commonly known as “speaking in tongues.”
⁴ See Clifford Geertz’s “Religion as World-View and Ethic” for a full exposition on thick description of religious phenomena.
the lines of traditional subject/object, participant/observer roles. Rather, it seemed that in addition to a methodology of mere neutral observation, I needed a perspective that allowed for some sense of real presence in my study—the presence of phenomena and observer alike. The task of accounting for real presence in religious phenomena is difficult, as it presents immediate problems in its potential to assert theological truths rather than empirical observations and objective perspectives. Nevertheless, exploring the limits of theory and method as they encounter religious phenomena is absolutely necessary for any study that seeks to encounter religion in its fullness.

The dialogue between subject, object, experience, and observation I came across in my interviews and observations of glossolalia shed light on the need to explore not only the ways in which such a fundamentally experiential phenomena affected those who participated in it, but also how my role as an observer influenced my perception of the phenomena. Consequently, the result of the study was not only a more detailed look at the perception of glossolalia in the AG, but also a reflection on the ways in which the lines between participant and observer are easily blurred in religious ethnography.

**Observations**

Sunday services at Central were somewhat typical of large, corporate worship services in modern American Evangelicalism. However, because of its location next to AG Headquarters and a membership including an unusually high number of top-ranking denomination officials in the AG, Central provided an ideal environment in which to observe a manifestation of the AG faith that functioned in careful accordance with the denomination’s values and mission at large.

During my time at Central, the public performance of glossolalia was not an uncommon occurrence, but it was not overwhelmingly frequent. During three of five Sunday mornings in which I attended services, there were both public speaking and interpretation of tongues, and the single Sunday evening service I attended was saturated in private glossolalic prayer as well as public glossolalia and interpretation. The services at Central typically began with a welcome to the congregation, then proceeded with a few songs, an offering, a sermon, a closing prayer, and another song or two to finish the service. The glossolalic events I observed usually occurred in a time of prayer or contemplative transition between worship music and preaching. However, glossolalia abruptly interrupted the leaders’ prayers on occasion as well.

The speakers of glossolalia I observed were diverse in both sex and race, as
were the people who interpreted the message of tongues. Though there were a couple of instances of an orchestra member interpreting a glossolalic message, every speaker and interpreter of glossolalia was a member of the congregation as opposed to being a member of the pastoral leadership. On several occasions, I observed the same woman interpreting different glossolalic messages, while the speakers of glossolalia were usually different people from week to week.

When a typical glossolalic message began, the musicians, pastors, and congregation became silent, and the speaker of glossolalia continued for ten to forty-five seconds, speaking loud enough that their voice could be heard throughout the sanctuary. Following the message was a period of silence, as the congregation awaited the interpretation of the message by another person, and the pastor—all with many members of the congregation—uttered quiet prayers of thanks for the glossolalic message that was spoken. This period of silence generally lasted anywhere from a few seconds to a minute. Then, another member of the congregation spoke an interpretation of the glossolalia in English. Interpreters spoke in the third or first person (i.e. “translating” the voice of God) and their messages usually consisted of an assurance of God’s presence, power, or mission. Oftentimes the interpretation referenced concepts from the pastor’s sermon or passages from the Bible. Examples of messages I heard include the following:

Regardless of the world, I will be praised. Every knee will bow and every tongue will confess that I am the Lord.

I am your Lord, You are my church… I will give you my Spirit—use it wisely.

The Holy Spirit is here, and he is ready to fill you.

In my observation, neither the speakers nor the interpreters seemed to be having an ecstatic or hysterical experience, though the level of passion and emotion in the glossolalic speech or interpretation seemed to vary from event to event.

One Sunday evening prayer service I attended was different from the Sunday morning services I had previously observed. The service took place in the church’s smaller chapel, and the congregation was composed primarily of elderly church members. During this service, we were directed to break off into small groups of four or five to pray, and as I stood hand-in-hand with three members of the church, I observed an instance of glossolalia in personal prayer for the first time while at Central.\(^5\) The woman who stood next to me first spoke a passionate prayer in English, in which she called upon the spirit of God to indwell us so we could go out into the world and do good work. Then,

\(^5\) In later interviews, many interviewees clarified that glossolalia in personal prayer is generally considered to be for the sole purpose of the individual experiencing it as opposed to the corporate edification that is intended with public glossolalia. Consequently, glossolalia in private prayer does not include a public interpretation.
after she had prayed for the Holy Spirit to come and manifest in her, she began to speak quietly in tongues, quietly murmuring indistinguishable syllables to herself. What I noticed in that moment was a reflection of that which had been pressing upon me for the majority of that Sunday evening prayer service: the absolute, real presence of God to the believers in the room met with my attempts to observe as an outsider and instilled in me a profound sense of awkwardness—a deep discomfort in being caught between participant and observer in the religious phenomenon. My role as a scholar demanded objectivity and observatory distance, but my presence in the room—holding hands with a woman who prayed for us to be sent out as missionaries for God and seemed to be having a very personal experience with the spirit of God—seemed to demand something much more subjective and participatory.

Theological interpretations aside, this problem of presence in the room—both my own presence as an observer and the divine presence which believers seemed to be interacting with—was something I needed to address as I interpreted my other observations. This feeling of otherness was something I could choose to dismiss and ignore, or something I could address, analyze, and explain for its own sake. I have chosen the latter approach for its ability to provide a thicker description of the phenomenon, and for its confrontation and dialogue with some of the most pressing methodological issues in the study of religion.

**Theoretical Approach**

I am certainly not the first person to come to a point in a study where presence and subjectivity become unavoidable components of an honest, comprehensive report. Many scholars call attention to the nature and place of subjectivity and identity in religious studies, including Dipesh Chakrabarty, Karen McCarthy Brown, Saba Mahmood, and W.E.B. Dubois—all of whom have influenced my approach in this study. However, there are two other scholars of religion whose theories prove helpful in unpacking the elements of holiness, presence, and subjectivity that became apparent in my observations and interviews regarding glossolalia. These are Rudolf Otto and Robert Orsi. Their interpretations of religion offer helpful insights for analyzing my observations and encounters with glossolalia, including how to contextualize and explain the phenomena as a scholar while also providing validity and agency to the people and religion who were part of those experiences.

In his seminal work, *The Idea of the Holy*, Rudolf Otto explores how ratio-
nality and non-rationality constitute religion together in his understanding of the holy. The core of Otto’s theory of religion centers around the experience of what he calls numinous, a term he coins to refer to the effect of the numen (Latin for “divine”) on the human person, which he establishes as the core of all religions. Otto suggests that “all language, insofar as it consists of words, purports to convey ideas or concepts...And hence expositions of religious truth in language tend to stress the ‘rational’ attributes of God.” The implication of this, for Otto, is that non-rational experiences of the holy are outside the function and scope of language and are thus ineffable—an aspect of his theory which makes glossolalia a rather curious phenomenon. The numinous is the non-rational or supra-rational aspect of the holy—the majestic, terrifying, and fascinating Other—which is known only through experience and encounter with the numen.

In his essay “The Problem of the Holy,” Robert Orsi addresses Otto’s theory and, while criticizing Otto’s colonialism and attempt to cast religion in a category that renders it untouchable by other disciplines, suggests that Otto’s attempt to understand holiness as something truly real is admirable and necessary. Orsi believes this because of his argument that “the key category of the Holy is its realness.” This call to treat holiness as something real is echoed in his essay “When 2 + 2 = 5,” in which he attempts to make the case for “a radical empiricism of the visible and invisible real.” In this essay, Orsi posits that such an empiricism focuses on “abundant events,” which:

...are characterized by aspects of the human imagination that cannot be completely accounted for by social and cultural codes...[by the] uncanny awareness of something outside us and independent of us, yet still familiar to us. Abundant events are saturated by memory, desire, need, fear, terror, hope or denial, or some inchoate combination of these.

These “abundant events” require a different approach for scholars. He challenges scholars “to go beyond saying ‘this was real in her experience’ to de-

---

7 Ibid.
8 Ibid., 23.
12 Ibid.
scribe how the real…finds presence, existence, and power in space and time, how it becomes as real as guns and stones and bread, and then how the real in turn acts as an agent for itself in history.” Orsi’s challenge for scholars to confront the “really real” in religious studies by describing how the real finds presence in the world is bold and radical.

Yet it leaves scholars wanting for a stronger philosophical foundation to justify a theory that suggests a foreign approach to traditionally empirical study. However, when it is combined with Otto’s positions on the ineffable, numinous, and “otherness” aspects of religious experience, Orsi’s arguments are bolstered. While Otto might have gone too far in theologizing the theory of religion, and Orsi lacks the philosophical depth to justify his ideas about the necessity of encountering the “other” in religious studies, their respective ideas prove insightful when used in tandem.

Orsi’s challenge to confront the “really real” in religious studies is bold and radical, and it presents some philosophical difficulties for scholars who are not easily or readily resolved in Orsi’s work. For one, it requires that we first address what “realness” is, which is a discussion far too complicated for the scope of this paper, a discussion Orsi unfortunately avoids for the most part. But even more, it requires scholars to deal with the frustrating, confusing nature of encountering such data of abundance in order to come to a deeper understanding of what religion is and what it means. This is, as Orsi puts it, a “third way” of scholarship between total dismissal and complete embrace of religious worlds, which is dangerous, uncomfortable, and confusing, but is also “where the pleasure, excitement, and risk of religious studies are.”

Combined with the aspects of ineffable, numinous, and absolute “otherness” of religious experience according to Otto, Orsi’s theory gains philosophical backing it previously lacked. While Otto might have gone too far in theologizing his theory of religion, and Orsi’s approach lacks the philosophical depth to justify his ideas about the necessity of encountering the “other” in religious studies, their respective ideas prove insightful when used in tandem. These two theories proved invaluable in my interpretation of observations and interviews conducted with AG members regarding glossolalia, and their ability to explain both the ways in which glossolalia functioned as an observable phenomenon and as an abundant event is incredibly helpful in discussing the study’s findings.

14 Orsi, Introduction to The Madonna of 115th Street (New Haven, Yale University Press, 2010), xx. It could be argued that Orsi’s understanding of the “really real” seems far closer to a dismissal than to acceptance, but his methodology remains inspiring.
INTERVIEWS

My methodology in interviewing participants was to ask questions pertaining to their experience of glossolalia and its relation to their broader faith, letting interviewees direct the conversation as much as possible. I stated clearly to each interviewee that they were not required to answer any of my questions, and I attempted to phrase questions in a conversational style as much as possible. If interviewees had questions for me, I answered them honestly, but I did not attempt to bring my personal experience into interviews any more than necessary. The purpose of this was to observe and encounter interviewees in the fullness of their answers and stories, letting them frame the discussion of their faith rather than prescribing the course of the conversation. Accordingly, not every question was phrased the same way in every interview, and more attention was paid to addressing each category of questions than asking each individual question verbatim.

Interviews focused on two central points. First, I asked interviewees to describe their experience of glossolalia in its subjective aspects; then, I sought to understand how interviewees understood glossolalia as a function or representation of their understanding of faith and their conception of God. In my inquiry on their conception of God in relation to glossolalia, I also included questions about the relationship between experience and reason in the faith and practice of those whom I interviewed, as many of the interviews transitioned to the subject naturally.

The responses I recorded were varied in their philosophical and theological approaches, and, to my surprise, interviewees generally spent far less time describing the experience of glossolalia itself than they did explaining to me how that experience works within their faith. Nevertheless, there were some common themes present in the responses of those I interviewed.

Interviewees repeatedly spoke of the encounter, manifestation, and immanence of God that becomes apparent to them in glossolalia. This is not surprising, as the AG views speaking in tongues as the “initial physical evidence of the baptism of the Holy Spirit.” Darrin Rodgers, the head of the Flower Pentecostal Heritage Center, located at the national headquarters, described tongues as an aspect of the “deep spirituality at the heart of Pentecostalism”

16 “Reason” was not clearly defined in each interview, and each interviewee brought their own understanding of the term to the discussion of experience versus reason in Christian faith. However, reason was generally regarded as a sort of academic or cognitive approach to understanding events—a quantifiable, objective approach to issues of faith rather than a personal, subjective approach.

17 Questions used for interviews can be found in the Appendix.

18 Assemblies of God. “Statement of Fundamental Truths,” Assemblies of God (USA) official website
which serves as a sign that “God is immanent, not far off.”\textsuperscript{19} He then talked about glossolalia being a way for God to cut through the self-confidence people have in speech and return to a simpler form of communication with God. This idea of tongues being a manifestation of God’s immanence also surfaced in my interview with Dr. Martin Mittelstadt, a professor at the AG Theological Seminary. Mittelstadt said that the idea that God invades the present is what Pentecostalism resurrects in Christianity, and in tongues we find one of the ways to encounter God in the here and now. Mittelstadt talked about the nature of tongues being fluid and improvised, and in the course of our conversation even explicitly said that the experience of glossolalia cannot be reduced to words. Glossolalia, for Mittelstadt, is “the performance of relation. It’s lived.”\textsuperscript{20}

A similar notion was offered by a young adult ministry leader in a local AG church. He stated:

I tend to look at things very analytically. I try to explain things as objectively as possible, and there’s—as you know—a lot in the Christian faith that you can do that with, right? Whenever you get into interpersonal dynamics and relationships that exist between—not just two persons, but two minds—you’ve completely crossed over out of the physical, observable, empirical spectrum, and you have to rely on these subjective experiences. What confirms the reality of another person is partly what we observe of them, but it’s also—once we get into their personality, it’s what we’re experiencing. So, praying in tongues, speaking in tongues opens up this other dimension of my faith to make it an interpersonal reality in which I’m the person that I know and I’m aware of, and God is the person—the ultimate subject—that I’m relating to. And speaking in tongues is a very intimately subjective experience of him as that other reality. And so in many ways it affirms and confirms my faith; it’s an evidence to myself that the things I believe and profess are true; it’s an experience that I don’t believe has its source in me, even though it occurs through me. Because of seeing that reality that is both outside myself yet within myself, it exists as that confirmation that this is real. So it’s further evidence for the reality of Jesus living in me—however that mystery plays out…It’s God as subject that we are relating to. And he reveals himself—aspects of who he is, his character, and his nature—but we can never relate to him as though he were the object

\textsuperscript{19} Darrin Rodgers, interview by the author, November 27, 2017.

\textsuperscript{20} Dr. Martin Mittelstadt, interview by the author, November 20, 2017.
that we can gain mastery of by having a comprehensive knowledge of who he is.\footnote{A young adult ministry leader at a Springfield, MO AG church, interview by the author, November 21, 2017.}

The aspects of immanence and ineffability found in my interviews with Rodgers, Mittelstadt, and the young adult ministry leader are incredibly important to an adequate understanding of glossolalia, especially considering Otto’s and Orsi’s theories. Otto’s description of the ineffable nature of encounters with the wholly-other numinous can clearly be seen in Mittelstadt’s description of tongues, as can Orsi’s idea of abundant events as moments of encounter with the something “really real” and outside the subject. Orsi’s understanding of abundant events is perfectly instantiated in the young adult ministry leader’s words, as the minister speaks of the real presence of God as a relatable person in the experience of glossolalia. The theme of relationship between God and the performer of glossolalia is essential to their perception of the phenomenon, and its full weight is best captured through a radical empiricism such as Orsi’s. This is not to say that either theorist proves the theological or philosophical truth of glossolalia, but the theories work together to provide a context that allows for real presence as an element of study to be encountered, rather than dismissed, and even describes what that encounter might be like.

Another important aspect of glossolalia I found in my interviews—empowerment—was mentioned explicitly by many interviewees as a key component of glossolalia. This aspect of glossolalia came to prominence in an interview with a congregational member at Central, in which she told a story of feeling empowered by her morning glossolalic prayer to care for a student struggling with sexual abuse. She was unsure she would have handled the situation well if she had not experienced the empowerment from the Holy Spirit that she had felt in her morning glossolalic prayer. Though certain aspects of Otto’s theory, such as the numinous experience as the source of moral rationalization and the numinous as a source energy and urgency,\footnote{Otto, \textit{The Idea of the Holy}.} could aid in understanding this aspect of glossolalia, I believe Orsi’s theory is better equipped for the task. Though Orsi doesn’t attempt to suggest a philosophical precedent for the validity of empowerment in glossolalic experience, he does provide a methodological outlook based on such data. The experience of divine peace and empowerment the interviewees referenced is exactly the type of condition to which Orsi’s methodology of “radical empiricism” and abundant event appeals.
The last aspect of glossolalia that interviewees seemed to agree upon was the belief that glossolalic experiences were not all-authoritative or essential to salvation. Pastors, theologians, and congregational members alike stressed the importance of balance between the message conveyed through the interpretation of glossolalia and the authority of the Bible and the Holy Spirit through the church community. In contrast to the early Pentecostal emphasis on glossolalia as a priority akin to salvation itself, each interviewee stressed the importance of the Bible as an authoritative metric for messages interpreted from glossolalia. With this perspective on the hierarchy of authority within spirit-inspired messages, interviewees showed a confidence in rational thought and objective reasoning that demonstrated the way in which the contemporary AG tends to be “dressed in the rationalism of contemporary American society.”

This tendency toward rational thought was one of the most interesting aspects of the study, and questions about the balance of rational and experiential components in charismatic faith often came up naturally in interviews. The interviewees’ responses to these questions turned out to be crucial to my understanding of glossolalia and AG faith on the whole.

In my interview with Central Assembly’s lead pastor, Dr. Jim Bradford—who holds a PhD in Aeronautical Engineering, suggesting no lack of familiarity with rational thinking—Dr. Bradford stressed that the mystical aspects of his faith, one of which is glossolalia, are not contradictory to the rational aspects, but rather come together to form his faith. In response to a question about experiential versus cognitive aspects of his faith, Dr. Bradford said the following:

I think in our Western culture, we’ve built an artificial barrier between the cognitive and the mystical that a lot of other non-Western cultures don’t have the trouble with. Scripture was written, Jesus ministered, the early church apostles ministered in a very non-Western culture. So, I’m trying to get back to there being no dissonance between the cognitive and the mystical. One doesn’t necessarily eliminate the other.

Similar responses were given by church members I interviewed, as interviewees explained how their intellectual inquiries in faith (i.e. “reason”) were not opposed to their experience of God in glossolalia. Each interviewee seemed to

---

have a slightly different perspective from the next in regard to the authority of reason over experience, but nearly every interviewee was decided on the conflict between the two being resolvable, or at least not worrisome.

In many ways, these responses reflect the core of Otto’s theory, seeking to unite the rational and non-rational elements of religion, even if their approaches to this shared goal may not align with Otto’s theory in its entirety. As for Orsi’s interpretation of this balance between rationality and mystical notions in faith, his thought that religion is complex and deserving of a more abundant empiricism is incredibly important here. Orsi’s theory welcomes the dialogue between rationality and experience that the interviewees took part in, and this approach proves invaluable for understanding how glossolalia functions in the minds and faiths of those I interviewed.

Finally, there was one other aspect of my interviews that stood out and was not anticipated or prompted by my questions. Nearly every person I interviewed wanted to know my faith background. Many times, they asked after the interview concluded, but some also wanted to know before speaking on record. In some cases, I was questioned rather thoroughly before the interview began, and though I provided honest answers about my background, I couldn’t help but wonder why it was important. Otto’s and Orsi’s theories, however, elucidate this unexpected element.

Both Otto and Orsi direct scholars to acknowledge, in some way, the presence of their own subjectivity in their study. They do so by calling scholarship to address “otherness”—whether in the encounter with the ultimate “Other” in the holy (a la Otto) or simply in the differentiation between scholar and subject (a la Orsi). For Otto, the effect of this acknowledgment is the establishment of an epistemological distinction that allows for an experience of the wholly-other, non-rational numen, while for Orsi, it is the suspension of disbelief and distinction of identity in the encounter with the holy (whatever that means) that allows for understanding only found in a “third way” methodology. In each case, they call scholarship to address its own presuppositions and prejudices before proceeding to encounter (or in many cases, dismiss) a religious phenomenon.

**Conclusion**

I found in my encounter with glossolalia in the AG not only the elements of numinous experience and abundant events purported in the theories of Otto and Orsi, but also a deeper question suggested by both these theorists of religion and the parishioners I interviewed. It is a question of being and
thinking in the world which reaches to the methodological core of religious studies and manifests on the tongues of believers as they encounter, in fullness, the immanence, power, and presence of their God in a moment of cognitive surrender. Glossolalia brings about a suspended moment of encounter with the holy which demands a response from the scholar and the speaker alike. Will she encounter or observe? Explain or experience? Objectify or familiarize? Speak or interpret? These questions are, after all, questions of “otherness,” agency, and authority that press on the scholar with the same sort of uneasiness and urgency mentioned by many of the interviewees during their experience with glossolalia. These questions are not intended to call the scholar to theologize, as Otto does, but to encounter religion as it is, as Orsi suggests, and to become comfortable with a dialogue between the rational and the non-rational in religion, rather than prescript its study to distanced observation influenced by modernist epistemology. While there are certainly times for analysis and explanation to dominate religious studies, my study of glossolalia revealed the complexities of such efforts, and it highlighted the ways in which distanced observation and objective analysis can fail to capture the fullness of a religious phenomenon that seeks to encounter the other.

The task of becoming comfortable with a dialogue between rational and non-rational in religious experience is undoubtedly difficult, but it is important for scholars to address. The pastors, theologians, and church members I interviewed are forced to confront their own “otherness” and subjectivity daily as they find themselves caught between heaven and earth, experience and rationality, scholar and saint, acutely aware of the ways in which their own subjectivity ebbs and flows in the presence of both God and scholar. What they seem to understand—and what both Otto and Orsi suggest scholars confront—is the complexity, uncertainty, and fluidity of knowledge and experience that comes as a necessary consequence of encountering lived religion. As I learned in my encounter with glossolalia, such an approach to scholarly religious studies is not comfortable and it is not clearly defined, but it is important.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


———. “When 2 + 2 = 5: Can we begin to think about unexplained religious experiences in ways that acknowledge their existence?” *The American Scholar* 76, no. 2 (2007): 34–43.


Poloma, Margaret. “Charisma and Structure in the Assemblies of God: Revis-


APPENDIX

Historical Context
1. Tell me about your experience in the Assemblies of God—where did you start in relation to AG and how did you come to be where you are now?
2. What would you consider essential to the Assemblies of God faith?
3. What things are unique, though maybe not essential about the Assemblies of God?

Personal Experience with Glossolalia
1. Have you ever spoken in or interpreted tongues?
2. If so, tell me a little about what it was like: how did it feel before, during, and after?
3. How did your experience speaking in tongues (or merely observing it) relate to and/or effect your personal faith?

Glossolalia’s Function in the Faith Community
1. How does speaking in tongues function in relation to the church as a body of believers?
2. Would you consider speaking in tongues to be primarily for the benefit of the individual or of the church community?

Glossolalia and Conception of God
1. How does the practice of speaking in tongues inform your understanding of God?
2. To what extent are the interpretations of tongues considered the word of God?

Experience vs. Reason
1. What role does experience play in your faith as contrasted with reasoning/rational inquiry?
2. What role does that same contrast between rational inquiry and subjective experience play in the act of speaking in tongues?
3. Do you think that the phenomenon of speaking in tongues is something that can be adequately understood from an outside perspective?
4. What are your thoughts on attempts to explain speaking in tongues in terms of psychology or sociology?
Dr. Erin Buchanan is an Associate Professor of Quantitative Psychology in Missouri State University’s Department of Psychology. She specializes in the psychology of language and applied statistics. Her work is focused on understanding how language is represented in memory and how new, easier statistics can be applied to research as a whole.

Patricia Busch is a senior Political Science major with minors in International Relations and Child and Family Development. She plans to attend graduate school to pursue a Master’s degree in International Affairs. She hopes to work internationally, advocating for maternal and child health care and environmental sustainability.

Brendan Diedrich is a fifth year senior at Missouri State majoring in History with an emphasis on China, currently studying Mandarin at Qingdao University for the Fall 2018 semester. His interests include Chinese poetry, political moments, and policies of the Communist Party of China.

Kylee Farnum, as of Spring 2018, has earned a Bachelors of Science in Nursing with honors. She has recently accepted her first post-graduate position in the Emergency Room at Cox South Hospital. She hopes to return to school to pursue a Doctorate of Nursing Practice degree and practice as a Critical Care Nurse Practitioner.
Flora-Jean Forbes is a graduate of Missouri State University’s Psychology Department. Her interests involve the German language, student academic success, and mental health advocacy on college campuses. She is currently employed as an Academic Advisor at Cox College and desires to continue advocating for student success throughout her professional career.

Lindsey Johnson is a senior Art Education major. After graduating, she plans to remain in the Ozarks to pursue her career as an art teacher. Her artistic work consists primarily of sculpture and mixed-media painting, though she loves exploring and trying new media. She hopes to use her art to inspire future generations of artists.

Emily Joshu graduated with honors in May 2018 and earned two degrees in Creative Writing and Professional Writing. She is currently pursuing her masters degree in Publishing: Digital and Print Media at New York University, and hopes to work in the editorial department in either book or magazine publishing.

Eva Klein is currently a graduate student at Università Bocconi in Milan, Italy. She earned her bachelor’s in psychology, her passion, and minored in sustainability at Missouri State University, which inspired her to switch academic tracks. She aspires to live in Italy, working in the public sector in hopes of creating more sustainable food systems.
Raven Kohlenberger recently graduated Missouri State University with a Bachelor of Fine Arts in Photography and a minor in Art History. She is looking to pursue a Bachelor of Arts in Art History and a Master of Fine Arts in Photography. As a biracial woman, her work focuses on multiracial identity for those she photographs and for her own exploration.

Maria Rosaria Meluso is a senior Professional Writing major minoring in Screenwriting. She plans to attend graduate school to pursue her Master of Arts degree in Professional Writing and a Graduate Certificate in Screenwriting. She is a member of the Honor Society of Phi Kappa Phi and the current Chief Editor of LOGOS. She hopes to write for television and film professionally.

Kyle Osredker is a senior double majoring in creative writing and professional writing. He intends to attend graduate school at Missouri State University to pursue an accelerated Master of Arts degree in Technical and Professional Writing. His literary interests include magical realism, fabulism, and speculative fiction.

Noah Standish is a senior majoring in English and Secondary Education. He plans to pursue a career in education and attend graduate school for literature or teaching. His literary interests include postmodernism, metafiction, horror, and historical activism. He hopes to someday write a novel and teach at the university level.
Macy Stevens is a senior Art and Design major emphasizing in Photography with a minor in Art History. After graduation, she plans to continue producing fine art, attend grad school, and open a contemporary art gallery and studio where artists can explore their craft.

Johanna Typaldos is a Metals and Jewelry major and has studied under the well-known enamellist Sarah Perkins. She plans to attend graduate school to pursue a Master of Fine Arts degree in Metals and Jewelry following her upcoming graduation. Her interests include nature and familial ties. She hopes to be an accomplished artist one day.

Shelby Walters graduated with her Bachelor of Fine Arts in December of 2017. She plans to continue photographing with Champion Athletes of the Ozarks, where she can continue to express herself through art. She hopes to continue to work with organizations that support people with disabilities.

John Willis is a senior Religious Studies major minoring in Computer Science. His interests are broad, including epistemology, nonprofit strategy, and artificial intelligence, and he hopes to work in the nonprofit sector following the completion of his graduate education in Divinity and Public Policy.
Kimberly Woodman was a senior communication and Spanish major at Missouri State University at the time of writing this essay. She currently attends MSU as a graduate student, and is pursuing a Master of Applied Second Language Acquisition. She hopes to one day teach Spanish.
Want to submit to LOGOS? Visit missouristate.edu/logos for submission guidelines and instructions.

The generosity of the Honors College community enables our students to present original scholarship at national research conferences, to participate in study away programs, and to produce and publish LOGOS: A Journal of Undergraduate Research. Your contributions support our continuing efforts to provide the undergraduate students of Missouri with the outstanding academic and developmental opportunities that are hallmarks of an honors education. Visit www.missouristate.edu/honors to learn how your tax-deductible donation can directly support Honors College students.

Connect with us on social media and keep up-to-date on all LOGOS news!